

# CITY OF LONG BEACH

DEPARTMENT OF DEVELOPMENT SERVICES

333 West Ocean Boulevard, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor • Long Beach, CA 90801 • (562) 570-6194 • Fax (562) 570-6068

February 13, 2017

CHAIR AND CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSIONERS City of Long Beach California

#### RECOMMENDATION:

Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness request to allow construction of a 644-square-foot addition to the rear of an existing single-family dwelling, remove 13-square-feet from the existing single-car garage and construct a 90-square-foot accessory structure attached to the rear of the garage located at 3815 Wilton Street. The property is a contributing structure within the Wilton Street Historic District. (District 4)

APPLICANT:

Garrett and Caroline Shook

3815 Wilton Street Long Beach, CA 90804 (Application No. HP16-632)

#### THE REQUEST

The applicant requests approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow construction of a 644-square-foot addition to the rear of an existing single-family dwelling, remove 13-square feet from the existing single-car garage and construct a 90-square-foot accessory structure attached to the rear of the garage located at 3815 Wilton Street. The residential district is significant for its intact representation of early development in the Spanish Colonial Revival style. The building is a contributing structure within the Wilton Street Historic District.

## <u>BACKGROUND</u>

The subject property is located on the north side of Wilton Street between Grand Avenue to the west and Termino Avenue to the east (Exhibit A – Location Map). The site is located within the R-2-N zone (Two-Family Residential District) and is developed with an 888-square-foot one-story, single-family residence and an existing 256-square-foot single-car garage. The residence and garage were constructed in 1924 according to city records, and the residence is a contributing structure within the Wilton Street Historic District.

The residence and garage are designed in a Spanish Colonial Revival architectural style. The residence has a flat roof with clay tile coping, a projecting rectangular porch

CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION February 13, 2017 Page 2 of 10

set in the middle of a flat façade with a wing wall on the west side. The porch roof is a low gable pitch with roof tiles and corner tower projections echoing those on the house. The porch is open at the sides with three openings containing flattened arches with an open patio on the east side. The residence has stucco siding and two sets of vinyl windows located on either side of the front entrance. The existing one-car stucco garage is located in the rear portion of the property. A wing wall on the east side of the house connects the residence and garage. The garage structure has a flat roofline stepped up at the corners (Exhibit B – Plans & Photographs).

## **ANALYSIS**

The proposed project requires approval of the Cultural Heritage Commission because the size of the living area addition exceeds 250-square-feet. In order to be granted approval, the project must comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and meet the criteria for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

The new 644-square-foot one-story addition will be attached to the rear of the building. The addition will consist of an expansion to the kitchen, new master bedroom and walkin closet, new master bathroom, new laundry area, and new family room/den. The proposed side yard setback is 5 feet with a rear yard setback of 39-feet 9-inches. The subject parcel slopes up over 4.25-feet from the sidewalk (95.50') to the rear of the property (99.75'). The height of the addition will be 15-feet 8-inches from top of curb. This will be 1-foot higher than the existing structure due to the addition's 9-foot ceiling height. Staff recommends that the height of the new parapet roof line up with the existing structure in order to reduce the visibility of the addition from the public right-of-way. The project will continue to utilize the existing one-car garage and driveway as part of the City's off-street parking regulations. The addition will be in full compliance with the City's residential development standards and Zoning regulations applicable for this property.

Evaluating the scale of the addition to the existing residence, the proposed floor area addition will maintain compatible scale with the original structure by remaining one-story. The existing shed roof located at the rear of the building will be removed and replaced with a flat roof. Overall, the addition will also remain in character with the neighborhood scale and context of the block as the properties within the immediate area consist of both one-story and two-story structures.

A new walkway with a retaining wall in the front yard is proposed along the west property line to provide access from the side yard to the street. Staff recommends that no concrete to be used, but a landscaping solution to be determined in consultation with staff has been included as a condition of approval.

In order to integrate the proposed addition with the existing residence's Spanish Colonial Revival architectural style, several architectural features are incorporated including continuing the flat roof with clay tile coping along the roofline, stucco siding, and wood windows. The materials for the proposed addition will be compatible for the style and materials found in the Wilton Street Historic District.

CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION February 13, 2017 Page 3 of 10

The existing residence has fourteen non-period windows. The two windows located at the front of the residence will be replaced with wood double-hung windows. The three non-period windows on the north elevation will be replaced with period windows as part of the addition. There are five windows on the existing west elevation, three non-period vinyl and two wood windows. The three non-period windows will be replaced with wood. The six non-period windows located on the east elevation abutting the driveway will remain. The City issued permits for these non-period windows in 1997.

The existing garage is detached from the residence, but an existing wing wall connects the garage to the residence. The 13-square-feet proposed to be removed from the southwest corner of the structure is to enhance access to the courtyard area, and will not impact the existing wing wall. The existing side door to the garage will be relocated to the northwest corner. This will not impact the use of the garage for purposes of parking. The 13-square-foot area (2-feet, 6-inches by 5-feet, 2-inches) to be removed is located behind the dwelling and is not visible from the public right-of-way. The existing non-period window on the garage will be replaced with a double-hung wood window.

The property has an existing detached wooden shed located in the rear half of the property that is proposed to be demolished. The 135-square-foot shed structure is not a contributing structure to the historic district, nor is it designed in a style consistent with the Spanish Colonial Revival style. A new 90-square-foot accessory structure is proposed to replace the existing shed structure. The new structure will be attached to the rear of the existing garage and be designed in the Spanish Colonial Revival style. Features will include a flat roof, wood window with a tile awning and wood door. The interior height of the new accessory building is 8-feet, 1-inch, which will be 1-foot above the existing garage roofline due to the elevation change. The existing garage has a finished floor level that is 1-foot below the proposed grade of the accessory structure. This will cause the roofline of the accessory building to be visible above the garage. Staff recommends that the roofline of the accessory structure be a flat roof with a parapet in line with the existing garage to minimize visual impact of the addition.

The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 9 states the new addition will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. There are no alterations proposed to the character-defining Furthermore, Standard No. 9 states that it's features on the existing residence. important that the new addition be visually distinguished from the historic building. The addition should not give a false sense of the property's historical development. The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 9 states that "new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features..." The beginning of new residential addition is recessed from the original structure on the west elevation, which will distinguish the new construction. The addition incorporates tile awnings to the north elevation of the accessory shed structure and the master bedroom window. The east elevation of the addition will also include a tile awning over the French doors leading to the master bedroom and a wood trellis over the French door to the family room/den. A courtyard deck surface is proposed between the addition and the existing garage utilizing

CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION February 13, 2017 Page 4 of 10

synthetic wood material. The one-story addition will also maintain a reasonable scale in size and mass in the context of the neighborhood which consists of both one and two-story structures. Lastly, the addition will incorporate consistent materials and elements compatible with the Spanish Colonial Revival style, which is the predominant style of the district.

## RECOMMENDATION

Staff has analyzed the proposed project and has determined that the project meets the requirements set forth in Title 21 of the City's Zoning Code, Section 2.63.070 (Cultural Heritage Commission) of the Long Beach Municipal Code, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings and the California Heights Historic District Ordinance. With conditions, including the requirement to maintain a single roof line for the residence, and a single roof line for the garage and accessory structure, Staff supports approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness for the 644-square-foot, one-story addition to the residence, the removal of 13-square feet from the existing single-car garage, and construction of a 90-square-foot accessory structure. All the findings can be made in the affirmative for the proposed improvements, as these improvements are compatible in overall scale, massing, proportions, materials and colors to the architectural style of the existing structure on the property and in the context of the District. Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness subject to the conditions of approval (Exhibit C – Findings and Conditions of Approval).

# **PUBLIC HEARING NOTICE**

Public notices were distributed on January 25, 2017 and a notice was mailed to the Wilton Street Historic District. As of this date, one phone call has been received regarding this project.

#### **ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW**

In accordance with Section 15301(e), Guidelines for Implementation of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), environmental review is not required for construction of small additions to single-family residences.

CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION February 13, 2017 Page 5 of 10

Respectfully submitted,

CARRIE TAI, AICP

**CURRENT PLANNING OFFICER** 

Sunda J. Jahum for

LINDA F.TATUM, AICP

Sinda F. Jahren

PLANNING BUREAU MANAGER

LFT:CK:AG

Attachments:

Exhibit A - Location Map

Exhibit B – Plans & Photographs

Exhibit C - Findings & Conditions of Approval