

**CITY OF LONG BEACH  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 17, 2016  
333 W. OCEAN BLVD., 7TH FLOOR  
CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ROOM, 8:00 AM**

Robin Perry, President  
Rick McGilton-McGlamery, Vice President



Phyllis Arias, Commissioner  
Charles Hicks Jr., Commissioner  
Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Commissioner

Kandice Taylor-Sherwood,  
Executive Director

---

**FINISHED AGENDA & DRAFT MINUTES**

**ROLL CALL**

**Commissioners** Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Rick  
**Present:** McGilton-McGlamery and Robin Perry

**Commissioners** Phyllis Arias  
**Absent:**

Crystal Slaten, Acting Secretary, Recruitment & Selection Officer  
Caprice McDonald, Special Projects Officer  
Marilyn Hall, Executive Assistant  
Gary Anderson, Principal Deputy City Attorney  
Lourdes Ferrer, Administrative Analyst  
Debbie McCluster, Personnel Analyst  
Donna de Araujo, Personnel Analyst  
Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst  
Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst  
Cynthia Stafford, Deputy Director, Human Resources  
Stacey Lewis, Assistant Director of Human Resources, Harbor

**FLAG SALUTE**

1. 16-023CS      **Recommendation to approve minutes:**  
*Regular Meeting of February 3, 2016*

**A motion was made by Hicks, seconded by Smith Watts, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Rick McGilton-McGlamery and Robin Perry

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis Arias

**CONSENT CALENDAR (2-6):**

Passed the Consent Calendar

**A motion was made by Smith Watts, seconded by Vice President McGilton-McGlamery, to approve Consent Calendar Items. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Rick McGilton-McGlamery and Robin Perry

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis Arias

2. 16-024CS      **Recommendation to approve examination results:**  
*Police Recruit - (NTN) (Established 1/27/16) AMENDED -  
883 Applied, 259 Qualified*  
*Public Safety Dispatcher - Lateral (Established 2/9/16) -  
157 Applied, 1 Qualified*  
*Senior Electrical Inspector (Established 2/9/16)-  
14 Applied, 3 Qualified*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

3. 16-025CS

**Recommendation to receive and file bulletins:**

*Garage Service Attendant*  
*Public Health Nurse*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

4. 16-026CS

**Recommendation to receive and file retirements:**

*Robert Wright/Harbor Maintenance Mechanic II/Harbor*  
*(28 yrs., 1 mo.)*  
*Shirley Phillips/General Librarian/Library (22 yrs., 1 mo.)*  
*Gayle Rutten/Administrative Analyst II/Public Works*  
*(25 yrs., 8 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

5. 16-027CS

**Recommendation to receive and file resignations:**

*Christina Chai/Public Health Nutritionist II/Health (2 yrs., 11 mos.)*  
*Eddie Enriquez/Assistant Administrative Analyst II/Harbor*  
*(1 yr., 6 mos.)*  
*Brian Flores/Public Safety Dispatcher II/Police (11 yrs., 3 mos.)*  
*Shaun Lewis/Refuse Operator I/Public Works (6 yrs., 7 mos.)*  
*Anthony Pacileo/Special Services Officer III/Harbor (4 yrs., 5 mos.)*  
*Fredrick Sweezer/Plumber/Water (7 yrs., 26 days)*  
*Youteang Teav/Accounting Technician/Public Works*  
*(1 yr., 10 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

6. 16-028CS

**Recommendation to receive and file withdrawal of appeals:**

*Suspension Appeal 13-S-1415*  
*Suspension/Reduction Appeal 02-R/S-1516*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

**REGULAR AGENDA**

7. 16-029CS

**RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY**

**PERIOD** - Ferdinando Guerra, Port Planner

*Communication from Margaret Huebner, Director of Human Resources, Harbor*

The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding this request.

Stacy Lewis, Assistant Director of Human Resources, Harbor Department, and Matthew Plezia Manger of Master Planning, Harbor Department were present and answered questions from the Commission.

**A motion was made by Hicks, seconded by Smith Watts, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Rick McGilton-McGlamery and Robin Perry

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis Arias

8. 16-030CS

**RECOMMENDATION TO TRANSFER FROM UNCLASSIFIED TO CLASSIFIED SERVICE** - Nicholas Cervoia, Ambulance Operator -

Non Career to Ambulance Operator

*Communication from Michael A. DuRee, Fire Chief*

The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding this request.

**A motion was made by Hicks, seconded by Vice President McGilton-McGlamery, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Rick McGilton-McGlamery and Robin Perry

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis Arias



9. 16-031CS

**RECOMMENDATION TO ADOPT NEW CLASSIFICATION AND  
NEW CLASSIFICATION SPECIFICATION** *Contract Compliance  
Analyst*

- a. Communication from Margaret Huebner, Director of Human Resources, Harbor
- b. Staff report prepared by Donna de Araujo, Personnel Analyst

The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding this request.

**A motion was made by Smith Watts, seconded by Hicks, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Rick McGilton-McGlamery and Robin Perry

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis Arias

10. 16-032CS

**PETITION TO FILE LATE APPEAL**  
*Communication from Randy Petersen*

Mr. Petersen was present and briefed the Commission regarding his petition to file a late appeal in the matter of the denial of his disability retirement from the City.

Cynthia Stafford, Deputy Director, Human Resources, was present and addressed the Commission regarding the denial of Mr. Petersen's disability retirement, stating that the City is opposed to allowing Mr. Petersen to appeal this matter. She stated that it is her understanding that there was no follow-up regarding the status of the appeal from Mr. Peterson for four years.

Anne Lattime, Principal Deputy City Attorney, Workers' Compensation, was present and addressed the Commission regarding Mr. Petersen's Workers' Compensation claim. She stated that she believes that Mr. Petersen was represented by an attorney for his Workers' Compensation case, but does not believe he retained any representation for the disability retirement matter, which is the subject of this appeal.

**A motion was made by Hicks, seconded by Vice President McGilton-McGlamery, to approve Mr. Petersen's petition for late appeal. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 2 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts and Robin Perry

**No:** 2 - Charles Hicks and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis Arias

**NEW BUSINESS**

**MANAGERS' REPORT**

**Recruitment & Selection**

**Special Projects**

**Administration Support Services**

**Executive Director**

Ms. Slaten informed the Commission that staff is still busy with examinations. She also stated that a calendar of upcoming recruitment events has been updated and sent to department Administrative Officers, allowing them an opportunity to participate if they are recruiting for positions.

President Perry acknowledged the excellent work Commissioner Smith Watts is doing exhibiting the Breaking through Lighting the Way events and Kandice Taylor-Sherwood for her participation. He stated that he would like to see Civil Service participate whenever there are City events by having information regarding current City opportunities available to the community.

Ms. McDonald informed the Commission that she assisted Stacey Lewis, Assistant Director of Human Resources, Harbor Department, with the open house for the Summer School Interns. She also stated that she and Ms. Taylor-sherwood met with the Project Director for an organization called KRA, whose focus is on developing workers. The individuals may be youth, or individuals who are between college, or those who did not choose to go to college. She stated that it's a grant funded program and will not cost Civil Service to participate.

Stacey Lewis, Assistant Director of Human Resources, Harbor Department briefed the Commission regarding the Summer School Interns program, which is currently open to students 10-12 grade. She stated that the Harbor Department hosted an open house to educate parents regarding the process. She stated that they will hire about 28 students for these positions.

**COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission's jurisdiction.**

## **BRIEFING ON BACKGROUND INVESTIGATION PROCESS**

Commander Alex Avila briefed the Commission regarding the Police Department's background investigation process in selecting police department employees, sworn and non-sworn, for positions in the Police Department. He stated that applicants references, drug history, financial history, legal history, driving record, criminal history, validation of educational certificate, and social media sites are checked by the Background Assessment Officers during this process.

## **EXECUTIVE SESSION – Executive Director's Performance Evaluation (Pursuant to Paragraph (b)(1) of Section 54957 of the California Government Code)**

It was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts and carried to recess to a Closed Session, Pursuant to Paragraph (b)(1) of Section 54957 of the California Government Code. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts and carried to reconvene the regular meeting. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

President Perry announced that this item be placed on the March 16, 2016, Commission agenda for consideration.

## **ADJOURMENT**

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឱ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរៀបរៀង និងកំណត់ហេតុឱ្យ អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ ការិយាល័យស្មើនក្នុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។

**CITY OF LONG BEACH  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, MARCH 2, 2016  
333 W. OCEAN BLVD. 7TH FLOOR  
CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ROOM, 8:00 AM**

Robin Perry, President  
Rick McGilton-McGlamery, Vice President



Phyllis Arias, Commissioner  
Charles Hicks Jr., Commissioner  
Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Commissioner

Kandice Taylor-Sherwood,  
Executive Director

---

**FINISHED AGENDA & DRAFT MINUTES**

**ROLL CALL**

**Commissioners** Charles Hicks, Robin Perry and Phyllis Arias

**Present:**

**Commissioners** Carolyn M. Smith Watts and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

**Absent:**

Kandice Taylor-Sherwood, Executive Director & Secretary  
Robert Pfingsthorn, Administrative Officer  
Caprice McDonald, Special Projects Officer  
Marilyn Hall, Executive Assistant  
Gary Anderson, Principal Deputy City Attorney  
Lourdes Ferrer, Administrative Analyst  
Debbie McCluster, Personnel Analyst  
Donna de Araujo, Personnel Analyst  
Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst  
Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst  
Tara Houghton, Personnel Analyst, Human Resources  
Stacey Lewis, Assistant Director of Human Resources, Harbor

**FLAG SALUTE**

1. 16-033CS      **Recommendation to approve minutes:**  
*Regular Meeting of February 17, 2016*

This item was held due to lack of a quorum present from the February 17, 2016, meeting to take action.

**This CS-Agenda Item was held.**

**CONSENT CALENDAR (2-6):**

Passed the Consent Calendar

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Hicks, to approve Consent Calendar Items. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Charles Hicks, Robin Perry and Phyllis Arias

**Absent:** 2 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

2. 16-034CS      **Recommendation to approve examination results:**  
*Fingerprint Classifier (Established 2/16/16) - 115 Applied, 17 Qualified*  
*Transportation Programs Planner (Established 2/26/16) - 122 Applied, 29 Qualified*  
*Water Utility Mechanic (Established 2/26/16) - 40 Applied, 14 Qualified*

3. 16-035CS      **Recommendation to receive and file bulletins:**  
*Refuse Field Investigator*  
*Water Utility Supervisor*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

4. 16-036CS

**Recommendation to receive and file resignations:**

*John Coltharp/Gardener II/Parks (1 yr., 7 mos.)*

*Mariah Orantes/Public Safety Dispatcher II/Police (1 yr., 3 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

5. 16-037CS

**Recommendation to approve transfer:**

*Allison Bright/Assistant Administrative Analyst II/Long Beach Gas & Oil to Assistant Administrative II/Disaster Preparedness and Emergency Communications*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

6. 16-038CS

**Recommendation to receive and file withdrawal of appeal:**

Reduction Appeal 10-R-1415

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

**REGULAR AGENDA**

7. 16-039CS

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE EXTENSION OF EXPIRING  
ELIGIBLE LISTS (6 months)**

*Staff report prepared by Kandice Taylor-Sherwood, Executive  
Director*

Business Systems Specialist (3 months)  
Commercial Diver  
Department Librarian  
General Librarian  
General Maintenance Assistant  
Maintenance Assistant  
Public Safety Dispatcher  
Public Safety Dispatcher - Lateral  
Registered Nurse  
Senior Civil Engineer  
Senior Equipment Operator - Crane  
Senior Mechanical Engineer (3/23/15; 10/1/2014)  
Senior Program Manager - Harbor (9/8/15; 9/14/15)  
Supervisor, Commercial Diving

The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding this item.

**A motion was made by Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Arias,  
to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following  
vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Charles Hicks, Robin Perry and Phyllis Arias

**Absent:** 2 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts and Rick McGilton-McGlamery



8. 16-040CS

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE PROPOSED CIVIL SERVICE  
DEPARTMENT BUDGET (Fiscal Year 2016-2017)**

*Staff report prepared by Kandice Taylor-Sherwood, Executive  
Director*

The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding the proposed Fiscal Year 2016/17 Civil Service budget and answered question.

Mr. Pfingsthorn also answered questions from the Commission regarding the budget.

President Perry suggested that since there is time before the deadline to submit the budget to the City Manager, he would like to request approval be held off until the March 16, 2016, Commission meeting. This will allow Commissioners Carolyn Smith Watts and Ricky McGilton-McGlamery the opportunity to ask any questions and vote.

Commissioner Hicks stated his opposition to holding the budget, stating that Commissioners Carolyn Smith Watts and Ricky McGilton-McGlamery received the proposed budget with the Commission Agenda and had time to question any concerns they may have. He would like the Commission to take action on the budget since there is a quorum.

Commission Arias stated that although she agrees with Commissioner Hicks, since there is another meeting before the budget deadline, as a courtesy to Commissioners Carolyn Smith Watts and Ricky McGilton-McGlamery, she suggested the item be tabled.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by  
President Perry, to table this item to the meeting of March 16,  
2016. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 2 - Robin Perry and Phyllis Arias

**No:** 1 - Charles Hicks

**Absent:** 2 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

## **NEW BUSINESS**

Commissioner Hicks questioned staff regarding the status on any recruitment for Special Services Officer.

The Secretary stated that the Test Construction Interns are currently working on creating a new examination for Special Service Officer.

Rob Pfingsthorn, Administrative Officer, stated that user departments have all agreed to have Special Services Officer lists expire on their expiration date. He stated that there are current lists that have not expired. However, on their expiration dates, it will be recommended to allow them to expire.

Commission Hicks stated his concerns of possibly needing Special Services Officers with no list available to select from, which will take more time to find suitable candidates.

President Perry invited staff to participate in a spinning/peddling class at Camden Apartment, located across the street on Ocean Boulevard, on March 16, 2016, 5:30 a.m.

**MANAGERS' REPORT**

**Recruitment & Selection**

**Special Projects**

**Administration Support Services**

**Executive Director**

Ms. McDonald informed the Commission that Crystal Slaten, Recruitment and Selection Officer, was at a Disaster Cost Recovery Training for Civil Service role in Spontaneous Volunteer program for emergency management. She also stated that staff analysts will be attending a Competency Training conducted by the Personnel Training Council later today.

Ms. McDonald introduced Alexis Green, Intern from KRA and Shawna Wright, Project Director of KRA to the Commission.

Ms. Wright briefed the Commission, stating that she is the Project Director for KRA (Knowledge to Career Academy), in partnership with Pacific Gateway. She stated that the program focuses on youths that are out of school and out of work, ages 17-24, offering them the opportunity to get career exploration, learn about labor market information, how to get a job, communication and judgment. It provides them with an opportunity to learn industry recognized certifications in Microsoft Office Specialist, Supply Chain Management and Customer Service and Retail Sales. It also provides them with an opportunity to receive 100 hours of paid work experience working in local businesses in Long Beach.

Alexis Green, briefed the Commission on how the program has helped her by providing the training and tools necessary to aid her in reaching her career goals. She stated that she is very excited about the opportunity to work in the Civil Service Department.

President Perry thanked Ms. McDonald and the Secretary for reaching out to this program.

Mr. Pfingsthorn informed the Commission that four of the Special Service Officer eligible lists have not expired. with 140 active candidates. However, he stated that one of the four lists will be expiring on March 4, 2016, and it will be recommended to allow it to expire.

Commissioner Hicks suggested staff reach out to departments before allowing the lists to expire.

The Secretary stated that Civil Service has been recognizing employees that have demonstrated Civil Service Core Values or City of Long Beach values. She stated that Daryl Smith and Andrew Brown, Refuse Operator from the Public Works Department are being recognized for the above and beyond service provided. She presented Daryl Smith

and Andrew Brown with Certificates of Appreciation for the outstanding service they provide to the citizens and City of Long Beach.

Mr. Smith addressed the Commission, expressing his pleasure in doing good deeds, and thank the Commission for the recognition.

Frank Ramirez, Superintendent, Environmental Services Bureau, thanked the Commission for recognizing Mr. Smith and Brown.

President Perry also congratulated Mr. Smith and Brown for their outstanding service they provided to the City.

The Secretary acknowledged David Espinoza for the work he did on capturing the stories of the employees Civil Service have acknowledged, by putting audio to the stories.

Mr. Epinoza briefed the Commission on the voice over video he made, telling the stories of each employee.

Ms. McDonald showed highlights of these stories along with highlights from a Recruitment Video resulting from the department's goal of Partnering with Long Beach TV and Police Department to create recruitment videos that shed a positive light on the occupation of Police Officer.

**COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission’s jurisdiction.**

Shawna Wright, Project Director, KRA, thanked the Civil Service Department for the great staff and opportunity for Ms. Green to work in such a caring environment.

Ms. Green, thanked the Civil Service Department for welcoming her and the opportunity to work in such a positive environment.

Stacey Lewis, Assistant Director of Human Resources, Harbor Department, stated that she is proud of what Civil Service is doing and acknowledged the Secretary for the excellent job she is doing.

Pete Pearson, IAM, acknowledged Mr. Brown and Smith for the excellent job they are doing. He acknowledged Mr. Smith for all the work he does in the community in bringing people together.

**ADJOURNMENT**

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរៀបរៀង និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ ការិយាល័យស្ម័គ្រចង្អុលតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។

**CITY OF LONG BEACH  
CULTURAL HERITAGE  
COMMISSION MINUTES**

**MONDAY, FEBRUARY 8, 2016  
PLAZA LEVEL - CITY HALL  
CITY COUNCIL CHAMBER  
333 W. OCEAN BLVD.  
LONG BEACH, CA 90802, 5:30 PM**

Alan Burks, Chair  
Karen Highberger, Vice Chair  
Shannon Carmack, Commissioner



Louise Ivers, Commissioner  
Irma Hernandez, Commissioner  
Jan Robert van Dijs, Commissioner  
Julianna Roosevelt, Commissioner

---

**FINISHED AGENDA & MINUTES**

**CALL TO ORDER**

At 5:34 PM, Chair Burks called to order the Cultural Heritage Commission meeting.

**ROLL CALL**

**Commissioners** Alan Burks, Jan Robert van Dijs, Julianna Roosevelt, Karen L.

**Present:** Highberger, Louise Ivers and Shannon Carmack

**Commissioners** Irma Hernandez

**Excused:**

ALSO PRESENT: Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager; Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer; Alejandro Plascencia, Planner; and Thelinjoris Manuel, Clerk Typist III.

**FLAG SALUTE**

Chair Burks led in the flag salute.

**MINUTES**

16-005CH

Recommendation to receive and file the Minutes of the January 11, 2016 Cultural Heritage Commission meeting.

A motion was made by Commissioner van Dijs, seconded by Vice Chair Highberger, to receive and file the Minutes of the January 11, 2016 Cultural Heritage Commission. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Yes:** 5 - Alan Burks, Jan Robert van Dijs, Julianna Roosevelt, Karen L. Highberger and Louise Ivers

**Abstain:** 1 - Shannon Carmack

**Excused:** 1 - Irma Hernandez

#### **DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, provided the Director's report.

#### **PUBLIC PARTICIPATION:**

There was no public participation.

#### **SWEARING OF WITNESSES**

All witnesses were sworn in by Chair Burks.

#### **REGULAR AGENDA (2)**

1. 16-007CH Recommendation to uphold the staff decision to approve in part and deny in part a staff-level Certificate of Appropriateness. The staff decision approves the removal of a front yard planter and installation of new landscaping, a new front yard walkway, a new ribbon driveway; and the staff decision denies reorientation of the front porch entry and steps from the driveway toward the front property line at an existing one-story single-family residence located at 3512 Brayton Avenue. The property is a contributing structure within the California Heights Historic District. (District 7)

Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer, introduced Alejandro Plascencia, Planner, who provided the staff report.

Commissioner Ivers spoke.



Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer, spoke and a dialogue ensued with Commissioner Ivers.

Commissioner van Dijs spoke.

Alejandro Plascencia, Planner, spoke.

Chair Burks spoke.

John Godin, Applicant, spoke and a dialogue ensued with Chair Burks and the Owner.

Vice Chair Highberger spoke.

Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer, spoke and a dialogue ensued with Vice Chair Highberger.

John Godin, Applicant, spoke and a dialogue ensued with Vice Chair Highberger and the Owner.

Commissioner van Dijs spoke.

Commissioner Ivers spoke and a dialogue ensued with the Owner.

Chair Burks spoke and a dialogue ensued with the Owner.

Commissioner van Dijs spoke.

The Owner spoke and a dialogue ensued with Commissioner van Dijs.

John Godin, Applicant, spoke.

Vice Chair Highberger spoke.

The Owner spoke.

Vice Chair Highberger spoke.

Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer, spoke.

The Owner spoke and John Godin, Applicant, spoke.

Chair Burks spoke.

Sherry, Resident, spoke.

Chair Burks spoke.

Vice Chair Highberger spoke.

Commissioner van Dijs spoke.

Vice Chair Highberger spoke and a group dialogue ensued with the Owner and Commissioner van Dijs.

John Godin, Applicant, spoke.

Vice Chair Highberger spoke and Commissioner van Dijs spoke and a dialogue ensued with John Godin and the Owner.

Chair Burks spoke and a dialogue ensued with John Godin, Applicant.

**A motion was made by Commissioner van Dijs, seconded by Commissioner Ivers, to grant the appeal for a Certificate of Appropriateness to approve removal of a front yard planter and install new landscaping, a new front yard walkway with saltillo tiles running parallel to the new ribbon driveway, a new front-facing porch entry and steps while maintaining existing porch entry and steps from the driveway, at an existing one-story single-family residence located at 3512 Brayton Avenue. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 6 - Alan Burks, Jan Robert van Dijs, Julianna Roosevelt, Karen L. Highberger, Louise Ivers and Shannon Carmack

**Absent:** 1 - Irma Hernandez

**2. 16-006CH**

Recommendation to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new 1,888 square foot two-story residence with an attached two-car garage located at 2721 E. Ocean Boulevard in the Bluff Park Historic District. (District 3)

Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer, introduced Alejandro Plascencia, Planner, who provided the staff report.

Chair Burks spoke.

Alejandro Plascencia, Planner, spoke.

Commissioner Ivers spoke.

Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer, spoke and a dialogue ensued with Commissioner Ivers.

Chair Burks spoke.

John Udoff, Designer, spoke.

Chair Burks spoke and a dialogue ensued with John Udoff, Designer.

Commissioner van Dijs spoke.

John Udoff, Designer, spoke and a dialogue ensued with Commissioner van Dijs.

Commissioner Ivers spoke.

Commissioner van Dijs spoke.

Commissioner Carmack spoke.

Chair Burks spoke.

Diane, Resident, spoke.

Chair Burks spoke and a dialogue ensued with Diane, Resident.

Commissioner van Dijs spoke.

Commissioner Ivers spoke and a group dialogue ensued with Commissioner van Dijs, Chair Burks and Diane, Resident.

Commissioner Roosevelt spoke.

Diane, Resident, spoke.

Chair Burks spoke and a dialogue ensued with Diane, Resident.

Commissioner Roosevelt spoke.

Vice Chair Highberger spoke.

Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, spoke.

Vice Chair Highberger spoke.

Commissioner van Dijs spoke.

Commissioner Ivers spoke.

Chair Burks spoke.

Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer, spoke.

Commissioner Ivers spoke.

Commissioner van Dijs spoke.

Commissioner Ivers spoke and a dialogue ensued with Commissioner van Dijs.

Matt, Resident, spoke.

Chair Burks spoke and a dialogue ensued with Matt, Resident.

Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer, spoke.

Chair Burks spoke.

Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, spoke.

**A motion was made by Commissioner van Dijs, seconded by Commissioner Roosevelt, to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new 1,888 square foot two-story residence with an attached two-car garage, add a condition to install kneww braces instead of victorian brackets shown on plans, and delete conditions 12, 13, and 14 for the project at 2721 E. Ocean Boulevard.. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 6 - Alan Burks, Jan Robert van Dijs, Julianna Roosevelt, Karen L. Highberger, Louise Ivers and Shannon Carmack

**Absent:** 1 - Irma Hernandez

**STUDY SESSION - 201 Pine Avenue**

Commissioner van Dijs recused himself from this Study Session.

Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer, spoke.

John Thomas, Applicant, spoke.

Chair Burks spoke.

A group dialogue ensued with all Commissioners and John Thomas, Applicant.

Ron Hodges, Owner, spoke and a group dialogue ensued with the Commissioners and John Thomas, Applicant.

#### **COMMENTS FROM THE CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSIONERS**

Chair Burks spoke.

A dialogue ensued with the Commissioners and Thelinjoris Manuel, Clerk.

Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, spoke.

Chair Burks spoke.

Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer, spoke.

Chair Burks spoke.

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

At 7:13 PM, there being no objection(s), Chair Burks declared the Cultural Heritage Commission meeting adjourned.

**CITY OF LONG BEACH  
PLANNING COMMISSION  
MINUTES**

**THURSDAY, MARCH 3, 2016  
333 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD  
COUNCIL CHAMBER, 5:00 PM**

Mark Christoffels, Chair  
Donita Van Horik, Vice Chair  
Ron Cruz, Commissioner



Alan Fox, Commissioner  
Andy Perez, Commissioner  
Jane Templin, Commissioner  
Erick Verduzco-Vega, Commissioner

---

**FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES**

**CALL TO ORDER (5:03 PM)**

At 5:03 p.m., Chair Christoffels called the meeting to order.

**ROLL CALL (5:04 PM)**

Also present: Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services; Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager; Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer; Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney; Ira Brown, Planner; Scott Kinsey, Planner; Heidi Eidson, Bureau Secretary.

**Commissioners** Alan Fox, Alan Fox, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Erick  
**Present:** Verduzco-Vega, Donita Van Horik and Mark Christoffels

**Commissioners** Ron Cruz  
**Absent:**

**FLAG SALUTE (5:04 PM)**

Commissioner Perez led the flag salute.

**MINUTES (5:05 PM)**

16-014PL Recommendation to receive and file the Planning Commission minutes for February 18, 2016.

**A motion was made by Vice Chair Van Horik, seconded by Commissioner Templin, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Alan Fox, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Donita Van Horik and Mark Christoffels

**Abstain:** 1 - Erick Verduzco-Vega

**Absent:** 1 - Ron Cruz

**DIRECTOR'S REPORT (5:05 PM)**

Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, provided the Director's Report.

**SWEARING OF WITNESSES (5:06 PM)**

Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the evidence you shall give in this Planning Commission Meeting shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth.

**REGULAR AGENDA (5:06 PM)**

1. 16-015PL Recommendation to receive and file the 2015 Housing Element Annual Report and instruct the Director of Development Services to submit the Annual Report to the City Council, State Office of Planning and Research, and the California Department of Housing and Community Development. (Citywide)

Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, introduced Ira Brown, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Ira Brown responded to queries from Commissioner Van Horik.

Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer, responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to queries from Commissioner Verduzco-Vega.

Amy Bodek spoke.

Ira Brown responded to a query from Amy Bodek.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to queries from Commissioner Templin.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Ira Brown responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Christopher Koontz responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Ira Brown spoke.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Templin, seconded by Commissioner Verduzco-Vega, to approve the recommendation.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 6 - Alan Fox, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega, Donita Van Horik and Mark Christoffels

**Absent:** 1 - Ron Cruz

**2. 16-018PL**

Recommendation to conclude the public hearing and recommend that City Council adopt the proposed zoning code amendment, changing the way that Caltrans "credits" may be used for development of billboards adjacent to landscaped freeway segments, and accept Categorical Exemption 16-026. (Citywide) (Application No. 1602-05)

Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, introduced Scott Kinsey, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Linda Tatum responded to queries from Commissioner Fox.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Scott Kinsey responded to queries from Commissioner Van Horik.



Chair Christoffels spoke.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Chair Christoffels.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Templin and Scott Kinsey.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Van Horik and Scott Kinsey.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, spoke.

Commissioner Van Horik responded to a comment made by Amy Bodek.

Scott Kinsey spoke.

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Verduzco-Vega and Amy Bodek.

Scott Kinsey spoke.

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Fox and Amy Bodek.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Templin.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Amy Bodek spoke.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to a request made by Commissioner Van Horik.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Templin, seconded by Commissioner Perez, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 6 - Alan Fox, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega, Donita Van Horik and Mark Christoffels

**Absent:** 1 - Ron Cruz

**3. 16-016PL**

Recommendation to approve a Conditional Use Permit for the construction of a new single-sided 617.5-square-foot electronic billboard, located at 3310 Airport Way in the General Industrial (IG) zoning district, and accept Categorical Exemption 15-068. (District 5) (Application No. 1506-08)

Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, introduced Scott Kinsey, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Richard Montgomery, Real Estate Manager for Lamar Advertising, applicant, spoke.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Richard Montgomery responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, responded to a comment made by Commissioner Van Horik.

Richard Montgomery spoke.

Commissioner Van Horik responded to a comment made by Richard Montgomery.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Chair Christoffels.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Chair Christoffels and Michael Mais.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

Scott Kinsey responded to a query from Commissioner Verduzco-Vega.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Verduzco-Vega.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

Scott Kinsey spoke.

Michael Mais responded to Commissioner Van Horik's motion.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Scott Kinsey responded to comments made by Commissioner Fox.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

**A motion was made by Vice Chair Van Horik, seconded by Commissioner Templin, to approve the recommendation with an amendment directing City staff, including the City Attorney's office, to work with the applicant to fashion a condition of approval, that the applicant would agree to, that would prohibit the advertising of adult entertainment-type businesses on the electronic billboard and that if staff and the applicant were unable to reach an agreement on appropriate language, then the matter would come back to the Planning Commission for further action. Also, if the applicant chose to construct a double-faced electronic billboard at 6701 Paramount Boulevard, then the Conditional Use Permit for this location would self extinguish and that the correct measurement of the sign be 620 square feet. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 6 - Alan Fox, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega, Donita Van Horik and Mark Christoffels

**Absent:** 1 - Ron Cruz

**4. 16-017PL**

Recommendation to approve a Conditional Use Permit for the construction of a new single-sided 617.5-square-foot electronic

billboard, located at 6701 Paramount Boulevard, in the Regional Highway (CHW) zoning district, and accept Categorical Exemption 15-069. (District 9) (Application No. 1506-09)

Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, introduced Scott Kinsey, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Scott Kinsey responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Richard Montgomery, Real Estate Manager for Lamar Advertising, applicant, spoke.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Richard Montgomery responded to a query from Commissioner Templin.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Richard Montgomery responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, responded to queries from Commissioner Templin and Chair Christoffels.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Templin, seconded by Vice Chair Van Horik, to approve the recommendation with an amendment directing City staff, including the City Attorney's office, to work with the applicant to fashion a condition of approval, that the applicant would agree to, that would prohibit the advertising of adult entertainment-type businesses on the electronic billboard and that if staff and the applicant were unable to reach an agreement on appropriate language, then the matter would come back to the Planning Commission for further action. Also, if the applicant chose to construct a double-faced electronic billboard at 3310 Airport Way, then the Conditional Use Permit for this location would self extinguish and that the correct measurement of the sign be 620 square feet. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 6 - Alan Fox, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega,  
Donita Van Horik and Mark Christoffels

**Absent:** 1 - Ron Cruz

**PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (6:34 PM)**

There were no comments from the public.

**COMMENTS FROM THE PLANNING COMMISSION (6:34 PM)**

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

**ADJOURNMENT (6:36 PM)**

At 6:36 p.m., Chair Christoffels adjourned the meeting.

hge

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ: និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យអ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹងចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។