

**LONG BEACH CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
JEANNE KARATSU, PRESIDENT  
NOVEMBER 16, 2011**

The regular meeting of the Civil Service Commission was held at 8:00 a.m., Wednesday, November 16, 2011, in the Board Room of the Commission, 333 West Ocean Boulevard, Seventh Floor, Long Beach, California.

**MEMBERS PRESENT:** Jeanne Karatsu, Carolyn Smith Watts, Charles Hicks Jr., Jonathan Gotz

**MEMBER EXCUSED:** Larry Keller

**OTHERS PRESENT:** Mario R. Beas, Executive Director & Secretary  
Melinda George, Deputy Director  
Christina Checelsky, Deputy City Attorney  
Marilyn Hall, Executive Assistant  
Salvador Ambriz, Personnel Analyst  
Debbie McCluster, Personnel Analyst  
Caprice McDonald, Personnel Analyst  
Robert Pfingsthorf, Personnel Analyst  
Lourdes Ferrer, Personnel Analyst  
Donna de Araujo, Assistant Administrative Analyst  
Ken Walker, Personnel Operations Manager, Human Resources

**President Jeanne Karatsu presided.**

**MINUTES:** It was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts and carried that the minutes of the regular meeting of October 19, 2011, be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

It was moved by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Commissioner Gotz and carried that the minutes of the regular meeting of November 2, 2011, be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**CONSENT CALENDAR (2-8):** It was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts and carried that the Consent Calendar items be approved. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**EXAMINATION RESULTS:** Request to approve examination results.

Civil Engineer (11/7/11) – 136 Applied, 82 Qualified  
Public Safety Dispatcher (10/26/11) – 4 Applied, 4 Qualified

**The motion was made to approve request on Consent Calendar.**

**RETIREMENTS:**

Request to receive and file retirements.

Robert Hunt/Environmental Health Specialist III/Health  
Robert Taylor/General Maintenance Supervisor II/Parks  
Iona Brook/Clerk Typist II/Police  
Manuel Mejia/Police Officer/Police  
Efrain Chagoya/Tree Trimmer I/Public Works

**The motion was made to receive and file on Consent Calendar.**

**RESIGNATIONS:**

Request to receive and file resignations.

Paul Reeve/General Maintenance Assistant/Harbor  
Sean Daugherty/Plan Checker – Fire Prevention/Fire  
Leon Blum/Airport Public Affairs Assistant/Airport  
Laurie Gruschka/Public Health Professional II/Health

**The motion was made to receive and file on Consent Calendar.**

**DOWNGRADE (Voluntary):**

Request to approve downgrade.

Carl Reich/Special Services Officer III/Harbor to Special  
Services Officer I/Harbor

**The motion was made to approve downgrade on Consent Calendar.**

**SCHEDULE FOR HEARINGS:**

Request to approve hearing schedule.

Disability Retirement Appeal 34-DR-910, March 1, 2012  
Disability Retirement Appeal 17-DR-1011, March 1, 2012

**The motion was made to approve hearing schedule on Consent Calendar.**

**REQUEST TO WITHDRAW APPEAL:** Request to receive and file withdrawal of appeal.

Suspension Appeal 33-R-1011

**The motion was made to receive and file withdraw of appeal on Consent Calendar.**

**RESCHEDULE FOR HEARING:**

Request to approve reschedule for hearing.

Suspension Appeal 37-S-1011, January 20, 2012

**The motion was made to approve the reschedule for hearing.**

**REQUEST FOR PERMANENT  
REASSIGNMENT:**

**JOSE JUAN ROBLES/GAS FIELD SERVICE  
REPRESENTATIVE TO CUSTOMER SERVICE  
REPRESENTATIVE**

This item was withdrawn at the request of Human Resources.

**REQUEST TO TRANSFER FROM  
UNCLASSIFIED TO CLASSIFIED:**

**KEVIN KELEHER/AMBULANCE OPERATOR - NON  
CAREER TO AMBULANCE OPERATOR**

The Secretary presented communications from David P. Honey, Manager – Administration, Fire Department, requesting Commission authorization to return Kevin Keleher, Ambulance Operator – Non Career to his former classified position of Ambulance Operator. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Gotz seconded by Commissioner Hicks and carried that the request to return Kevin Keleher to classified service, be approved, pursuant to Section 69 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**REQUEST TO TRANSFER FROM  
UNCLASSIFIED TO CLASSIFIED:**

**BRYAN THURSTON/AMBULANCE OPERATOR - NON  
CAREER TO AMBULANCE OPERATOR**

The Secretary presented communications from David P. Honey, Manager – Administration, Fire Department, requesting Commission authorization to return Bryan Thurston, Ambulance Operator – Non Career to his former classified position of Ambulance Operator. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Gotz seconded by Commissioner Hicks and carried that the request to return Bryan Thurston to classified service, be approved, pursuant to Section 69 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**REQUEST FOR ORDER OF  
LAYOFF:**

The Secretary presented an Order of Layoff to the Commission for the Maintenance Assistant classification. The Department of Human Resources informed the Civil

Service Department that this position was inadvertently omitted from the Order of Layoff, dated September 16, 2011. The position is in the Library Services Department. In addition, the Secretary presented a staff report prepared by him. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts and carried to approve the Order of Layoff as prepared and to forward it to the City Manager. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**PROTEST OF WRITTEN  
EXAMINATION ITEMS:**

The Secretary presented a staff report prepared by Lourdes Ferrer, Personnel Analyst, regarding the disposition of protested questions from the Gas Maintenance Assistant examination, which was conducted on November 10, 2011. Ms. Ferrer briefed the Commission regarding the protests. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Commissioner Hicks and carried that the recommended disposition of the protested questions be approved and the affected persons be so notified. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.


**BULLETINS:**

It was moved by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Commissioner Hicks and carried that the following Job Opportunity Bulletins be approved. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

Capital Projects Coordinator  
Plan Checker – Plumbing  
Traffic Signal Technician

**ADJOURNMENT:**

There being no further business before the Commission, President Karatsu adjourned the meeting.



MARIO R. BEAS  
Secretary

MRB:meh

**CITY OF LONG BEACH  
PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES**

**THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 10, 2011  
333 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD  
COUNCIL CHAMBER, 5:30 PM**

Charles Durnin, Chair  
Donita Van Horik, Vice-Chair



Becky Blair, Commissioner  
Alan Fox, Commissioner  
Leslie Gentile, Commissioner  
Phil Saumur, Commissioner  
Melani Smith, Commissioner

---

**FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES**

**CALL TO ORDER (5:35 PM)**

At 5:35 p.m., Vice Chair Van Horik called the meeting to order.

**ROLL CALL (5:35 PM)**

see media

**Boardmembers** Alan L. Fox, Phillip Joseph Saumur, Melani Smith, Donita Van  
**Present:** Horik and Becky Blair

**Boardmembers** Charles Durnin and Leslie Fernald Gentile  
**Absent:**

Also present: Amy J. Bodek, Director of Development Services; Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator; Jill Griffiths, Planning Officer; Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney; Steve Gerhardt, Planner; Heidi Eidson, Bureau Secretary.

**FLAG SALUTE (5:36 PM)**

see media

Commissioner Fox led the flag salute.

**MINUTES (5:36 PM)**

see media

11-065PL

Recommendation to receive and file the Planning Commission minutes of October 20, 2011.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Smith, seconded by Commissioner Saumur, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

**Absent:** 2 - Charles Durnin and Leslie Fernald Gentile

**DIRECTOR'S REPORT (5:38 PM)**

see media

Amy J. Bodek, Director of Development Services, provided the Director's Report.

**SWEARING OF WITNESSES (5:38 PM)**

see media

Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the evidence you shall give in this Planning Commission Meeting shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth.

**REGULAR AGENDA (5:39 PM)**

see media

see media

**1. 11-066PL**

Recommendation to:

- 1) Adopt a Resolution with Findings of Fact, a Statement of Overriding Considerations, and Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program certifying a Final Program Environmental Impact Report;
- 2) Recommend that the City Council approve a General Plan Amendment to designate all property within the Downtown Plan project area to Land Use Designation (LUD) #7, Mixed Uses; and
- 3) Recommend that the City Council adopt the Downtown Plan as presented. (Districts 1, 2, and 6)

Amy J. Bodek, Director of Development Services, spoke.

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, presented the staff report.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Commissioner Saumur.

Vice Chair Van Horik spoke.

Gary Shelton provided public comment.

Susan Ahn, representing the Long Beach Unified School District, provided public comment.

Jim Anderson, representing the Downtown Long Beach Associates, provided public comment.

Evangelina Ramirez, representing Housing Long Beach, provided public comment.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, responded to a query from Vice Chair Van Horik.

Evangelina Ramirez spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a comment from Evangelina Ramirez.

Zahirah Mann, Legal Aid Foundation of Los Angeles, provided public comment.

Susanne Browne, Legal Aid Foundation of Los Angeles, provided public comment.

Malcolm Carson, Legal Aid Foundation of Los Angeles, provided public comment.

Adrian Martinez, Natural Resource Defense Council, provided public comment.

Nora Lake Brown, David Paul Rosen & Associates, provided public comment.

Frances Emily Dawson Harris provided public comment.

Dianne McNinch provided public comment.

Patty Lund provided public comment.

Kim Hu provided public comment.

Cecilia Lynch provided public comment.

Joshua Jimenez provided public comment.

Michael Micelli, President of the East Village Association, provided public comment.

Melinda Roney, President of Long Beach Heritage, provided public comment.

Wendy Harn, representing Long Beach Heritage as Vice President of Advocacy, provided public comment.

Matt Cercia provided public comment.

Jocelyn Vivar Ramirez, East Yard Communities for Environmental Justice, provided public comment.

Erika Olvera provided public comment.

Tom Crow, representing CSULB School of Social Work and St. Luke's Episcopal Church, provided public comment.

Kayla Crow, representing CSULB's Political Science Student Association, provided public comment.

Nicole, member of the Coalition for Good Jobs and a Healthy Community, provided public comment.

Ladean Chang provided public comment.

Kamrak Choi provided public comment.

Michelle Munis provided public comment.

Kevin Keo provided public comment.

Vince Zeratti provided public comment.

Cameron Pon provided public comment.

Sam T. Kelly provided public comment.

Peter Johnson provided public comment.

Erik Kenney provided public comment.

Don Darnauer provided public comment.

Mike Dunphy provided public comment.

Laura Catabona provided public comment.

Joe Gannon provided public comment.

Larry Goodhue provided public comment.

Michael Vanderbeek provided public comment.



Marta Cota provided public comment.

Yolanda Lopez provided public comment.

Estelle Lovalia provided public comment.

Eva Judia provided public comment.

Caesario Ojeda provided public comment.

Sandra Krall provided public comment.

David Bosanich provided public comment.

Christopher Covington provided public comment.

Ernie Villa provided public comment.

Marisol Barajas provided public comment.

Alicia Carrera, representing the Community Partners Council, provided public comment.

Janice McConnell provided public comment.

Cindy Soto provided public comment.

Amy Bodek spoke.

Michael Mais spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Vice Chair Van Horik.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Blair, Michael Mais and Commissioner Fox.

A motion was made by Commissioner Blair, seconded by Commissioner Saumur, to continue the matter to November 17, 2011. The motion carried unanimously. Chair Durnin and Commissioner Gentile were absent.

A dialogue ensued between Vice Chair Van Horik and Commissioner Fox.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Blair and Commissioner Fox.

The matter was re-opened for further consideration.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Vice Chair Van Horik.

Michael Mais responded to queries from Commissioner Blair.

Commissioner Smith spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Smith.

A motion was made by Commissioner Blair, seconded by Commissioner Saumur, to reconsider the date for continuing the matter. The motion carried unanimously. Chair Durnin and Commissioner Gentile were absent.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Vice Chair Van Horik.

A motion was made by Commissioner Blair, seconded by Commissioner Saumur, to conclude the public hearing and continue the matter to December 1, 2011. The motion carried unanimously. Chair Durnin and Commissioner Gentile were absent.

A dialogue ensued between Frances Emily Dawson Harris and Vice Chair Van Horik.

Michael Mais spoke.

Susanne Browne provided public comment.

Amy Bodek spoke.

Cecilia Lynch provided public comment.

Amy Bodek responded to a query from Cecilia Lynch.

Commissioner Saumur responded to a query from Vice Chair Van Horik.

Gary Shelton provided public comment.

Amy Bodek responded to a comment from Gary Shelton.

Larry Goodhue provided public comment.

Allison Bost provided public comment.

Commissioner Smith spoke.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Commissioner Smith.

Michael Mais spoke.

Frances Emily Dawson Harris provided public comment.

Angelo Logan provided public comment.

Commissioner Smith spoke.

Vice Chair Van Horik spoke.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

A vote was retaken on the motion made by Commissioner Blair, seconded by Commissioner Saumur, to conclude the public hearing and continue the matter to December 1, 2011.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Blair, seconded by Saumur, to conclude the public hearing and continue the matter to December 1, 2011. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

**Absent:** 2 - Charles Durnin and Leslie Fernald Gentile

1. 11-067PL Recommendation to adopt a Resolution with Findings of Fact, a Statement of Overriding Considerations, and Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program certifying a Final Program Environmental Impact Report. (Districts 1, 2, and 6) (1)

**This PL-Agenda Item was laid over.**

1. 11-068PL Recommendation to recommend that the City Council approve a General Plan Amendment to designate all property within the Downtown Plan project area to Land Use Designation (LUD) #7, Mixed Uses. (Districts 1, 2, and 6) (2)

**This PL-Agenda Item was laid over.**

1. 11-069PL Recommendation to recommend that the City Council adopt the Downtown Plan as presented. (Districts 1, 2, and 6) (3)

**This PL-Agenda Item was laid over.**

**PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (8:45 PM)**

see media

Larry Goodhue provided public comment.

Susanne Browne, Legal Aid Foundation of Los Angeles, provided public comment.

A dialogue ensued between Don Darnauer, Michael Mais, and Amy Bodek.

Frances Emily Dawson Harris provided public comment.

Josh Asir provided public comment.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Zahirah Mann.

Amy Bodek responded to a query from Zahirah Mann.

**COMMENTS FROM THE PLANNING COMMISSION (8:45 PM)**

see media

There were no comments from the Planning Commission.

**ADJOURNMENT (8:45 PM)**

At 8:45 p.m., Vice Chair Van Horik adjourned the meeting.

hge

Charles Durnin, Chair  
Donita Van Horik, Vice-Chair



Becky Blair, Commissioner  
Alan Fox, Commissioner  
Leslie Gentile, Commissioner  
Phil Saumur, Commissioner  
Melani Smith, Commissioner

---

## **FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES**

### **CALL TO ORDER (5:08 PM)**

see media

At 5:08 p.m., Chair Durnin called the meeting to order.

### **ROLL CALL (5:08 PM)**

see media

**Boardmembers** Alan L. Fox, Charles Durnin, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Phillip Joseph  
**Present:** Saumur, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Also present: Amy J. Bodek, Director of Development Services; Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator; Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney; Steven Valdez, Project Planner; Craig Chalfant, Project Planner; Heidi Eidson, Bureau Secretary.

### **FLAG SALUTE (5:08 PM)**

see media

Commissioner Van Horik led the flag salute.

### **MINUTES (5:10 PM)**

see media

see media

11-070PL

Recommendation to receive and file the Planning Commission minutes of November 3, 2011.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Van Horik, seconded by Commissioner Gentile, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Alan L. Fox, Charles Durnin, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

**Abstain:** 2 - Phillip Joseph Saumur and Melani Smith

**DIRECTOR'S REPORT (5:10 PM)**

see media

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, provided the Director's Report.

**SWEARING OF WITNESSES (5:10 PM)**

see media

Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the evidence you shall give in this Planning Commission Meeting shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth.

**REGULAR AGENDA (5:11 PM)**

see media

see media

1. 11-071PL Recommendation to approve a Conditional Use Permit to allow an existing used car dealership to continue operation in compliance with performance standards codified in Long Beach Boulevard Planned Development District (PD-29). The used car dealership is located at 1400-1450 Long Beach Boulevard. (District 6) (Application No. 1103-13)

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, introduced Steven Valdez, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Commissioner Gentile.

Richard Todd, applicant's representative, spoke.

Richard Todd responded to a query from Commissioner Blair.

Pat Paris Appleby, representing the Central Project Area Committee, provided public comment.

Commissioner Blair spoke.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Blair, seconded by Commissioner Van Horik, to approve the recommendation with an amendment to include the revised conditions of approval as presented by staff. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Charles Durnin, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

see media

2. 11-072PL

Recommendation to: 1) Adopt a Resolution with revised Findings and a Statement of Overriding Considerations certifying a Final Environmental Impact Report (EIR 04-09); 2) Approve the Site Plan Review, Tentative Subdivision Map, Standards Variance and Local Coastal Development Permit requests for a mixed-use project consisting of 275 residential units, 155,000 square feet of commercial retail space, 100 hotel rooms with 4,368 square feet of hotel restaurant space and 3,510 square feet of hotel meeting space, 20,000 square feet of non-hotel restaurant space, and a 4,175-square-foot science center. (District 3) (Application No. 0904-09)

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, introduced Craig Chalfant, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Fox and Derek Burnham.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Fox and Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Fox and Derek Burnham.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

David Malmuth, applicant, spoke.

Alan Pullman, Studio One Eleven, discussed the revised Site Plan for the project.

Kara Mulio discussed retail feasibility for the project.

David Malmuth spoke.

David Malmuth responded to queries from Commissioner Smith.

David Malmuth responded to queries from Commissioner Saumur.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Chair Durnin.

Craig Chalfant responded to a query from Chair Durnin.

Chair Durnin spoke.

Kerrie Aley provided public comment.

Jim Coke provided public comment.

Amy Bodek responded to a comment from Larry Goodhue provided during public comment.

Melinda Cotton provided public comment.

Chair Durnin responded to a query from Melinda Cotton.

Jody Berger, faculty member of CSULB, provided public comment.

A dialogue ensued between Chair Durnin and Jody Berger.

2. 11-073PL

Recommendation to adopt a Resolution with revised Findings and a Statement of Overriding considerations certifying a Final Environmental Impact Report (EIR 04-09). (District 3) (Application No. 0904-09) (1)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Blair, seconded by Commissioner Gentile, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 6 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Charles Durnin, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

**No:** 1 - Alan L. Fox

2. 11-074PL

Recommendation to approve the Site Plan Review, Tentative Subdivision Map, Standards Variance and Local Coastal Development Permit requests for a mixed-use project consisting of 275 residential units, 155,000 square feet of commercial retail space, 100 hotel rooms with 4,368 square feet of hotel restaurant space and 3,510 square feet of hotel meeting space, 20,000 square feet of non-hotel restaurant space, and a 4,175-square-foot science center. (District 3) (Application No. 0904-09) (2)

Michael Mais responded to a query from Chair Durnin.

Eileen Ryan provided public comment.

Amy Bodek and Michael Mais responded to queries from Eileen Ryan.

Gordana Cager provided public comment.

Bill Thomas provided public comment.

Louise Ivers provided public comment.



Jeff Miller provided public comment.

Heather Altman provided public comment.

Randy Sarver provided public comment.

Mel Nutter, representing the Los Cerritos Land Trust, provided public comment.

Mary Parsell, representing the El Dorado Audubon Society, provided public comment.

Joe Weinstein provided public comment.

Melinda Cotton provided public comment.

Chris Gensco provided public comment.

Richard Roth provided public comment.

Alan Songer provided public comment.

Shirley Thomas provided public comment.

Larry Goodhue provided public comment.

Kerrie Aley provided public comment.

Bill Lorbeer provided public comment.

Steve Conley provided public comment.

Stan Poe provided public comment.

Maureen Poe provided public comment.

Jim Coke provided public comment.

David Malmuth spoke.

David Malmuth responded to a query from Chair Durnin.

David Malmuth responded to a query from Commissioner Gentile.

Commissioner Blair spoke.

David Malmuth responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Commissioner Blair spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Van Horik and Michael Mais.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Smith.

Commissioner Gentile spoke.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Commissioner Smith spoke.

Chair Durnin spoke.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gentile, seconded by Commissioner Blair, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Leslie Fernald Gentile, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

**No:** 3 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox and Charles Durnin

3. 11-050PL Recommendation to elect a Chair of the Planning Commission for 2011-2012.

A motion was made by Commissioner Fox, seconded by Commissioner Saumur, to approve the nomination of Donita Van Horik as the Chair of the Planning Commission for 2011-2012.

Commissioner Van Horik declined the nomination.

The motion was withdrawn.

Larry Goodhue provided public comment.

Chair Durnin spoke.

Steve Conley provided public comment.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Chair Durnin.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Van Horik, seconded by Commissioner Smith, to approve the nomination of Becky Blair as the Chair of the Planning Commissioner for 2011-2012. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Charles Durnin, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

4. 11-051PL Recommendation to elect a Vice Chair of the Planning Commission for 2011-2012.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gentile, seconded by Commissioner Blair, to approve the nomination of Commissioner Fox as the Vice Chair of the Planning Commission for 2011-2012. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Charles Durnin, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

**PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (7:44 PM)**

see media

There was no public comment given.

**COMMENTS FROM THE PLANNING COMMISSION (7:44 PM)**

see media

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, spoke.

Chair Durnin spoke.

Amy Bodek spoke.

Commissioner Blair spoke.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, responded to a query from Chair Durnin.

Amy Bodek responded to a query from Commissioner Gentile.

**ADJOURNMENT (7:48 PM)**

see media

At 7:48 p.m., Chair Durnin adjourned the meeting.

hge