

January 19, 2023

CHAIR AND PLANNING COMMISSIONERS
City of Long Beach
California

RECOMMENDATION:

Approve the Addendum (EIRA-02-22) to the Downtown Plan Program Environmental Impact Report (SCH No. 2009071006), approve Site Plan Review for the construction of three (3) eight (8)-story apartment buildings with a total of 900 dwelling units and 38,405 square feet of ground floor commercial space, and 1,383 parking stalls in at-grade parking garages (SPR22-060), and approve Vesting Tentative Parcel Map No. 83693 to subdivide one 170,736-square-foot lot into two lots of 101,724 and 68,712 square feet (TPM22-002), located at 450 The Promenade North/501-599 Long Beach Blvd. in the Downtown Plan Planned Development District (PD-30). (District 1)

APPLICANT: Oren Hillel for Waterford Co.
130 Newport Center, Suite 230
Newport Beach, CA 92660
(Application No. 2205-32)

DISCUSSION

The applicant proposes to develop three eight-story buildings and a standalone retail pavilion on an approximately 5.5-acre site within the Downtown Plan. The project site is bounded by 6th Street on the north, Long Beach Boulevard on the east, 4th Street on the south, and The Promenade North and a City parking structure on the west. The project site is bisected by 5th Street, creating northern and southern portions of the project site (Attachment A – Vicinity Map). The site and all surrounding land uses are located within the Downtown Plan Planned Development District (PD-30), which is the zoning document for downtown Long Beach.

The current CityPlace development, in which the project site is located, was built in the early 2000s and replaced the Long Beach Plaza Mall, a two-level, 675,716-square foot enclosed shopping mall that was designed in the 1970s and constructed in 1982 with \$35



CHAIR AND PLANNING COMMISSIONERS

January 19, 2023

Page 2 of 10

million in aid from the former Long Beach Redevelopment Agency. The Long Beach Plaza Mall struggled to attract customers to its environment of enclosed, inward-facing stores, with even historically successful large department store anchor tenants such as JC Penney, Montgomery Ward, and Buffum's failing to thrive in the mall. The mall also struggled to compete with the regionally-adjacent Lakewood Center and Los Cerritos Center malls. Construction of the Metro Blue Line on Long Beach Boulevard in the late 1980s impeded access to the mall and further aggravated the site's problems. The Long Beach Plaza Mall closed in 1999 and was acquired by Developers Diversified Realty (DDR). DDR demolished the enclosed mall in 2002 and redeveloped the site with the CityPlace project, again with the assistance of the former Long Beach Redevelopment Agency, while retaining the previous mall's parking structures, which are now City-owned. CityPlace replaced the enclosed mall with the open streets and street-oriented commercial storefronts on the site today. CityPlace totals approximately 14 acres of land, including the 5.5-acre project site in addition to three large City-owned parking structures, and currently contains 197,513 square feet of commercial tenant space. The portion of CityPlace that comprises the project site included a Wal-Mart discount store and a Fresh & Easy grocery store as anchor tenants, both of which are now closed, in addition to a Ross Dress For Less clothing store and a variety of smaller commercial retail, restaurant, and personal service tenant spaces that are still occupied on 4th Street and 5th Street. The site as it currently exists is significantly underutilized and underperforming compared to the development potential allowed at the site by both the current Downtown Plan and General Plan.

The site's immediate surroundings include commercial and restaurant uses across 6th Street to the north, the 5th Street Metro A Line (formerly the Blue Line) light rail station on Long Beach Boulevard to the east, and a commercial shopping center and multi-story residential buildings to the east beyond. West of The Promenade North and south of 5th Street, the site is bounded by a four-story apartment building at the intersection of 5th Street and The Promenade, and retail/commercial uses further south, with a large above-grade City-owned parking structure to the west, and mixed-use ground floor commercial with residential above on Pine Avenue further west of the parking structure. North of 5th Street, the site is bounded by another City-owned above-grade parking structure. More restaurant and retail uses are located across 4th Street to the south of the site. The project site currently contains various retail and restaurant operations within two large one-story commercial buildings, totaling 197,513 existing square feet.

The proposed project includes the complete demolition of on-site improvements, removing all 197,513 square feet of existing commercial and retail uses in two buildings. The project will then develop one eight-story mixed-use building (Building B) on the southern portion of the site and two eight-story buildings [one mixed-use building (Building C1) and one residential building (Building C2)] on the northern portion of the site, and a standalone retail pavilion on the northern portion of the site (Attachment B – Plans). The

CHAIR AND PLANNING COMMISSIONERS

January 19, 2023

Page 3 of 10

project includes a total of 900 residential units, including 102 studio units, 476 one-bedroom units, 313 two-bedroom units, and nine three-bedroom units.

Each of the three buildings includes a residential garage with three levels of above-grade parking as well as bicycle storage areas located on the ground floor, with air conditioning units, boiler rooms, and space for future solar panels on the roof of each of the buildings. The project includes 31,195 square feet of common indoor open space, 62,027 square feet of common outdoor open space, and 29,747 square feet of private open space, including 451 units with private balconies, depicted on pages A0-5A through A0-5D of plans. The project also includes 181 individual residential storage units for residents, located in the parking structures. Additionally, the proposed project will develop 38,405 square feet of leasable commercial/retail space, including a 2,405 square-foot, one-story-plus-mezzanine retail pavilion on the north side of 5th Street at the intersection with The Promenade North, separate from the three eight-story buildings. A new pedestrian paseo on the project site's property will connect 5th Street and 6th Street on the west side of Buildings C1 and C2, abutting the City parking structure to the west.

The table below shows a detailed breakdown of the proposed building area and components:

CHAIR AND PLANNING COMMISSIONERS

January 19, 2023

Page 4 of 10

Table 1: Project Summary

| Type of Use | Proposed Project |
|---|--|
| Residential | |
| Building B | 272 dwelling units 218,603 sq. ft. |
| Building C1 | 359 dwelling units 275,190 sq. ft. |
| Building C2 | 269 dwelling units 207,201 sq. ft. |
| Total | <i>900 dwelling units</i> <i>700,994 sq. ft.</i> |
| Commercial | |
| Building B | 19,782 sq. ft. |
| Building C1 | 16,218 sq. ft. |
| Standalone Retail Pavilion | 2,405 sq. ft. |
| Building C2 | 0 sq. ft. |
| Total | 38,405 sq. ft. |
| Parking | |
| Building B | |
| Vehicle Parking Spaces | 373 parking spaces |
| Bicycle Park Spaces | 58 spaces |
| Building C1 | |
| Vehicle Parking | 576 parking spaces |
| Bicycle Park Spaces | 75 spaces |
| Building C2 | |
| Vehicle Parking | 434 parking spaces |
| Bicycle Park Spaces | 54 spaces |
| Total | <i>1,383 vehicle parking spaces</i> <i>187 bicycle spaces</i> |
| Open Space | |
| Common Indoor Open Space | 31,195 sq. ft. |
| Common Outdoor Open Space | 62,027 sq. ft. |
| Private Open Space | 451 units (50% of total) or 29,747 sq. ft. |
| Total Open Space Provided | <i>122,969 sq. ft.</i> |
| Building Area (includes parking garages) | |
| Building B | 413,760 gross sq. ft. |
| Building C1 | 550,432 gross sq. ft. |
| Building C2 | 406,574 gross sq. ft. |
| Total Building Area | <i>1,370,766 gross sq. ft.</i> |

Building B

Building B will be located on a 68,733-square foot parcel in the southern portion of the project site between 5th Street and 4th Street. Building B will include 218,603 square feet of residential use and 19,782 square feet of commercial use and will have a total building area of 413,760 gross square feet including the parking garages, with a floor area ratio (FAR) of 4.5 and 306,501 square feet of gross floor area. Commercial uses and lobby/leasing spaces are located on the ground level, a residential garage with three levels of above-grade parking as well as bicycle storage areas on levels 1 through 3, and 55 storage units on levels 2 and 3. Residential units are located on levels 3 through 8, amenity spaces on levels 4 and 8, including a courtyard and pool and spa area on level 4, and a roof deck on level 8. A total of 272 residential units and 373 vehicle and 58 bicycle parking spaces are provided in Building B.

Building C1

Building C1 will be located on a 101,724-square foot parcel in the northern portion of the project site between Building C2 and 5th Street. Building C1 includes 275,190 square feet of residential use and 16,218 square feet of commercial use, and has a total building area of 550,432 square feet including parking garages, with a FAR of 3.9 and 393,685 square feet of gross floor area. Commercial spaces, residential units, and a lobby with a leasing office are located the ground level, a residential garage with three levels of above-grade parking as well as bicycle storage areas on levels 1 through 3, and 72 storage units on levels 2 and 3. Residential units are located on levels 2 through 8, amenity spaces on levels 4 and 8, including courtyards and a pool and spa area on level 4, and a roof deck on level 8. A total of 359 residential units and 576 vehicle and 75 bicycle parking spaces are included in Building C1.

Building C2

Building C2 will be located on a 68,712-square foot parcel in the northern portion of the project site between Building C1 and 6th Street. Building C2 includes 207,201 square feet of residential use and has a total building area of 406,574 square feet including parking garages, with a FAR of 4.2 and 285,929 square feet of gross floor area. Building C2 includes a lobby with a leasing office, amenity space and residential units on the ground level, a residential garage with three levels of above-grade parking as well as bicycle storage areas on levels 1 through 3, and 54 storage units on levels 2 and 3. Residential units are located on levels 2 through 8, amenity spaces on levels 4 and 8, including a pool and spa area, courtyard, and club room on level 4, and a roof deck on level 8. A total of 269 residential units and 434 vehicle and 54 bicycle parking spaces are provided in Building C2.

Retail Pavilion

The retail pavilion will be located to the west of Building C1 along 5th Street at the northern terminus of The Promenade North, and is designed as a standalone single-story building with a mezzanine. The retail pavilion will contain approximately 2,405 square feet of retail space. The retail pavilion is designed using a combination of shipping container-like elements and large transparent areas of glass.

Open Space and Landscaping

The project will provide 31,195 square feet of common indoor open space, 62,027 square feet of common outdoor open space, and 29,747 square feet of private open space, including 451 residential units with private balconies. Each building includes ground level common open space, major amenities on Level 4, and more amenity spaces on Level 8 in each building. The Levels 4 and 8 amenity spaces include pool and spa areas, outdoor seating, fire pits, BBQ areas, turf fitness areas, cabanas, flex lawns, and a dog exercise area. Landscaping also is included at the ground level, within the Level 4 courtyard and pool deck areas, and within the Level 8 roof deck patio areas, consisting of trees and planters. The below table summarizes open space types provided in the project:

Table 2: Open Space Summary

| Open Space Type | Building B | Building C1 | Building C2 |
|---------------------------------|-------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| Ground-level: Common outdoor | - | 10,971 sq. ft. | - |
| Ground-level: Common indoor | 11,464 sq. ft. | 4,765 sq. ft. | 4,927 sq. ft. |
| Level 4: Common outdoor | 16,723 sq. ft. | 17,595 sq. ft. | 13,544 sq. ft. |
| Level 4: Common indoor | 5,636 sq. ft. | 4,171 sq. ft. | 3,059 sq. ft. |
| Level 8: Common outdoor | 1,068 sq. ft. | 1,038 sq. ft. | 1,088 sq. ft. |
| Level 8: Common indoor | 1,038 sq. ft. | 1,020 sq. ft. | 1,218 sq/ ft/ |

Access and Parking

Residential parking will be provided in above-grade parking levels within a three-story garage within the eight-story buildings. Access to the parking garages for Building B and Building C1 is provided from two right-in/right-out driveways on Long Beach Boulevard and access to the parking garage for Building C2 is provided from one right-in/right-out driveway on 6th Street. The Downtown Plan requires 1.25 vehicle parking spaces per residential unit (one space per unit plus one guest space per four units), which requires

the project to provide 1,126 vehicle parking spaces for the residential uses. The proposed garages provide 1,383 vehicle parking spaces, including 469 standard spaces, 470 compact spaces, 222 standard front tandem spaces, and 222 compact rear tandem spaces. The project also includes a total of 187 bicycle parking spaces. The required 39 parking spaces for the project's proposed commercial/retail spaces will be provided in adjacent City-owned parking structures pursuant to the Parking Rights Agreement 01-1799119, which was signed and recorded in 2005 and allows employees and customers of the commercial/retail tenants to use up to approximately 1,901 parking spaces located in nearby facilities owned and operated by the City. The entire project site is within one-half mile of a high-quality transit stop, making it exempt from parking minimums per Section 65863.2 of the California Government Code (passed by the Legislature as AB 2097, and effective January 1, 2023). However, as a practical matter and a reflection of current market demand in the housing market, the developer proposes to meet the parking requirements of the local zoning regulations.

Off-Site Improvements and Street Dedication

The project includes off-site improvements on The Promenade North, Long Beach Boulevard, the north side of 4th Street from The Promenade North to Long Beach Boulevard, and 5th and 6th Streets from The Promenade North to Long Beach Boulevard. Off-site improvements include closure of The Promenade North between 4th Street and 5th Street for pedestrian access only, outdoor seating areas, crosswalks designed with art graphics, outdoor café dining, outdoor work tables, new street trees and plantings, a fire lane, retractable bollards, sidewalk improvements, a security gate, street parallel parking spaces, a dog run, gardens, a pedestrian trail, a playscape, a flex lawn, and potential pocket parks/parklets. The existing 4th Street, 5th Street, and The Promenade North are currently private streets, but will be dedicated to the City as part of the proposed project. However, the dedication will be from curb line to curb line, with the sidewalks, parkways, and street landscaping remaining private to allow private maintenance responsibility for these areas as well as greater flexibility for programming the sidewalk space (sidewalk dining, events, etc.) while still requiring compliance with applicable laws and regulations for publicly-accessible areas (e.g., the path-of-travel and curb requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990 (ADA)). The developer's predecessor made an Irrevocable Offer to Dedicate to the City as part of the 1990s approval(s) of CityPlace shopping center, which was not exercised by the City until now, per the determination of the Director of Public Works in conjunction with Public Works review of this project.

Affordable Housing Units

The project is subject to the City's Inclusionary Housing Ordinance. For-rent projects submitted for first approval in 2022 are required to provide six percent (6%) of the units in the residential development to be available at an affordable rent to very low-income

households. For this project, consisting of 900 units total, 54 units are required to be affordable at the Very Low Area Median Income level. The developer will be required to guarantee the provision of these affordable units for a period of 55 years through a restrictive covenant. The affordable units are evenly distributed among the project's buildings and among the floors in each building, as depicted on page A0-6 of plans. The affordable units consist of studio, one-bedroom, and two-bedroom units, also evenly distributed between these unit types in each building. The following table summarizes the provision of affordable units in this project:

Table 3: Affordable Unit Summary

| Building | B | C1 | C2 | Size (sq. ft.) |
|--------------------|----------|-----------|-----------|-----------------------|
| Affordable studios | 6 | 8 | 6 | 490–532 |
| Affordable 1-bdrs | 5 | 6 | 5 | 647–705 |
| Affordable 2-bdrs | 6 | 8 | 6 | 1,011–1,100 |
| Total per building | 17 | 22 | 17 | |

Vesting Tentative Parcel Map

The applicant also requests approval of a Vesting Tentative Parcel Map to subdivide the parcel on which Buildings C1 and C2 will be located. The parcel will be subdivided from one 170,736-square-foot lot into two lots of 101,724 and 68,712 square feet, to provide a separate lot for each building (Attachment C– Vesting Tentative Parcel Map No. 83693). Building B will be located on a single existing parcel, which is not part of the requested subdivision.

Downtown Plan Standards and Compliance

The site configuration is well-planned, with adequate vehicular circulation and many elements that enhance the pedestrian-friendliness of the development and surrounding area. One major element is the proposed through-block paseo between 5th Street and 6th Street, which will be a major improvement to the current situation on 6th Street, which currently consists of a block-long impenetrable building wall from Pine Avenue to Long Beach Blvd. The closure of The Promenade North between 4th Street and 5th Street also functions well to enhance the pedestrian activation of the area while providing traffic calming.

The buildings are designed in a contemporary architectural style with traditional design elements and themes. Materials include cast-in-place concrete walls, aluminum panels, steel panels, brick veneer, perforated metal panels, aluminum lattice, clear and spandrel glazing, and areas of stucco on upper floors. The three buildings share a complementary and harmonious style and are consistent with the general trend of high-quality architecture and development in large projects in downtown Long Beach.

The Downtown Plan includes design standards for mid-rise development that encourage a high-quality architecture and materials, an active streetscape, pedestrian paseos, well-planned building massing and variation, and transit amenities. The project effectively uses a combination of these features that, with the building form, creates a well composed project that meets the intent of PD-30. The interaction between the ground floor street and paseo facades, ground-level units and commercial space, and upper building elements meet and read as a cohesive design to the near and distant viewer. The Downtown Plan also sets forth both guiding principles and mobility goals, and Staff finds that the project conforms to and furthers these goals, as applicable, through its use of mid-rise construction, high quality architecture, dense development, and the project's location at the heart of Downtown adjacent to the Metro A Line (formerly Blue Line).

Staff finds that the project complies with the requirements of the Downtown Plan, is consistent with the General Plan, and forwards the City's planning goals by accomplishing and implementing major policies of the Housing Element, Land Use Element, Mobility Element, and Urban Design Element. The project will create a walkable environment with new residential units that significant further the City's housing goals. Staff has made positive findings (Attachment D – Findings) and has included appropriate conditions of approval to ensure the project's and City's goals are met and standards are maintained (Attachment E – Conditions of Approval).

PUBLIC HEARING NOTICE

A notice of public hearing was mailed on January 4, 2023, in accordance with the requirements of Chapter 21.21 of the Long Beach Municipal Code. No public comments in response to these notices were received at the time the report was prepared.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and the State CEQA Guidelines, this project was analyzed as part of the previously-certified Downtown Plan Program Environmental Impact Report (PEIR). An EIR Addendum (EIRA-02-22) was prepared for this project. The EIR Addendum analyzed the proposed project in accordance with the Downtown Plan PEIR (SCH No. 2009071006) and determined that the project will not result in any new significant impacts that exceed those analyzed in the Downtown Plan PEIR, with mitigation measures included (Attachment F – EIR Addendum EIRA-02-22 and Appendices). Additionally, the development is subject to the Downtown Plan PEIR Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program (MMRP). The MMRP is designed to ensure compliance with adopted mitigation measures during project implementation. For each mitigation measure recommended in the PEIR that applies to the applicant's proposal, specifications are made that identify the action required and the monitoring that

CHAIR AND PLANNING COMMISSIONERS

January 19, 2023

Page 10 of 10

must occur. In addition, the party for verifying compliance with individual mitigation measures is identified.

Respectfully submitted,



SCOTT KINSEY, AICP
PROJECT PLANNER

ALEXIS OROPEZA
CURRENT PLANNING OFFICER



ALISON SPINDLER-RUIZ, AICP
PLANNING BUREAU MANAGER



CHRISTOPHER KOONTZ, AICP
DIRECTOR OF DEVELOPMENT SERVICES

CK:ASR:AO:SK

Attachments: Attachment A – Location Map
Attachment B – Plans
Attachment C – Vesting Tentative Parcel Map No. 83693
Attachment D – Findings
Attachment E – Conditions of Approval
Attachment F – Addendum to Downtown Plan Program EIR