AGENDA ITEM No. 3



June 28, 2022

CHAIR AND CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSIONERS City of Long Beach California

RECOMMENDATION:

Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish 34 square feet of existing floor area to accommodate the proposed construction of a 137 square foot single-story rear addition to a single-family residence. The property is located at 2556 E. 3rd Street, in the R-2-A Zoning District. The existing dwelling is a contributor to the Bluff Heights Historic District. (District 2)

APPLICANT: Miriam Tinajero 10242 Parkinson Ave Whittier, CA 90605 (Application No. COAC2204-01)

THE REQUEST

The applicant requests approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish 34 square feet of existing floor area to accommodate an addition to the rear of an existing one-story single-family residence.

BACKGROUND

The subject property is located on the southwest corner of East 3rd Street and Wisconsin Avenue (Attachment A – Vicinity Map), within the R-2-A zone (Two-family Residential with Accessory Second Unit). The property is improved with a 1918 one-story, 1,354 square foot "L"-shaped single-family residence and 252 square foot detached garage, on a 4,400 square foot lot. The property is a contributor to the Bluff Heights Historic District.

The existing residence was designed in a Craftsman architectural style. Its exterior is clad in multiple finish materials common to this architectural style, including horizontal wood siding, wood shingles and brick accents on the porch piers and chimney. The front gable roof centered at the front porch is covered in brown composition shingles and accented by exposed rafters and a decorative attic vent. A smaller roof gable is located above a wing to the right of the porch. All windows are original and consist of one fixed 6-over-1 sash wood window and tripartite (5-over-1 double-hung window flanked by smaller 4-over-1 wood double-hung sash. along the front façade, and 6-over-1 and 1-over-1) double-hung windows. A 15-light glazed wood door is located within the front porch.



CHAIR AND CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION June 28, 2022 Page 2 of 4

The west elevation is defined by 6-over-1 double-hung sash window, followed by an 8-over-1, a small fixed sash, paired 1-over-1 double-hung (centered below a small gable projection in the roofline, a small 1-over-1 and paired 1-over-1 double-hung sash (wider than other windows). In addition, the residence has decorative vertical attic vents under each roof gable.

The east elevation is defined by two 8-over-1 double-hung sash flanking, a brick chimney, two 16/1 double-hung sash flanking a fixed 8-over-1 fixed sash, paired 1-over-1 double-hung sash, followed by larger paired 1-over-1 double-hung sash, topped by a small gable within the roofline.

The rear tertiary (south) elevation is defined by a gable roof with decorative attic grill, and a shed roofed projecting wing, to its right. Fenestration consists of one 1-over-1 wood double-hung sash, a smaller 1-over-1 sash (within the small projection,) and another 1-over-1 wood double-hung sash of the same size furthest to the left. The proposed addition is at this façade.

The residence is well preserved and retains most of the original Craftsman features. (Attachment B – Photographs)

ANALYSIS

The applicant has proposed a 137 square-foot addition, to the rear of the existing dwelling. Although the project is under 250 square feet of new construction, the proposed project requires approval of the Cultural Heritage Commission (CHC) due to its visibility from public right-of-way from Wisconsin Avenue as the property is a corner lot with two street frontages. In order for approval to be granted, the project must comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and meet the criteria for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

<u>PROPOSAL</u>

The project will maintain an appropriate building scale compatible with the context of both the Bluff Heights Historic District and the immediate block which consists of primarily one-story buildings and a mixture of architectural styles along East 3rd Street and Wisconsin Avenue.

The proposed addition is consistent and fully compliant with the City's residential development standards for the R-2-A zoning district, the City's historic Design Guidelines, and the Bluff Heights Historic District Design Guidelines, and the Craftsman Style Guide.

The Design Guidelines for the Bluff Heights Historic District provides direction for rear additions, indicating state that an addition to the rear of the residence is acceptable, provided that the addition is "sensitively designed and is not highly visible from the public right-of-way...and compatible with the historic character of the residence, should not envelop or be larger overall than the existing building, and should not be wider than the existing footprint or taller than the existing roofline." The remaining of the structure, specifically the front façade, will not be structurally altered and will maintain its original historic appearance. The applicant is also proposing a new color palette. The new paint will complement the character of the residence

CHAIR AND CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION June 28, 2022 Page 3 of 4

by providing appropriate earth tone colors. The color palette is illustrated as part of the renderings in Attachment 'C'. Additionally, the paint selections have been included as part of the Conditions of Approval in Attachment 'E'.

<u>COMPATIBILITY</u>

The overall height of the existing primary residence is approximately 15 feet - 11 inches and will not be altered. As proposed, the rear addition will be setback approximately 67 feet - 5 inches from the front property line, 11 feet -1 5/8 inches from the streetside property line, 16 feet - 11 ½ inches from the interior side property line, and 30 feet -11 inches from the rear property line. The proposed addition will not be wider than the existing footprint and will use compatible exterior materials, including horizontal wood siding, wood shingle cladding, and Class 'A' composition shingles to match existing conditions.

The addition will also incorporate double-hung wood windows and a wood exterior Dutch door consistent in design with the architectural style of the residence. Furthermore, the addition will not envelop or be designed to be taller than the existing roofline as the rear addition will be designed to 2 feet 11 inches lower than the overall height of the existing residence as measured from the roof ridgeline (Attachment C – Plans).

In accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 9 states the new addition will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. As proposed, the addition meets all current zoning regulations, the Craftsman Style Guide and the Bluff Heights Historic District Design Guidelines (Attachment D – Findings).

Standard No. 9. also states that "new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features…" While the proposed onestory, 137 square-foot addition will incorporate consistent materials and elements compatible with existing in order to maintain the original Craftsman architectural style character, to differentiate between the old and the new as required from the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the addition is proposed to be stepped in and the siding will be of a different width, as conditioned, to ensure it is visually distinguishable from the original residence.

The proposed rear addition is compatible in design, height, scale, massing and the overall context of the Bluff Heights Historic District.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff has analyzed the proposed project and has determined that the project meets the requirements set forth in Title 21 of the City's Zoning Code, Section 2.63.080 (Cultural Heritage Commission) of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code, the Secretary of the Interiors' Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, the Craftsman Style Guide, and the recent adopted California Heights Historic District Design Guidelines.

With Standard Conditions, staff supports approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness request to demolish 34 square feet of existing floor area, to accommodate the proposed 137 square-foot addition to the rear of an existing single-family residence. All the findings can be made in the affirmative for the proposed improvements, as these improvements are compatible in overall scale, massing, proportions, materials and colors to the architectural style of the existing structure on the property and in the context of the District. Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness subject to the conditions of approval (Attachment E - Conditions of Approval).

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

This project has been reviewed for compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Based on that assessment, the City has determined the project to be Categorically Exempt from the provisions of CEQA pursuant to the provisions of Article 19 Section 15303 (a) (new construction) of the CEQA Guidelines. No further environmental review is required.

PUBLIC HEARING NOTICE

Public notices were distributed on June 10, 2022. As of this date, no public correspondence has been received in response to this project.

Respectfully submitted,

IRVING ANAYA PROJECT PLANNER

ANDREA URBAS, AICP CEP CUD ACTING ADVANCE PLANNING OFFICER

ASR:AU:AP:ia

Attachments: Attachment A – Vicinity Map Attachment B – Photographs Attachment C – Plans Attachment D – Findings Attachment E – Conditions of Approval

ALEJANDRO PLASCENCIA PRESERVATION PLANNER

ALISON SPINDLER- RUIZ, AICP ACTING PLANNING BUREAU MANAGER