

**CITY OF LONG BEACH
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 15, 2014
333 W. OCEAN BLVD., 7TH FLOOR
CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ROOM, 8:00 AM**

Charles Hicks Jr., President
Lawrence Keller, Vice President
Jonathan Gotz, Commissioner
Jeanne Karatsu, Commissioner
Carolyn M. Smith Watts,
Commissioner



Tara M. McLean, Acting Executive
Director

FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES

ROLL CALL

Commissioners Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu,
Present: Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller

OTHERS PRESENT:

Tara M. McLean, Acting Director & Secretary
Melinda George, Deputy Director
Marilyn Hall, Executive Assistant
Gary Anderson, Deputy City Attorney
Salvador Ambriz, Personnel Analyst
Debbie McCluster, Personnel Analyst
Caprice McDonald, Personnel Analyst
Robert Pfingsthorn, Personnel Analyst
Lourdes Ferrer, Personnel Analyst
Donna de Araujo, Personnel Analyst
Ken Walker, Personnel Operations Manager, Human
Resources

1. 14-001CS

Recommendation to approve minutes:

Regular Meeting of December 18, 2013

Dismissal Hearing 30-D-1213 Minutes of December 11, 2013

Dismissal Hearing 31-D-1213 Minutes of December 18, 2013

Special Meeting Minutes of October 23, 2013

Consideration of Hearing Officer's Report Suspension Appeal 03-S-1213

Minutes of October 23, 2013

A motion was made by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to approve recommendation for the regular meeting minutes of December 18, 2013. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu and Lawrence Keller

Abstain: 1 - Charles Hicks

A motion was made by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Gotz, to approve recommendation for Dismissal Appeal 30-D-1213 hearing minutes of December 11, 2013. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu and Lawrence Keller

Abstain: 1 - Charles Hicks

A motion was made by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Commissioner Keller, to approve recommendation for Dismissal Appeal 31-D-1213 hearing minutes of December 18, 2013. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu and Lawrence Keller

Abstain: 1 - Charles Hicks

A motion was made by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Gotz, to approve recommendation for special meeting minutes of October 23, 2013. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Jonathan Gotz, Jeanne Karatsu and Lawrence Keller

Abstain: 2 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts and Charles Hicks

A motion was made by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Gotz, to approve recommendation for Consideration of Hearing Officer's Report Suspension Appeal 03-S-1213 minutes of October 23, 2013. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Jonathan Gotz, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller

Abstain: 2 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts and Jeanne Karatsu

CONSENT CALENDAR (2-6)

Passed The Consent Calendar

A motion was made by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to approve Consent Calendar Items. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller

2. 14-002CS

Recommendation to approve examination results:

Assistant Administrative Analyst - 796 Applied, 188 Qualified

Buyer (Established 1/6/14) - 57 Applied, 26 Qualified

Department Librarian - 10 Applied, 10 Qualified

Registered Nurse (Established 12/20/13) - 51 Applied, 51 Qualified

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

3. 14-003CS

Recommendation to receive and file retirements:

*Monte Beard/Customer Service Representative/Financial Management
(33 yrs., 9 mos.)*

*Helen Gonzales/Accounting Technician/Financial Management
(35 yrs., 7 mos.)*

Mark Veit/Firefighter/Fire (27 yrs., 17 days)

*Elizabeth Battle/Communications Center Supervisor/Fire
(27 yrs., 10 mos.)*

Bradley Liebeck/Fire Captain/Fire (27 yrs, 3 mos.)

Terry Barber/Office Automation Analyst/Harbor (13 yrs., 5 mos.)

Nancy Paradise/Department Librarian/Library (11 yrs., 8 mos.)

Julio Hernandez/Maintenance Assistant/Parks (20 yrs., 1 mo.)

Donald Flowers/Carpenter/Parks (14 yrs., 9 mos.)

Lynne Holland/Accounting Clerk/Parks (14 yrs., 3 mos.)

Victor Thrash/Police Officer/Police (24 yrs., 11 mos.)

Tyrone Anderson/Police Officer/Police (23 yrs., 2 mos.)

Richard Birdsall/Police Officer/Police (23 yrs., 5 mos.)

Dennis Sullivan/Special Services Officer/Police (34 yrs., 3 mos.)

Jennifer Leupp/Special Services Officer/Police (18 yrs., 8 days)

Jose Yarruhs/Police Corporal/Police (27 yrs., 9 mos.)

Dwain Andrews/Refuse Operator/Public Works (12 yrs., 2 mos.)

Edward Dominquez/Welder/Public Works (23 yrs., 10 mos.)

Grant Du/Business Systems Specialist/Water (15 yrs., 5 mos.)

Constantin Popescu/Communication Specialist/Water (15 yrs., 6 mos.)

On behalf of the Commission, the Secretary presented a Certificate of Appreciation to Helen Gonzales in recognition of 35 years of dedicated service to the City. A representative from her department was present to speak on her behalf.

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

4. 14-004CS

Recommendation to receive and file resignations:

Marcy Cox/Public Safety Dispatcher/Police (22 yrs., 6 mos.)

Vanessa Cervantes/Laboratory Assistant/Health (9 mos., 27 days)

Marie McIntyre/Park Naturalist/Parks (18 yrs., 5 mos.)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

5. 14-005CS **Recommendation to schedule hearings:**
Suspension Hearing 34-S-1213 - Suggested Date February 26, 2014
Reduction Appeal 35-R-1213 - Suggested Date March 5, 2014
- A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

REGULAR AGENDA

6. 14-006CS **RECOMMENDATION FOR PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENT -**
Jorge Reyes, General Maintenance Assistant
*Communication from George Chapjian, Director of Parks, Recreation
and Marine*
- A motion was made by Commissioner Karatsu, seconded by Commissioner Keller, to approve recommendation in accordance with Civil Service Commission Policy 1.02 and Section 43 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by the following vote:**
- Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller**
7. 14-007CS **RECOMMENDATION FOR PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENT -**
Pamela Cunningham, Marina Supervisor
*Communication from George Chapjian, Director of Parks, Recreation
and Marine*
- A motion was made by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Gotz, to approve recommendation in accordance with Civil Service Commission Policy 1.02 and Section 43 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by the following vote:**
- Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller**

8. 14-008CS **RECOMMENDATION FOR PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENT -**
Ali Safieddine, Accounting Clerk
Communication from Margaret Huebner, Director of Human Resources, Harbor
- A motion was made by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Commissioner Gotz, to approve recommendation in accordance with Civil Service Commission Policy 1.02 and Section 43 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by the following vote:**
- Yes:** 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller
9. 14-009CS **RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENTS-** Elisa Calderon, Recycling Specialist, Faalao Tufuga, General Maintenance Assistant and Paul VanDyk, Traffic Engineering Associate
Staff report prepared by Tara M McLean, Acting Executive Director
- A motion was made by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Gotz, to approve recommendation to extend provisional appointments for 90 days to allow staff sufficient time to conduct the examinations, in accordance with Section 49 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by the following vote:**
- Yes:** 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller
10. 14-010CS **RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATION -** Laura Nguyen, General Librarian
Communication from Glenda Williams, Director of Library Services
- A motion was made by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Commissioner Keller, to approve recommendation to extend probation for 522 hours, in accordance with Section 41(2) of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations and Section 1.01 of the Civil Service Commission Policies and Procedures. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu,
Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller

11. 14-011CS

**RECOMMENDATION TO PROTEST DISQUALIFICATION FROM
EXAMINATION - Ambulance Operator**

- a. Communication from Oscar Castor
- b. Communication from Adam Fedele
- c. Communication from Matthew Mizushima
- d. Staff report prepared by Donna deAraujo, Personnel Analyst

Oscar Castor, Adam Fedele and Matthew Mizushima were present and addressed the Commission.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Keller, seconded by
Commissioner Gotz, to deny. The motion carried by the following
vote:**

Yes: 4 - Jonathan Gotz, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and
Lawrence Keller

No: 1 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts

12. 14-012CS

RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE EXTENSION OF EXPIRING ELIGIBLE LISTS (6 months):

Staff report prepared by Tara M. McLean, Acting Executive Director

Ambulance Operator (3 months)

Business Systems Specialist (3 months)

Emergency Medical Educator (1/9/13 & 1/31/13)

General Maintenance Supervisor

Housing Specialist

Microbiologist

Office Systems Analyst

Oil Field Gauger

Parking Control Checker

Personnel Assistant

Plan Checker - Fire Prevention (7/3/13 & 7/17/13)

Plan Checker - Plumbing

Public Health Nurse Supervisor

Public Safety Dispatcher - Lateral

Senior Plumbing Inspector

Supervisor - Facilities Maintenance

Traffic Engineer

A motion was made by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to approve recommendation to extend expiring eligible lists for six months with the exception of Ambulance Operator and Business Systems Specialist, to be extended for three months. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller

13. 14-013CS

RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE BULLETINS

Staff report prepared by Tara M. McLean, Acting Executive Director

Clerk/Clerk Typist

Office Automation Analyst

Telemetering Instrument Technician

Traffic Engineering Associate

A motion was made by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Karatsu, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu,
Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller

14. 14-014CS

RECOMMENDATION FOR CONSIDERATION OF HEARING

OFFICER'S REPORT - Suspension Appeal 23-S-1213 (Mailed to CSC
on 12/6/13)

Report prepared by Linda Krieger, Attorney at Law

**A motion was made by Commissioner Keller, seconded by
Commissioner Karatsu, to approve recommendation for Hearing
Officer's Report for subject appeal, conducted on November 13,
2013 . The motion carried by the following vote:**

Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu,
Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller

15. 14-015CS

RECOMMENDATION FOR CONSIDERATION OF HEARING

OFFICER'S REPORT - Reduction Appeal 28-R-1213 (Mailed to CSC on
12/11/13)

Report prepared by Dolores Martin, Attorney at Law

**A motion was made by Commissioner Keller, seconded by
Commissioner Karatsu, to approve recommendation for Hearing
Officer's Report for subject appeal , conducted on December 6,
2013. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu,
Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller

MANAGERS' REPORT

The Secretary informed the Commission that staff is prioritizing examinations with the information received from departments regarding their priorities. Staff is also working on prioritizing classifications that are on hold and testing to clear the backlog as soon as possible, and looking at ways to streamline the process with departments' assistance to clear the backlog up as soon as possible.

Commissioner Smith Watts requested that the Secretary prepare a grid of the progress with the test/examination backlog for the Commission.

Melinda George, Deputy Director, thanked Lourdes Ferrer, Personnel Analyst, for the outstanding work she did in conducting the Assistant Administrative Analyst examination and staff assistance. She stated that it was a long process and City departments provided lots of assistance.

Commissioner Keller, on behalf of the Commission, also thanked Ms. Ferrer for the excellent job she did in the administration of the Assistant Administrative Analyst examination.

DISCUSSION ON REQUIREMENTS FOR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR – CIVIL SERVICE

Commissioner Keller informed the Commission that he worked with Ken Walker, Manager, Personnel Operations, Human Resources, on providing recruitment firms to conduct a search for the Executive Director of Civil Service. He stated that a firm has been selected and that the Commission will be meeting to discuss the requirements for an Executive Director at its next meeting. He also stated that the process should take about two to three months.

Commissioner Hicks requested that this be placed on the February 5, 2014 agenda as a closed session.

President Hicks thanked Commissioner Keller for his work on the search for an Executive Director and Commissioners Smith Watts and Gotz for their efforts in meeting with staff regarding their concerns.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business before the Commission, President Hicks adjourned the meeting.

**CITY OF LONG BEACH
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 5, 2014
333 WEST OCEAN BLVD., 7TH FLOOR
CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ROOM, 8:00 AM**

Charles Hicks Jr., President
Lawrence Keller, Vice President
Jonathan Gotz, Commissioner
Jeanne Karatsu, Commissioner
Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Commissioner



Tara M. McLean, Acting Executive Director

FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES

ROLL CALL

OTHERS PRESENT:

Tara McLean, Acting Executive Director & Secretary
Marilyn Hall, Executive Assistant
Christina Checel, Principal Deputy City Attorney
Ken Walker, Manager Personnel Operations, Human Resources

Commissioners Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu,
Present: Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller

1. 14-016CS

Recommendation to approve minutes:

Regular Meeting of January 15, 2014

A motion was made by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Vice President Keller, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller

CONSENT CALENDAR (2-6):

Passed The Consent Calendar

A motion was made by Vice President Keller, seconded by Commissioner Karatsu, to approve Consent Calendar Items. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller

2. 14-017CS

Recommendation to approve examination results:

Ambulance Operator - 304 Applied, 140 Qualified

Clerk Supervisor - 11 Applied, 4 Qualified

Community Information Specialist (1-23-14) - 127 Applied, 23 Qualified

Department Librarian - 5 Applied, 5 Qualified

Senior Equipment Operator - Crane - 1 Applied, 1 Qualified

Survey Technician - 102 Applied, 20 Qualified

Traffic Engineering Associate - 169 Applied, 138 Qualified

The Secretary informed the Commission that approval of the Ambulance Operator was contingent upon the action taken on the protest of examination item for Ambulance Operator on today's agenda.

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

3. 14-018CS

Recommendation to receive and file retirements:

Erin Sullivan/Port Security System Operator III/Harbor (31 yrs., 26 days)

Nadja Grays/Customer Service Representative III/LBGO (33 yrs., 5 mos.)

Steven Parker/Fire Engineer/Fire (23 yrs., 11 mos.)

Elizabeth Crossley/Special Services Officer III/Harbor (8 yrs., 7 mos.)

Rory Arrollado/Special Services Officer III/Airport (24 yrs., 7 mos.)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

4. 14-019CS

Recommendation to receive and file resignations:

Benedict Adelman/Ambulance Operator/Fire (4 mos., 20 days)

James Martin/Police Officer/Police (7 mos., 11 days)

Avelino Alberto/Building Services Supervisor (14 yrs., 24 days)

Justin Pennington/Civil Engineering Assistant/Water (3 yrs., 5 mos.)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

5. 14-020CS **Recommendation to schedule hearings:**
Suspension Appeal 03-S-1314, Suggested Date April 2, 2014
Dismissal Appeal 02-D-1314, Suggested Date April 23, 2014
- A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**
6. 14-021CS **Recommendation to reschedule for hearings:**
Suspension Appeal 21-S-1213, Suggested Date May 7, 2014
Dismissal Appeal 29-D-1213, Suggested Date April 30, 2014
- A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

REGULAR AGENDA

7. 14-022CS **RECOMMENDATION FOR PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENT** - Brian Lam, Safety Specialist
Communication from Margaret Huebner, Director of Human Resources, Harbor
- A motion was made by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Vice President Keller, to approve recommendation in accordance with Civil Service Commission Policy 1.02 and Section 43 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by the following vote:**
- Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller**
8. 14-023CS **PROTEST OF WRITTEN EXAMINATION ITEM** - Ambulance Operator
Staff report prepared by Donna deAraujo, Personnel Analyst
- A motion was made by Commissioner Karatsu, seconded by Commissioner Gotz, to approve staff's recommendation of protested question. The motion carried by the following vote:**
- Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller**

9. 14-024CS

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE EXTENSION OF EXPIRING
ELIGIBLE LISTS (6 months):**

Staff report prepared by Tara M. McLean, Acting Executive Director
Emergency Medical Educator (2/6/13; 2/15/13; 2/28/13)
Office Services Assistant
Plan Checker - Fire Prevention
Public Safety Dispatcher - Lateral

**A motion was made by Commissioner Karatsu, seconded by Vice
President Keller, to approve recommendation. The motion carried
by the following vote:**

**Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu,
Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller**

10. 14-025CS

RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE BULLETINS:

Staff report prepared by Tara M. McLean, Acting Executive Director
Battalion Chief
Fire Captain
Marina Supervisor
Safety Specialist

Fire Department staff thanked Civil Service staff for conducting the Fire
Captain and Battalion Chief examinations concurrently.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by
Vice President Keller, to approve recommendation. The motion
carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu,
Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller**

NEW BUSINESS

The Commission introduced Norm Roberts of Roberts Consulting Group Inc., who will be conducting the recruitment for the Executive Director of Civil Service. Mr. Roberts provided the Commission with an update on the proposed recruitment process, estimated timeline and drafted bulletin. He stated that he would like to interview the leading candidates, and conduct the final interview the latter part of April 2014, after which he would provide the names to the Commission. He also provided the Commission with suggestions on creating an interview panel, indicating however, that the final decision should be made by the Commission.

President Hicks requested that an item be placed on the February 19, 2014, Commission's agenda to discuss the process it will use to construct and interview panel for the Executive Director.

MANAGERS' REPORT

The Secretary provided the Commission with an update on the Customer Service Representative examination, stating that over 3500 applications were received, and as a result, staff is currently conducting five examination sessions of 600 applicants at the Convention Center, two yesterday, February 4, 2014, and three today February 5, 2014. She thanked the Development Services, Long Beach Gas and Oil, Harbor, Human Resources and Public Works Departments for providing staff assistance. She also stated that over 2600 applications have been received for the Clerk/Clerk Typist examination. She informed the Commission that staff is working on strategies to promote online application, which will include placing two computers in the lobby to provide access to applicants, and that staff is looking into ways to minimize the application intake. She also informed the Commission that some departments have placed kiosks at various work locations to provide computer access to employees who don't normally have computer access. Civil Service will be requesting that departments allow employees to use these kiosks, on their own time, to file applications on-line.

Vice President Keller thanked Ms. McLean for the lead she is taking in looking at strategies to streamline processes and innovative ways of conducting business with departments.

COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission’s jurisdiction.

Stacey Lewis, Assistant Director of Human Resources, Harbor, thanked the Secretary for looking into ways to streamline the application process. She stated that streamlining the process would eliminate the necessity to have all staff at an examination site, which would lessen the impact on other departments when there is a need to contact staff.

11. 14-026CS

REQUEST FOR A HEARING:

Communication from James E. Trott, Attorney at Law

Christian Checél, Commission's Advisor, stated that the Commission does not have jurisdiction over this matter, however the appellant is allowed to appeal, which will be conducted through the Human Resources Department.

A motion was made by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Commissioner Gotz, to recess to a Closed Session, pursuant to Government Code 54957.8. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller

ADJOURNMENT

CITY OF LONG BEACH
PLANNING COMMISSION
MINUTES

THURSDAY, JANUARY 16, 2014
333 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD
COUNCIL CHAMBER, 5:00 PM

Donita Van Horik, Chair
Alan Fox, Vice Chair



Becky Blair, Commissioner
Molly Campbell, Commissioner
Mark Christoffels, Commissioner
Phil Saumur, Commissioner
Melani Smith, Commissioner

FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER (5:04 PM)

At 5:04 p.m., Chair Van Horik called the meeting to order.

ROLL CALL (5:04 PM)

Commissioners Alan L. Fox, Donita Van Horik, Becky Blair, Mark Christoffels and
Present: Molly Campbell

Commissioners Phillip Joseph Saumur and Melani Smith
Absent:

Also present: Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services; Jeff Winklepleck, Acting Planning Administrator; Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney; Mark Hungerford, Planner; Cuentin Jackson, Planner; Steven Valdez, Planner; Scott Kinsey, Planner; Heidi Eidson, Bureau Secretary.

FLAG SALUTE (5:05 PM)

Commissioner Blair led the flag salute.

MINUTES (5:05 PM)

14-001PL Recommendation to receive and file the Planning Commission minutes of December 19, 2013.

A motion was made by Commissioner Christoffels, seconded by Commissioner Campbell, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Alan L. Fox, Becky Blair, Donita Van Horik, Mark Christoffels and Molly Campbell

Absent: 2 - Phillip Joseph Saumur and Melani Smith

DIRECTOR'S REPORT (5:05 PM)

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, provided the Director's Report.

Amy Bodek responded to queries from Chair Van Horik.

Amy Bodek responded to a query from Commissioner Blair.

PRESENTATION (5:11 PM)

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, introduced Health Department staff.

Susan Price, Community Health Bureau Manager, Health and Human Services Department, provided a presentation regarding the HEAL Zone and Healthy Corner Stores Program.

Susan Price and Shawna Stevens, Family Health Education Center Coordinator, responded to queries from Commissioner Blair.

Commissioner Blair spoke.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

Susan Price responded to a query from Commissioner Christoffels.

Susan Price responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

SWEARING OF WITNESSES (5:25 PM)

Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the evidence you shall give in this Planning Commission Meeting shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth.

REGULAR AGENDA (5:25 PM)

1. 14-002PL Recommendation to approve Tentative Parcel Map No. 72561 and accept Categorical Exemption CE 13-110 in conjunction with the subdivision of a 16,200-square-foot parcel into two 8,100-square-foot parcels at 4418 Faculty Avenue in the R-1-N zoning district. (District 5) (Application No. 1311-12)
- Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, introduced Mark Hungerford, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.
- Mark Hungerford responded to a query from Commissioner Blair.
- Michael Young, applicant, spoke.
- Michael Young responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.
- Teja Field provided public comment.
- Susan Beasley provided public comment.
- Mark Hungerford responded to a query from Commissioner Blair.
- Commissioner Blair spoke.
- Jeff Winklepleck, Acting Planning Administrator, responded to queries from Commissioner Christoffels.
- Chair Van Horik spoke.
- Mark Hungerford responded to queries from Chair Van Horik.
- Jeff Winklepleck responded to queries from Chair Van Horik.
- Commissioner Blair spoke.
- Chair Van Horik spoke.
- Commissioner Fox spoke.
- Amy Bodek responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

A motion was made by Commissioner Blair, seconded by Commissioner Campbell, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Alan L. Fox, Becky Blair, Donita Van Horik, Mark Christoffels and Molly Campbell

Absent: 2 - Phillip Joseph Saumur and Melani Smith

2. 14-003PL

Recommendation to deny an appeal and uphold the Zoning Administrator's decision to approve a Site Plan Review request to modify an existing wireless telecommunications site by replacing three panel antennas, adding three Remote Radio Units (RRU's) and one new equipment cabinet in conjunction with a Local Coastal Development Permit at 1506 E. Broadway. (District 5) (Application No. 1307-18)

Jeff Winklepleck, Acting Planning Administrator, introduced Cuentin Jackson, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Melissa Cotugno, appellant, spoke.

Norm MacLeod, applicant, spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Christoffels and Norm MacLeod.

Jeff Winklepleck responded to queries from Chair Van Horik.

Jeff Winklepleck responded to queries from Commissioner Christoffels.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

A motion was made by Commissioner Blair, seconded by Commissioner Christoffels, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Alan L. Fox, Becky Blair, Donita Van Horik, Mark Christoffels and Molly Campbell

Absent: 2 - Phillip Joseph Saumur and Melani Smith

3. 14-004PL Recommendation to approve a Modification to a previously approved Conditional Use Permit to add car title and signature loan services to an existing payday loan facility at 6640 Cherry Avenue in the Community Commercial Automobile-Oriented (CCA) zoning district. (District 9) (Application No. 1311-03)

Jeff Winklepleck, Acting Planning Administrator, introduced Steven Valdez, Project Planner, who provided the staff report.

Steven Valdez responded to queries from Chair Van Horik.

Jeff Winklepleck responded to a query from Commissioner Christoffels.

Jeff Winklepleck responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

A motion was made by Commissioner Christoffels, seconded by Commissioner Blair, to approve the recommendation with the modification to Condition No. 7 to include prohibiting the storage of vehicles that have been confiscated. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Alan L. Fox, Becky Blair, Donita Van Horik, Mark Christoffels and Molly Campbell

Absent: 2 - Phillip Joseph Saumur and Melani Smith

4. 14-005PL Recommendation to approve a Conditional Use Permit and a Local Coastal Development Permit for the establishment of a new AT&T wireless telecommunications facility at 1227 E. Ocean Boulevard in the R-4-R zoning district, and receive Categorical Exemption CE 13-098. (District 2) (Application No. 1310-12)

Jeff Winklepleck, Acting Planning Administrator, introduced Scott Kinsey, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Christoffels, Jeff Winklepleck, and Scott Kinsey.

A dialogue ensued between Chair Van Horik and Scott Kinsey.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

Commissioner Blair spoke.

Commissioner Campbell spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Christoffels and Michael Mais.

Jeff Winklepleck responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

Commissioner Campbell spoke.

Tim Miller, applicant, spoke.

Lupita Sanchez-Cornejo, applicant, spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Christoffels and Tim Miller.

Tim Miller responded to queries from Chair Van Horik.

Duane Stanfeld provided public comment.

Chair Van Horik responded to comments made by Duane Stanfeld.

Duane Stanfeld spoke.

Jeff Winklepleck responded to queries from Chair Van Horik.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

Chair Van Horik responded to a query from Amy Bodek.

Michael Mais spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Christoffels.

Michael Mais responded to queries from Commissioner Campbell.

Commissioner Blair spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Blair.

Commissioner Blair spoke.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

A motion was made by Commissioner Christoffels, seconded by Commissioner Blair, to approve the recommendation with an amendment to Condition No. 6 stating that the antenna screening enclosure shall not be expanded or modified in any fashion unless the applicant or any subsequent carrier first submits an application to the Department of Development Services and the applicant undergoes an appropriate administrative process in accordance with the zoning regulations of the City of Long Beach including a historic assessment if appropriate, and CEQA review as appropriate. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Becky Blair, Donita Van Horik, Mark Christoffels and Molly Campbell

No: 1 - Alan L. Fox

Absent: 2 - Phillip Joseph Saumur and Melani Smith

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (7:05 PM)

There was no public comment.

COMMENTS FROM THE PLANNING COMMISSION (7:06 PM)

There were no comments from the Planning Commission.

ADJOURNMENT (7:06 PM)

At 7:06 p.m., Chair Van Horik adjourned the meeting.

hge