

EXHIBIT G
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
HP 18-512
FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS
635 LOMA AVENUE

ANALYSIS:

In regards to Section 2.63.080 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (the Standards):

The subject site, 635 Loma Avenue, is located within the Belmont Heights Historic District, which was established in 2002 (C-7802). The property is currently improved with a 1,077-square-foot single-story home and detached 357-square-foot garage. The home's architectural style is Craftsman and was originally constructed in 1922.

In regards to Section 2.63.080 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (the Standards), staff has analyzed the proposed project and the project does not meet these requirements and those of the City's zoning codes.

FINDINGS: (from Section 2.63.080(D) of the Long Beach Municipal Code)

- 1. (It) will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic feature of the Landmark or subject property within the Landmark District and that issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness is consistent with the spirit and intent of this chapter.**

The proposed project would adversely affect significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic features of the subject property. The proposed scope of work would not be consistent with the recommendations of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

The properties to the north and south of the subject site, within the Belmont Heights Historic District, all feature one-story primary structures, with only two residential properties to the north having a second story, and all of these second story structures are located in the rear of the property. On the opposite side of Loma Avenue, five of eleven total residences have second stories, and only two of these properties have a second story on the primary residence. While the second floor step back would provide a transition in massing from the adjacent homes, the new second story would be highly visible from the public right-of-way (Loma Avenue). The new second floor will maintain a front setback of 32 feet from the front property line and an overall height of 25-feet measured from top of curb to the midpoint of the ridge of the new roof.

The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 2 addresses the historic character of a property. The proposed addition (first and

second story) would remove and replace the original roofline of the structure. In addition to the modifications of historic features, the overall spatial relationship of site would affect the historic character of the property. The new second story would be highly visible from the public right-of-way (Loma Avenue) and would not be compatible with the scale and massing established for the primary residence or the predominate scale and massing of the surrounding neighborhood.

The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 9 addresses the new additions, exterior alterations, or new construction as they relate to historic materials. The new addition will modify the historic roofline established for the property in order to accommodate the new second story. The proposed massing of the addition would diminish the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 10 addresses the form and integrity of new additions or construction with relationship to the historic property. The new second story addition would be structurally integrated into the design of the primary dwelling. Therefore, the second story addition would result in the permanent modification of the essential form and integrity of the historic building. The new second story would not allow for the removal of the proposed addition without impairing the form and integrity of the historic building.

The proposed project will meet the required floor area ratio, lot coverage, open space, yard, and height requirements applicable in the R-1-N District.

2. (It) will remedy any condition determined to be immediately dangerous or unsafe by the Fire Marshal and/or Building Official.

There are no active code enforcement cases or dangerous conditions at this site. Thus, this finding is not applicable.

3. (It) will comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines for Preservation, Rehabilitating, Restoring, and Reconstructing Historic Buildings.

The proposed addition would not be consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

- Use – The existing use is a single-family residence consisting of a one-story structure. The new addition would consist of an expansion of the existing single-family (primary) dwelling. Therefore, the addition (residential) would continue to be used as it was historically.
- Character – The applicant is proposing to apply historically-accurate materials throughout the restoration of the existing home and the propose new additions and features. Proposed changes include replacing all non-

period windows and doors with historically accurate all-wood elements, restoring tapered columns on the front porch to be more accurate to the traditional Craftsman architectural style, and replacing horizontal wood siding to match the existing cladding.

The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 2 addresses the historic character of a property. Under this standard, the removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided. The proposed addition (first and second story) would remove the original roofline towards the rear of the structure. The new second story would be approximately 32 feet from the front property line and highly visible from the public right-of-way (Loma Avenue). In addition, the new second story would maintain a mid-point ridge height of 25 feet. Therefore, the proposed improvements would not be compatible in scale and massing to the primary residence, adjacent properties, and other buildings in the District.

- Changes to Historic Features – The proposed improvements would match existing materials and styles found on the primary structure. However, several historic features will be removed including the clipped gable roofline, the closing of 17 existing window opening, and the overall single-story scale intended for the original home.
- Historic Significance – The existing one-story primary dwelling is a contributing structure in the Belmont Heights Historic District. The proposed second story addition would have the potential to change the historic significance of the property, which has acquired historic significance in its own right. The highly visible second story addition (32 feet from front property line) would have the potential to affect the integrity of the district in the vicinity of the properties along Loma Avenue.
- Distinctive Features – The proposed improvements would change the height of the existing contributing structure. The existing clipped gable roofline would be removed in order to accommodate the addition of the new second story. Furthermore, the existing historic height of the residence of 19 feet, would be increased to 25 feet on primary residence.
- Deteriorated Historic Features – Based on the assessment of staff, the existing front porch columns were likely modified from their original Craftsman tapered form to be simple square posts in the 1960s or 1970s. This proposal seeks to restore the front porch columns to be more historically accurate to the Craftsman architectural style. Additionally, the applicant is proposing to replace all non-historically appropriate windows and doors with all-wood period appropriate windows and doors.
- Damage to Historic Materials – The new addition would not include chemical or physical treatments that would cause damage to historic

materials. The proposed exterior finishes and materials would be consistent with this requirement.

- Archeological Resources – Any archeological resources found will be protected and preserved. No resources are known. No major excavations or grading is proposed.
- Historic Materials that Characterize the Property – Materials to be maintained or replaced include horizontal wood siding, and wood windows throughout, which would enhance the remaining character defining features still intact on the primary residence.

As previously noted, the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 2 requires retaining and preserving historic materials or features and spaces that characterize a property. The new addition will modify the historic roofline established for the one-story primary dwelling in order to accommodate the new second story.

The new second floor would feature a step back on the east elevation to differentiate the new from the old. The 367-square-foot first-floor addition would be flush with the existing north and south elevations, which would not clearly differentiate new from the old.

- Form and Integrity – The new addition (first and second story) would be structurally integrated into the primary dwelling. The addition would not be undertaken in a manner that would allow for its removal without impairment of the essential form and integrity of the historic property.

The proposed addition, including the new second story, has a size, scale, and profile larger than the scale of the existing residence. The addition is highly visible from the public right-of-way and would not be generally compatible with the context of the structures adjacent to the subject site in the Belmont Heights Historic District.

4. (It) will comply with the Design Guidelines for Landmark Districts, for a property located within a Landmark District.

The subject property is contributing property within the Belmont Heights Historic District. The Design Guidelines for the Belmont Heights Historic District require that projects comply with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. As proposed, improvements would include a new second story located 32 feet from the front property line. The proposed addition would be highly visible from the public right-of-way (Loma Avenue).

The Guidelines further recommend that the size and massing of the upper story addition should be compatible with the historic character of the residence. In addition, the Guidelines state, "Additions shall be compatible in materials and

design, and shall be subordinate in scale, to the existing building.” While the new second story would incorporate a step back along the east elevation, the addition will be highly visible and would span the full width of the building. The overall massing of the proposed addition would substantially alter the context of the historic property with relation to the adjacent structures in the historic district.

The project would alter and remove the historic roofline from the original residence, which was built in 1922. The historic character of the primary structure would be highly modified from its historic context with the proposed addition to the first and second story.