

**CITY OF LONG BEACH  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, MAY 7, 2014  
333 W. OCEAN BLVD., 7TH FLOOR  
CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ROOM, 8:00 AM**

Lawrence Keller, President  
Jonathan Gotz, Vice President  
Charles Hicks Jr., Commissioner  
Robin Perry, Commissioner  
Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Commissioner



Tara M. McLean, Acting Executive Director

---

## **FINISHED AGENDA & MINUTES**

### **ROLL CALL**

Tara M. McLean, Acting Director & Secretary  
Melinda George, Deputy Director  
Marilyn Hall, Executive Assistant  
Gary Anderson, Deputy City Attorney  
Salvador Ambriz, Personnel Analyst  
Debbie McCluster, Personnel Analyst  
Caprice McDonald, Personnel Analyst  
Robert Pfingsthorn, Personnel Analyst  
Lourdes Ferrer, Personnel Analyst  
Donna de Araujo, Personnel Analyst  
Ken Walker, Personnel Operations Manager, Human Resources

**Commissioners** Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry, Jonathan Gotz, Lawrence  
**Present:** Keller and Charles Hicks

1. 14-083CS

**Recommendation to approve minutes:**

*Regular Meeting of April 16, 2014*

*Dismissal Appeal 29-D-1213, Hearing Minutes of April 30, 2014*

**A motion was made by Vice President Gotz, seconded by  
Commissioner Hicks, to approve recommendation. The motion  
carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 5 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry, Jonathan Gotz,  
Lawrence Keller and Charles Hicks**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to approve recommendation for Dismissal Appeal 29-D-1213 Hearing Minutes of April 30, 2014. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry, Jonathan Gotz, Lawrence Keller and Charles Hicks

**CONSENT CALENDAR (2-9)**

Passed The Consent Calendar

A motion was made by Vice President Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to approve Consent Calendar Items. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry, Jonathan Gotz, Lawrence Keller and Charles Hicks

**2. 14-084CS**

**Recommendation to approve examination results:**

*Accounting Clerk - 411 Applied, 195 Qualified*

*Department Librarian (Amended from March 5, 2014) - 65 Applied, 8 Qualified*

*Fire Captain - 35 Applied, 12 Qualified*

*Maintenance Assistant (Amended from April 24, 2014) - 1003 Applied, 980 Qualified*

*Public Safety Dispatcher (Established April 24, 2014) - 13 Applied, 13 Qualified*

*Real Estate Project Coordinator - 32 Applied, 4 Qualified*

*Senior Equipment Operator - Crane (Amended) - 10 Applied, 1 Qualified*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

3. 14-085CS

**Recommendation to receive and file retirements:**

*Jill Shabica/Public Safety Dispatcher IV/Fire (33 yrs., 7 mos.)*

*Fredo Chapa/General Maintenance Assistant/Harbor  
(6 yrs., 11 mos.)*

*Rafael Gomez/Maintenance Assistant/ Parks (25 yrs., 5 mos.)*

*Deborah Christian/Clerk Typist III/Police (35 yrs., 3 mos.)*

*Portia Howard/Clerk Typist III/Police (31 yrs., 10 mos.)*

*Gregory Brown/Refuse Operator II/ Public Works (29 yrs., 9 mos.)*

*Albert Pearce/Water Utility Mechanic III/Water (20 yrs., 5 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

4. 14-086CS

**Recommendation to receive and file resignations:**

*Joseph Cookston/Traffic Signal Technician I/Public Works (5 days)*

*Alisia Mejia/Public Health Nurse III/Health (11 yrs., 4 mos.)*

*Joshua Kessler/Police Officer/Police (10 mos., 13 days)*

*Wilmer Soriano/Police Officer/Police (10 mos. 24 days)*

*Munny Nunez/Clerk Typist III/Police (17 yrs., 6 mos.)*

*Daniel Axe/Water Utility Mechanic II/Water (7 yrs., 4 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

5. 14-087CS

**Recommendation to approve transfer:**

*Jeffrey Litzinger/Special Services Officer III/Police to Special  
Services Officer IV/Airport*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

6. 14-097CS

**Recommendation to approve downgrade (Voluntary):**

*Rob Robledo/Refuse Operator II/Public Works to Refuse Operator  
I/Public Works*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

7. 14-088CS

**Recommendation to schedule hearings:**

*Dismissal Appeal 05-D-1314, Suggested Dates August 6 & 13, 2014*

*Suspension Appeal 07-S-1314, Suggested Date August 20, 2014*

*Suspension Appeal 21-S-1213, Suggested Date August 27, 2014*

*Reduction Appeal 08-R-1314, Suggested Date September 3, 2014*

*Dismissal Appeal 10-D-1314, Suggested Date September 17, 2014*

*Dismissal Appeal 11-D-1314, Suggested Date September 24, 2014*

*Dismissal Appeal 12-D-1314, Suggested Date October 1, 2014*

*Suspension Appeal 06-S-1314, Suggested Date August 22, 2014*

*Suspension Appeal 43-S-1213, Suggested Date August 28, 2014*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

8. 14-089CS

**Recommendation to reschedule hearings:**

*Suspension Appeal 12-S-1213, Suggested Date July 25, 2014*

*Dismissal Appeal 40-D-1213, Suggested Date July 30, 2014*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

9. 14-090CS

**Recommendation to receive and file withdrawal of appeal:**

*Reduction Appeal 22-R-1213*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

**REGULAR AGENDA**

10. 14-091CS

**RECOMMENDATION FOR PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENTS -**

Jennifer Farinas, Davinder Gill, Shashank Patil, Allison Yoh, Port Planners

*Communication from Margaret Huebner, Director Of Human Resources, Harbor*

**This CS-Agenda Item was withdrawn.**

11. 14-092CS

**RECOMMENDATION TO TRANSFER FROM UNCLASSIFIED  
AMBULANCE OPERATOR TO CLASSIFIED AMBULANCE  
OPERATOR - *Alisha Albanese***

- a. Communication from Michael A. DuRee, Fire Chief
- b. Communication from Alisha Albanese

David Honey, Manager of Fire Administration was present to answer Commission questions.

**A motion was made by Vice President Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Perry, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 5 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry, Jonathan Gotz, Lawrence Keller and Charles Hicks**

12. 14-093CS

**RECOMMENDATION TO RETURN PROBATIONARY EMPLOYEE  
TO THE CIVIL ENGINEER ELIGIBLE LIST - *Stephen Liao***

- a. Communications from Margaret Huebner, Director of Human Resources, Harbor
- b. Staff report prepared by Salvador Ambriz, Personnel Analyst

Margaret Huebner, Director of Human Resources, Harbor was present to answer Commission questions.

**A motion was made by Vice President Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Perry, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 5 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry, Jonathan Gotz, Lawrence Keller and Charles Hicks**

13. 14-094CS

**RECOMMENDATION TO CHANGE EXAMINATION PLAN - Real Estate Project Coordinator**

*Staff Report prepared by Caprice McDonald, Personnel Analyst*

Russ Ficker, Administrative Analyst, Public Works was present to answer Commission questions.

**This CS-Agenda Item was approved recommendation.**

**Yes: 5 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry, Jonathan Gotz, Lawrence Keller and Charles Hicks**

14. 14-095CS

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE EXTENSION OF EXPIRING  
ELIGIBLE LISTS (6 months):**

*Staff report prepared by Tara M. McLean, Acting Executive Director*

Aquatics Supervisor  
Emergency Medical Educator  
Gas Construction Worker  
Gas Field Service Representative  
License Inspector  
Mechanical Engineering Associate  
Personnel Analyst  
Plan Checker - Fire Prevention (5/15/13; 5/30/13)  
Planner  
Port Financial Analyst  
Police Recruit  
Public Health Nutritionist  
Public Safety Dispatcher - Lateral  
Recreation Assistant  
Registered Nurse  
Senior Equipment Operator - Crane

**A motion was made by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Vice  
President Gotz, to approve recommendation. The motion carried  
by the following vote:**

**Yes: 5 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry, Jonathan Gotz,  
Lawrence Keller and Charles Hicks**

15. 14-096CS

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE BULLETIN**

*Staff report prepared by Tara M. McLean, Acting Executive Director*  
Senior Surveyor

**A motion was made by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by  
Vice President Gotz, to approve recommendation. The motion  
carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 5 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry, Jonathan Gotz,  
Lawrence Keller and Charles Hicks**

**NEW BUSINESS**

President Keller stated that with the help of many senior managers in the City, the Commission has located and recruited the new Executive Director for the Civil Service Department. He introduced Kandice Taylor-Sherwood as the newly appointed Executive Director. He stated that Ms. Sherwood is coming from the City of Anaheim Human Resources Department, and will be starting in early June 2014.

**MANAGERS' REPORT**

Melinda George, Deputy Director acknowledged the Commission's concerns regarding a one week filing of popular job bulletins. She informed the Commission that over 400 applications were received for Accounting Clerk with almost 200 qualifying; and over 500 applications were received for the Police Property & Supply Clerk, both with a one week filing period. Ms. George commended Rob Pfingsthorn, Personnel Analyst and staff for their excellent work on the Fire Captain examination, and that the results were on today's agenda. She stated that staff worked very closely with the Fire Department administering this examination, and that Fire Engineer is the next examination staff will be conducting for the Fire Department.

The Secretary stated that she is continuing to keep departments informed of the status of Civil Service Department examinations, and that staff will be sending out another priority request to departments to provide an update on their priorities. She also informed the Commission that she would be meeting with the Budget Office to discuss the Civil Service Budget.

**COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission's jurisdiction.**

Rob Pfingsthorn, Personnel Analyst, thanked Ms. George for her acknowledgement, and thanked staff, the Fire Department and Technology Service, for their assistance with the Fire Captain examination.

Dave Segura, Deputy Fire Chief, also thanked Mr. Pfingsthorn and Civil Service staff for the opportunity to work with them on the recent Fire Captain examination and the excellent job they did in the administration of the examination.

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the City Clerk Department at (562) 570-6101, 72 hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung ang nakasulat na pagsasalín-wika ng adyenda at mga katitikan ng Komisyon ay hinahangad para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles mangyaring gawin ang iyong kahilingan sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Kagawaran ng Klerk ng Lunsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 pitong oras bago ang pulong ng Komisyon.

Si desea obtener la traducción lingüística escrita de la agenda y las actas de la Comisión para las personas que no hablan inglés, realice su pedido por teléfono al Departamento de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas antes de la reunión de la Comisión.

បើលោកអ្នកមិនចេះនិយាយភាសាអង់គ្លេស ហើយត្រូវការរបៀបវារៈនៃកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មាធិការ និងរបាយការណ៍នៃកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មាធិការ ជាសំណៅប្រែសម្រួលលាយលក្ខណ៍អក្សរទៅជា ភាសារបស់លោកអ្នក នោះសូមស្នើសុំមកនាយកដ្ឋានសៀវភៅសាលាក្រុង តាមទូរស័ព្ទលេខ (562) 570-6101 អោយបាន 72 ម៉ោងមុនកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មាធិការត្រូវប្រារព្ធធ្វើឡើង។



**CITY OF LONG BEACH  
PLANNING COMMISSION  
MINUTES**

**THURSDAY, MAY 1, 2014  
333 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD  
COUNCIL CHAMBER, 5:00 PM**

Donita Van Horik, Chair  
Alan Fox, Vice Chair



Molly Campbell, Commissioner  
Mark Christoffels, Commissioner  
Phil Saumur, Commissioner  
Melani Smith, Commissioner

---

## **FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES**

### **CALL TO ORDER (5:05 PM)**

At 5:05 p.m., Chair Van Horik called the meeting to order.

### **ROLL CALL (5:05 PM)**

**Commissioners** Phillip Joseph Saumur, Donita Van Horik, Mark Christoffels and  
**Present:** Molly Campbell

**Commissioners** Alan L. Fox and Melani Smith  
**Absent:**

Also present: Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services; Jeff Winklepleck, Acting Planning Administrator; Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney; Angie Zetterquist, Planner; Craig Chalfant, Planner; Heidi Eidson, Bureau Secretary.

### **FLAG SALUTE (5:06 PM)**

Commissioner Christoffels led the flag salute.

### **MINUTES (5:06 PM)**

14-027PL Recommendation to receive and file the Planning Commission minutes of April 17, 2014.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Campbell, seconded by Commissioner Saumur, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Donita Van Horik and Molly Campbell

**Abstain:** 1 - Mark Christoffels

**Absent:** 2 - Alan L. Fox and Melani Smith

**DIRECTOR'S REPORT (5:06 PM)**

There was no Director's Report given.

**SWEARING OF WITNESSES (5:07 PM)**

Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the evidence you shall give in this Planning Commission Meeting shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth.

**REGULAR AGENDA (5:07 PM)**

1. 14-028PL Recommendation to approve a Conditional Use Permit (CUP) request to allow Type 20 (off-sale beer and wine) and Type 42 (on-sale beer and wine for public premises) alcohol licenses for a retail store described as a small boutique market featuring American-made craft beer, wine, cider, specialty snacks and gift baskets with a 21-and-over tasting event area located at 4242 Atlantic Avenue within the Neighborhood Pedestrian District (CNP) zone and accept Categorical Exemption 14-010. (District 8) (Application No. 1402-03)

Jeff Winklepleck, Acting Planning Administrator, introduced Angie Zetterquist, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Jeff Winklepleck responded to a query from Commissioner Saumur.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Jeff Winklepleck responded to queries from Chair Van Horik.

Jeff Winklepleck responded to a query from Commissioner Saumur.

Jeff Winklepleck responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

Dawn Nadeau, applicant, spoke.

Dawn Nadeau responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Saumur and Dawn Nadeau.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

Commissioner Christoffels responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Christoffels, seconded by Commissioner Campbell, to approve the recommendation with an amendment to Condition of Approval No. 9 to change the tasting size from 3 ounces to 4.5 ounces. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Donita Van Horik, Mark Christoffels and Molly Campbell

**Absent:** 2 - Alan L. Fox and Melani Smith

#### STUDY SESSIONS (5:25 PM)

2. 14-029PL Conduct a Study Session regarding the Pacific Pointe East development project. (District 5)

Jeff Winklepleck, Acting Planning Administrator, introduced Craig Chalfant, Project Planner, who presented the study session item.

Craig Chalfant responded to queries from Commissioner Christoffels.

Jeff Winklepleck responded to a query from Commissioner Christoffels.

Patrick Russell, Sares Regis Group, applicant, discussed the project.

Patrick Russell responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Saumur and Patrick Russell.

Jeff Winklepleck spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Craig Chalfant responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

Jeff Winklepleck responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, responded to a query from Commissioner Christoffels.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to a comment made by Commissioner Christoffels.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

Craig Chalfant introduced Joe Power, Environmental Consultant from Rincon.

Joe Power spoke.

Joe Power responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

see media  
3. 14-023PL

Review and discuss Planning Commission bylaws.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, discussed the Planning Commission bylaws.

Michael Mais responded to queries from Commissioner Christoffels.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, spoke.

Michael Mais responded to queries from Chair Van Horik.

Michael Mais spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Campbell and Chair Van Horik.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Michael Mais spoke.

Commissioner Campbell spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Amy Bodek and Commissioner Campbell.

Michael Mais spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to comments made by Commissioner Saumur.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

Michael Mais responded to comments made by Commissioner Christoffels.

Amy Bodek spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Christoffels.

Commissioner Campbell spoke.

Chair Van Horik responded to comments made by Commissioner Campbell.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Chair Van Horik and Michael Mais.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Michael Mais responded to comments made by Commissioner Saumur.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to comments made by Chair Van Horik.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to comments made by Commissioner Christoffels.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Christoffels and Michael Mais.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Chair Van Horik and Michael Mais.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to comments made by Commissioner Saumur.

Amy Bodek responded to a query from Commissioner Christoffels.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Commissioner Christoffels responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

**PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (5:56 PM)**

(Item taken out of order)

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Frank Lozando provided public comment.

Larry Goodhue provided public comment.

Dan O'Leary provided public comment.

Gail Mitke provided public comment.

KC Allen provided public comment.

**COMMENTS FROM THE PLANNING COMMISSION (7:07 PM)**

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, responded to comments made by Commissioner Christoffels.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, spoke.

**ADJOURNMENT (7:10 PM)**

At 7:10 p.m., Chair Van Horik adjourned the meeting.

hge



NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Development Services Department at (562) 570-6194 or (562) 570-5794, 72 hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung ang nakasulat na pagsasalin-wika ng adyenda at mga katitikan ng Komisyon ay hinahangad para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles mangyaring gawin ang iyong kahilingan sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Kagawaran ng Mga Serbisyong Pagpapaunlad sa (562) 570-6194, (562) 570-5794, 72 pitong oras bago ang pulong ng Komisyon.

Si desea obtener la traducción lingüística escrita de la agenda y las actas de la Comisión para las personas que no hablan inglés, realice su pedido por teléfono al Departamento de Servicios de Desarrollo al (562) 570-6194, (562) 570-5794, 72 horas antes de la reunión de la Comisión.

បើលោកអ្នកមិនចេះនិយាយភាសាអង់គ្លេស ហើយត្រូវការរបៀបវារៈនៃកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មាធិការ និងរបាយការណ៍នៃកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មាធិការ ជាសំណៅប្រែសម្រួលលាយលក្ខណ៍អក្សរទៅជាភាសារបស់លោកអ្នក នោះសូមស្នើសុំមកនាយកដ្ឋានសេវាអភិវឌ្ឍន៍ តាមទូរស័ព្ទលេខ (562) 570-6194, (562) 570-5794 អោយបាន 72 ម៉ោងមុនកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មាធិការត្រូវប្រារព្ធធ្វើឡើង។