CITY OF LONG BEACH CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MINUTES

WEDNESDAY, AUGUST 17, 2016 333 WEST OCEAN BLVD., 7TH FLOOR CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ROOM, 8:00 AM

Rick McGilton-McGlamery, President Phyllis Arias, Vice President



Charles Hicks Jr., Commissioner Robin Perry, Commissioner Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Commissioner

Kandice Taylor-Sherwood, Executive Director

FINISHED AGENDA & DRAFT MINUTES

ROLL CALL

Commissioners Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry, Phyllis Present: Arias and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

Kandice Taylor-Sherwood, Executive Director & Secretary Crystal Slaten, Recruitment & Selection Officer Robert Pfingsthorn, Administrative Officer Marilyn Hall, Executive Assistant Gary Anderson, Principal Deputy City Attorney Lourdes Ferrer, Administrative Analyst Debbie McCluster, Personnel Analyst Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst David Espinoza, Assistant Administrative Analyst Cynthia Stafford, Deputy Director, Human Resources

FLAG SALUTE

1. <u>16-141CS</u>

Recommendation to approve minutes:

Regular Meeting of August 3, 2016

A motion was made by Vice President Arias, seconded by Commissioner Hicks, to approve as recommendation as amended. The motion carried by the following vote:

CONSENT CALENDAR (2-6):

Passed the Consent Calendar

A motion was made by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to approve Consent Calendar Items with the exceptions of the Fire Recruit examination results under Examination Results and the Permit Center Supervisor Bulletin under Bulletins. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry, Phyllis Arias and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

2. 16-142CS

Recommendation to approve examination results:

Automatic Sprinkler Control Technician (Established 8/12/16) - 13 Applied, 10 Qualified

Capital Projects Coordinator (Established 8/0/16) - 41 Applied

Capital Projects Coordinator (Established 8/9/16) - 41 Applied, 7 Qualified

Fire Recruit (Established 8/12/16) - 2721 Applied, 1661 Qualified

Registered Nurse (Established 7/29/16) - 28 Applied, 6 Qualified

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

A motion was made by Commissioner Perry, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to pull the Fire Recruit Examination Results for discussion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Commissioner Perry informed the Commission that he was contacted by a Fire Recruit candidate with concerns about his test score for Fire Recruit. The individual indicated that he received a communication from Civil Service that he did not receive a qualifying score to be placed on the eligible list for Fire Recruit. This individual stated that he received a reading score of 76, which he assumed was a passing score since in a previous communication he received from Civil Service stated that in order to qualify you needed a reading score of 70. This caused him to be concerned about the accuracy of his results due to the discrepancy in the two scores. He indicated that he had contacted the analyst in charge of the Fire Recruit examination, who expressed to him that the reading score had been moved to a higher number, but was not told what the number was.

Commissioner Perry stated that he advised the individual that he would share the information with the Civil Service Commission.

Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst, addressed the Commission regarding these concerns, providing the Commission an explanation on how the scores were calculated.

The Secretary advised the Commission that staff will be following-up regarding the complaint, and will contact the individual with the results.

Commissioner Arias suggested that examination results with significantly large applicant pools (such as Fire Recruit or Police Recruit) be agendized separately so that staff can present information on the examination process, and so that Commission members may ask questions and discuss those items if necessary.

16-142CS

Recommendation to approve examination results:

Automatic Sprinkler Control Technician (Established 8/12/16) - 13 Applied, 10 Qualified Capital Projects Coordinator (Established 8/9/16) - 41 Applied,

Capital Projects Coordinator (Established 8/9/16) - 41 Applied, 7 Qualified

Fire Recruit (Established 8/12/16) - 2721 Applied, 1661 Qualified

Registered Nurse (Established 7/29/16) - 28 Applied, 6 Qualified

A motion was made by Commissioner Perry to table the Fire Recruit examination results until the next Commission meeting. The motion failed for lack of a second.

A motion was made by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to approve the Fire Recruit examination results. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry, Phyllis Arias and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

Commission Arias recommended that if there was an error, the list be adjusted and reviewed to make sure no other applicants were affected.

3. 16-143CS

Recommendation to receive and file bulletins:

Permit Center Supervisor

Police Recruit
Principal Building Inspector

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

A motion was made by Commissioner Perry, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to pull the Permit Center Supervisor Bulletin for discussion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Commissioner Perry requested clarification regarding the necessity to have desirable qualifications regarding bilingual skills in two separate places on the Permit Center Supervisor's bulletin. He indicated the statement is stated under "Desired Qualifications" and at the end of the bulletin in reference to the City Language Access Policy.

The Secretary informed the Commission that in this instance, it is a desirable qualification because some positions will require bilingual speaking individuals, which is different from the standard language on bulletins as defined by the City's Language Access Policy.

Cynthia Stafford, Deputy Director of Human Resources informed the Commission that this language was included in the City's Language Access Policy as adopted by City Council.

16-143CS

Recommendation to receive and file bulletins:

Permit Center Supervisor

Police Recruit
Principal Building Inspector

A motion was made by Vice President Arias, seconded by Commissioner Hicks, to approve the Permit Center Supervisor's bulletin. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Phyllis Arias and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

No: 1 - Robin Perry

4. 16-144CS

Recommendation to receive and file retirements:

Pai Wang/Senior Traffic Engineer/Harbor (15 yrs., 5 mos.) Hanzil Samad/Maintenance Assistant III/Public Works (20 yrs., 4 mos.)

Charles Maluenda/Business Systems Specialist IV/Technology & Innovation (34 yrs., 11 mos.)

Michael Decker/Special Services Officer IV/Police (26 yrs., 2 mos.)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

5. 16-145CS

Recommendation to receive and file resignations:

Lawrence Meriwether/School Guard/Police (6 yrs., 2 mos.) Rene Bojorquez/Parking Control Checker I/Public Works (1 yr., 9 mos.)

Carolyn Kellock/Customer Service Representative III/Financial Management (8 yrs., 6 mos.)

Jeffrey Martin/Clerk Typist II/Development Services (1 yr., 3 mos.)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

6. <u>16-146CS</u>

Recommendation to approve transfer:

Daniel Badajos/Public Safety Dispatcher II/Police to Public Safety Dispatcher III/Fire

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

REGULAR AGENDA

7. 16-147CS

RECOMMENDATION FOR PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENT -

Virginia Alejandrez, Safety Specialist Communication from Cynthia Stafford, Deputy Director - Human Resources

The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding this request.

Cynthia Stafford, Deputy Director, Human Resources, was present to answer Commission questions.

Commissioner Arias requested that requesting department address all items on the request forms submitted for Commission approval.

A motion was made by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Commissioner Perry, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

8. <u>16-148CS</u>

RECOMMENDATION TO REAPPOINT RESIGNED EMPLOYEE -

Salvador Villa, Police Officer

Communication from Robert G. Luna, Chief of Police

The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding this request.

Deputy Chief Mike Beckman, Long Beach Police Department, was present to answer Commission questions.

A motion was made by Commissioner Perry, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry, Phyllis Arias and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

9. 16-149CS

RECOMMENDATION FOR TRANSFER AND PERMANENT ASSIGNMENT TO FORMER CLASSIFICATION - Mony Chhey,

Accountant, Financial Management to Assistant Administrative Analyst, Airport

Communication from Dale Worsham, Administrative Officer, Airport

The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding this request.

Dale Worsham, Administrative Officer, Airport, was present to answer Commission questions.

A motion was made by Commissioner Perry, seconded by Vice President Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

10. 16-150CS

RECOMMENDATION TO CHANGE EXAMINATION PLAN - Clerk

Supervisor

Staff report prepared by Deborah McCluster, Personnel Analyst

The Secretary briefed the Commissioner regarding this request.

Commissioner Hicks address his concerns about the test being conducted by the department without a representative from Civil Service participating or observing to ensure the interviews are fair and unbiased. He stated that is the responsibility of the Commission to ensure the process is fair and equitable. He recommended that Civil Service staff be part of the Police Department interview process, or sit in as an observer of the panel.

Ms. Slaten informed the Commission that this change is recommended due to the number of vacancies, will allow the Police Department the opportunity to interview more candidates, and will eliminate a duplicate process, by having both the Civil Service and the Police Departments conduct interviews.

Commissioner Hicks stated that he is in favor of transferring the process on the condition that a representative from the Civil Service Department can be present during the interviews. In the spirit of collaboration, he recommends the Civil Service and Police Departments work together to make sure the interview process is fair and unbiased.

Cynthia Stafford, Deputy Director, Human Resources, advised the Commission that to make sure their concerns are being met, on behalf of the Police Department, they will work with Civil Service staff in order to make sure the Commission's needs are being met in the interview process.

Commissioner Aries questioned if all candidates will be apprised of the change in the process.

Deborah McCluster, Personnel Analyst, assured the Commission that all candidates would be made aware of the changes.

A motion was made by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

No: 1 - Robin Perry

NEW BUSINESS

Commissioner Perry stated that Gary Anderson, Principal Deputy City Attorney, will be participating as a judge for the Moot Court Project, at CSLB on Saturday, August 20, 2016, and invited the Civil Service, Police and Fire Departments to attend. He stated that the topic the students will be arguing is the Second Amendment Right to Bear Arms.

MANAGERS' REPORT
Recruitment & Selection
Special Projects
Administration Support Services
Executive Director

Ms. Slaten acknowledged Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst for the excellent work she did on the Fire Recruit examination. She stated that with the passage of Measure A, Civil Service is expecting more job openings, and staff is scheduled to attend several recruitment events.

On behalf of Ms. McDonald and Civil Service, Ms. Slaten acknowledged Ahmed Osman and Danielle Gallandt, Summer Interns, for the excellent work they provided to the Civil Service Department, and wished them well in their future endeavors.

The Commission also thanked them for the outstanding work they provided to the Civil Service department, and wishd them well.

Mr. Pfigsthorn informed the Commission that he and Crystal attended the Budget Hearing at City Council on Tuesday, and that Financial Management has asked that Civil Service do a budget presentation on September 6, 2016.

The Secretary informed the Commission that she has sent a formal follow-up letter, on behalf of Commissioner Hicks, regarding the status of the Special Services Officer.

COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission's jurisdiction.

Deputy Chief Chris Rowe, Fire, acknowledged Civil Service staff for the excellent service they provide and thanked them for conducting the Fire Recruit examination. He stated that they expect to hire about 48 people from the list.

Commander Alex Avila, also acknowledged Civil Service staff for the excellent service they provide to the Police Department, even when there is an immediate need.

ADJOURNMENT

CITY OF LONG BEACH CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MINUTES

WEDNESDAY, AUGUST 17, 2016 333 WEST OCEAN BLVD., 7TH FLOOR CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ROOM, 8:00 AM

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្ដីពីរបៀបវារៈ និងកំណត់ឃេតុឲ្យ អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្ដាធ្វើសំណើរអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ ការិយាល័យស្ងៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង ចាប់ផ្ដើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។ CITY OF LONG BEACH PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES

Mark Christoffels, Chair Donita Van Horik, Vice Chair Ron Cruz, Commissioner



THURSDAY, AUGUST 18, 2016 333 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD COUNCIL CHAMBER, 5:00 PM

Alan Fox, Commissioner Andy Perez, Commissioner Jane Templin, Commissioner Erick Verduzco-Vega, Commissioner

FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER (5:09)

At 5:09 p.m., Chair Christoffels called the meeting to order.

ROLL CALL (5:09 PM)

Also present: Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services; Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager; Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer; Carrie Tai, Current Planning Officer; Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney; Ira Brown, Planner; Nick Vasuthasawat, Planner; Cuentin Jackson, Planner; Heidi Eidson, Bureau Secretary.

Commissioners Ron Cruz, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega, Donita Van Present: Horik, Mark Christoffels and Alan Fox

Commissioners Andy Perez
Absent:

FLAG SALUTE (5:10 PM)

Commissioner Fox led the flag salute.

MINUTES (5:10 PM)

16-043PL

Recommendation to receive and file the Planning Commission minutes of July 21, 2016.

A motion was made by Vice Chair Van Horik, seconded by Commissioner Templin, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Ron Cruz, Jane Templin, Donita Van Horik, Mark Christoffels

and Alan Fox

Excused: 1 - Erick Verduzco-Vega

Absent: 1 - Andy Perez

DIRECTOR'S REPORT (5:11 PM)

Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, presented the Director's Report.

SWEARING OF WITNESSES (5:12 PM)

Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the evidence you shall give in this Planning Commission Meeting shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth.

STUDY SESSION (5:13 PM)

<u>16-045PL</u> Conduct a study session on SEASP.

(Commissioner Verduzco-Vega arrived at 5:15 p.m.)

Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, introduced Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer, who introduced the project consultant team.

Wendy Nowak, Placeworks, presented the Southeast Area Specific Plan study session item.

Nicole Morris, Placeworks, discussed the project Environmental Impact Report.

Wendy Nowak spoke.

Christopher Koontz spoke.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

Jan Hall provided public comment.

Bob Ladd provided public comment.

Ken Croft provided public comment.

Howard Davis, representing the Naples Improvement Association, provided

public comment.

Douglas Sprague provided public comment.

Janice Dahl provided public comment.

Dustin Batten, Los Angeles County Business Federation, provided public comment.

Linda Pemberton provided public comment.

Julie Dean provided public comment.

Anne Cantrell provided public comment.

Dave Chupa provided public comment.

Richard Roth provided public comment.

Jeff Miller provided public comment.

Mel Nutter provided public comment.

Kerrie Aley provided public comment.

Alan Songer provided public comment.

Susan Miller provided public comment.

Anna Christensen provided public comment.

Christopher Koontz spoke.

Melinda Cotton provided public comment.

Gordona Kajer provided public comment.

Elizabeth Lambe, Executive Director of the Los Cerritos Wetlands Land Trust, provided public comment.

Pat Towner provided public comment.

Andy Macaffey provided public comment.

Rebecca Caudillo Jones provided public comment.

Larry Goodhue provided public comment.

Mike Buhbe provided public comment.

Diane Sunstrom provided public comment.

Christopher Koontz spoke.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Christopher Koontz responded to a query from Commissioner Templin.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Chair Christoffels and Christopher Koontz.

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

Christopher Koontz responded to gueries from Commissioner Verduzco-Vega.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Christopher Koontz responded to queries from Commissioner Van Horik.

Jason Pak, Traffic Consultant for the project, responded to queries from Commissioner Van Horik.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Commissioner Cruz spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Cruz and Christopher Koontz.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Christopher Koontz responded to a query from Commissioner Templin.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

Christopher Koontz responded to a query from Chair Christoffels.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

REGULAR AGENDA (8:00 PM)

1. 16-044PL

Recommendation to accept Categorical Exemption 16-199 and find the projects listed in the Proposed Fiscal Year 2017 Capital Improvement Program (FY 2017 CIP) in conformity with the General Plan. (Citywide) (Application No. 1607-26)

Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, introduced Ira Brown, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Malcolm Oscarson, Budget Manager of Public Works, spoke.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Sean Crumby, Deputy Director of Public Works, responded to a query from Commissioner Templin.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Malcom Oscarson responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

Malcom Oscarson responded to a query from Chair Christoffels.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

Sean Crumby responded to a query from Chair Christoffels.

Christopher Koontz responded to a guery from Chair Christoffels.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

A motion was made by Vice Chair Van Horik, seconded by Commissioner Templin, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 6 - Ron Cruz, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega, Donita Van Horik, Mark Christoffels and Alan Fox

Absent: 1 - Andy Perez

2. 16-046PL

Recommendation to accept CE 16-012 and approve a Conditional Use Permit for a new roof-mounted telecommunication facility for

Verizon Wireless on an existing industrial warehouse, located in PD-32 Douglas Park North. (District 5) (Application No. 1601-01)

Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, presented Nick Vasuthasawat, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Brianna Noler, applicant, responded to a query from Commissioner Templin.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Nick Vasuthasawat responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Brianna Noler responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

A motion was made by Commissioner Verduzco-Vega, seconded by Commissioner Cruz, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 6 - Ron Cruz, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega, Donita Van Horik, Mark Christoffels and Alan Fox

Absent: 1 - Andy Perez

3. 16-047PL

Recommendation to approve a Site Plan Review and a Tentative Parcel Map for the construction of four 2-story office buildings with a total of 96,448 square feet and 368 parking spaces, located at the northwest corner of Lakewood Boulevard and Conant Street in the Douglas Park Planned Development South District (PD-32). (District 5) (Application No. 1606-05)

Carrie Tai, Current Planning Officer, introduced Cuentin Jackson, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Commissioner Cruz spoke.

Cuentin Jackson responded to a query from Commissioner Cruz.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Chair Christoffels and Cuentin Jackson.

Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, responded to a query from Chair Christoffels.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

Jan van Dijs, applicant, spoke.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

Jan van Dijs responded to a query from Chair Christoffels.

A motion was made by Commissioner Templin, seconded by Vice Chair Van Horik, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 6 - Ron Cruz, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega, Donita Van Horik, Mark Christoffels and Alan Fox

Absent: 1 - Andy Perez

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (8:49 PM)

There were no additional comments from the public.

COMMENTS FROM THE PLANNING COMMISSION (8:49 PM)

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

ADJOURNMENT (8:49 PM)

At 8:49 p.m., Chair Christoffels adjourned the meeting.

hge

THURSDAY, AUGUST 18, 2016 333 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD COUNCIL CHAMBER, 5:00 PM

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបវារៈ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើរអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ ការិយាល័យស្ពៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។