

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS HP12-0303
FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS**

3215 East 3rd Street and 304 Obispo Avenue

ANALYSIS:

In Compliance with Section 2.63.070 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings* (the Standards), and the Bluff Heights Historic District ordinance (Ordinance No. C-7937):

Staff has analyzed the proposed project in accordance with Chapter 2.63.070 of the Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission ordinance), the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, and the Bluff Heights Historic District ordinance. Staff has also reviewed the plans for consistency with the City's zoning codes and compliance with the R-2-A development standards and has found that the project will comply with the zoning code with approval of the requested Standards Variance for creation of the parking lot, approval by the Site Plan Review Committee to waive the requirement for open space and an over height wrought iron fence in the front yard setback, and Planning Commission approval of a reduction in the number of required parking spaces.

The proposed project involves conversion of the building that formerly housed the Immanuel Community Church constructed between 1922 and 1923, into a senior housing project consisting of 24 independent-living, low and/or very low income senior dwelling units, one manager's unit and associated amenities/common areas in 31,006 square feet. The church is a blend of Spanish Colonial Revival and Neoclassical architectural styles. The major alterations to the exterior of the church would include new light wells, door and window alterations, installation of rooftop equipment and removal of the colored opaque glass for replacement with dual pane clear glass windows.

The project also includes the removal (through either demolition or relocation) of the existing single-family home and detached garage located at 304 Obispo Avenue for construction of a parking lot to serve this project. This one story home, constructed in the early 1920's, is classified as an altered Craftsman. Although the home retains its original footprint and massing, many of the original materials have been replaced. New materials added to the home include textured stucco on the porch piers and sides of the home, replacement of wood windows with vinyl and aluminum windows, and replacement of all original exterior doors.

The church was designed by prominent Long Beach architect W. Horace Austin. The building was damaged by the 1933 Long Beach earthquake, but subsequently reconstructed in 1934. The exterior walls were originally tapestry brick and marble, but were covered with textured stucco in the early 1950's. Other alterations that have occurred to the church over the years include replacement of entry steps, railings and exterior doors, the addition of a second story exit stair on the north elevation, and significant interior building alterations. The building's overall condition is good; however, the windows are generally in poor condition, especially those on the south elevation.

The most impressive architectural feature of the church is the front entry. Classical pilasters two stories high with Corinthian capitals frame the recessed three-arched entry. Two square towers with hipped roof and deeply recessed arched windows and recessed architectural details flank the entry. A parapet wall with a decorative cornice is found on the second front facing gabled roof element setback slightly from the front elevation of the first gabled roof. A similar parapet wall is found on the two projecting front facing gabled roofs at each end of the building on the south elevation. These projections include four deeply recessed arched windows separated by classical pilasters with a Corinthian capital. The cornice detail on this elevation is more elaborate with an arched pattern on the front facing gable projections. All windows on this church are substantially recessed and include many different types of raised wood mullions patterns. The church is two stories above a semi subterranean basement and has a height of 48 feet at the highest ridge. The majority of the sloped portions of the roof are covered with red clay tile while a few portions are covered in rolled composition.

The most significant exterior alteration proposed for the church building is the removal of the colored opaque window glass for replacement with clear dual pane glass. The window material, recess detail and mullion pattern will remain the same. This change will allow light into the living units and provide visibility to the exterior, but will change the character and feel of the building. The decorative stained glass windows in the sanctuary on the north elevation of the church will remain. Other exterior changes to the church include installation of light wells, door and window alterations, new wrought iron railings and rooftop equipment.

Interior alterations to the church space call for conversion of the basement into ten residential units, seven residential units on the first floor along with the reuse of the sanctuary area as common space, and eight residential units on the second floor along with a small fitness/library area. The existing organ and associated equipment will be maintained in its current location.

The removal of the home and detached garage at 304 Obispo Avenue for construction of a 12 space surface parking lot is considered a significant and unavoidable adverse impact. The Final EIR includes mitigation measures that reduce all identified potentially significant impacts to a less than significant level except for the impact to Cultural Resources involving demolition of the single family residence. Since this residence is considered a contributor to the Bluff Heights Historic District, the Final EIR determined that loss of this contributor would constitute a slight reduction to the design integrity of this historic district and would be a significant and unavoidable adverse impact. While relocation would be preferred to demolition, no relocation site has been identified at this time within this historic district or within the City.

With the conditions of approval included in the staff report, adoption of the Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Plan, and Certification of the EIR staff believes that the project meets the requirements of Chapter 2.63.070 of the Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission ordinance) and the Bluff Heights Historic District ordinance, as well as the recommendations of the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* with exception of the loss of the home.

FACTS FOR FINDINGS: (from Section 2.63.070(D) of the Long Beach Municipal Code)

- 1. (It) will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic feature of the concerned property or of the landmark district in which it is located, is consistent with the spirit and intent of this chapter.**

The proposed alteration to the church, as conditioned, will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic features of the subject property or the historic district in which the property is located. The proposed change in the church window glass from opaque colored glass to clear dual pane glass would be the most significant aesthetic feature that would be altered. Other exterior changes include the installation of light wells on all four elevations, window and door changes on all elevations although many of the window changes will occur below or near grade for the basement units, installation of rooftop equipment with a screen wall on the south and east elevations and new wrought iron railings to protect the light wells and for the three new units that will face Obispo Avenue where the previous front entrance was located. These changes are more minor in nature and will preserve the original architecture, materials, design and massing of the church.

Removal of the home and detached garage at 304 Obispo Avenue for construction of a parking lot is considered a significant and unavoidable adverse impact. Since this residence is considered a contributor to the Bluff Heights Historic District, the Final EIR determined that loss of this contributor would constitute a slight reduction to the design integrity of this historic district and would be a significant and unavoidable adverse impact. While relocation would be preferred to demolition, no relocation site has been identified at this time within this historic district or within the City.

- 2. (It) will remedy any condition determined to be immediately dangerous or unsafe by the Fire Department or the Director of Development Services.**

There are no reported code violations on either of the properties; therefore, the existing properties are not considered dangerous or unsafe. This finding is not relevant for these particular properties.

- 3. The proposed change is consistent with or not incompatible with the architectural period of the building.**

The proposed exterior alterations to this church are generally consistent with the 1920's architectural period of construction. The proposed changes that include new light wells, door and window alterations, installation of rooftop equipment with screening, relocation of the primary entrance, and removal of the colored opaque glass in the church building for replacement with dual pane clear glass windows are generally consistent with the Spanish Colonial Revival and Neoclassical architectural styles.

4. The proposed change is compatible in architectural style with existing adjacent contributing structures in a historic landmark district.

The proposed façade changes, as conditioned, will not adversely affect the historic district or the adjacent contributing properties. A parking lot for Horace Mann elementary school is located across 3rd Street to the south; two story multifamily dwelling units are located to the east, a two story multifamily dwelling unit to the north and three single story historic homes to the west across Obispo Avenue. The proposed changes to the church for reuse as a senior housing project are compatible in architectural style with adjacent contributing structures.

Removal of the home and detached garage at 304 Obispo Avenue for construction of a parking lot is considered a significant and unavoidable adverse impact. Since this residence is considered a contributor to the Bluff Heights Historic District, the loss of this contributor would constitute a slight reduction to the design integrity of this historic district and would be a significant and unavoidable adverse impact. While relocation would be preferred to demolition, no relocation site has been identified at this time within this historic district or within the City.

5. The scale, massing, proportions, materials, colors, textures, fenestration, decorative features and details proposed are consistent with the period and/or are compatible with adjacent structures.

The exterior alterations to the church will not affect the scale, massing, or proportions, fenestrations or decorative detailing. The proposed changes to the exterior, which do not include any additions, will be with completed with compatible materials. The proposed rooftop equipment will be screened and the railing design will be required to be compatible with the architectural period of the building. The solid stucco wall proposed to screen the parking lot shall be designed with pilasters and a cap to be more compatible with the church. Substantial landscaping will also be required to better screen the parking lot from adjacent residences and public view.

6. The proposed change is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings by the U.S. Department of the Interior.

The proposed exterior changes to the church are consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The proposed window glass change and other exterior alterations such as light wells and window and door locations will be designed to be consistent with the existing features.

Removal of a contributing residence in an historic district at 304 Obispo Avenue for construction of a parking lot is considered a significant and unavoidable adverse impact that would constitute a slight reduction to the design integrity of this historic district.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

Address: 3215 East 3rd Street & 304 Obispo Avenue

Historic District: Bluff Heights Historic District

Case No. HP12-0303 (1205-01)

Date: January 14, 2013

1. This approval is for the adaptive reuse of the Immanuel Community Church to a senior housing project consisting of 24 independent low or very low income senior dwelling units, one manager's unit and associated amenities/common areas in 31,006 square feet and the removal of the home at 304 Obispo Avenue for the creation of a 12 space surface parking lot as shown on plans received by the Director of Development Services - Office of Historic Preservation dated August 31, 2012. These plans are on file in this office, except as amended herein.
2. The project must be completed per the plans approved by the Cultural Heritage Commission, including all conditions listed herein. Any subsequent changes to the project must be approved by the Cultural Heritage Commission or the Cultural Heritage Commission staff before implementing. Upon completion of the project, a Cultural Heritage Commission staff inspection must be requested by the Applicant to ensure that the approved plans have been executed and that all conditions have been implemented before OCCUPANCY hold can be released.
3. There is a ten calendar-day appeal period that will lapse at 4:30 p.m., 10 calendar days after the action by the Cultural Heritage Commission is made. Appeal of the Commission's action will not be accepted after this time. A separate fee will apply to appeal an action made by the Cultural Heritage Commission.
4. This Certificate of Appropriateness shall be in full force and effect from and after the date of the rendering of the decision by the Cultural Heritage Commission. Pursuant to the Cultural Heritage Commission Ordinance Section 2.63.070(I), this approval shall expire within one year if the authorized work has not commenced. Should the applicant be unable to comply with this restriction, an extension may be granted pursuant to Section 2.63.070(J) for an additional 12 months maximum. The applicant must request such an extension prior to expiration of this Certificate of Appropriateness. After that time, the applicant will be required to return to the Cultural Heritage Commission for approval. In addition, this Certificate of Appropriateness shall expire if the authorized work is suspended for a 180-day period after being commenced.
5. All required Planning and Building permits and variances shall be obtained by the applicant. Building permits and any required variances must be obtained prior to the implementation of any construction or rehabilitation work. Separate plan check and permit fees will apply.

6. Any changes to the plans reviewed by the Cultural Heritage Commission and staff will need prior approval by the Director of Development Services or applicable staff before implementation. Significant changes to the project's design will require review and approval by the Cultural Heritage Commission before permits are issued by the Director of Development Services.
7. The Certificate of Appropriateness is valid for one (1) year from the date of issuance. It may be extended by the City's Director of Development Services or their designee upon request by the applicant prior to the date of expiration.
8. The applicant shall comply with all Mitigation Measures of the applicable Environmental Impact Report (EIR 12-01). These mitigation measures must be printed on all plans submitted for plan review.

9. Mitigation Measure CR-1 (a): 304 Obispo Avenue Documentation Report.

In consultation with the Planning Bureau of the Long Beach Development Services Department, a historic preservation professional qualified in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards shall be selected to complete a Documentation Report on the property at 304 Obispo Avenue. The property shall be documented with archival quality photographs of a type and format approved by the City of Long Beach. This documentation, along with historical background for this property, shall be submitted to an appropriate repository approved by the City of Long Beach. The documentation reports shall be completed and approved by the City of Long Beach prior to the issuance of demolition permits.

10. Mitigation Measure CR-1 (b): Immanuel Community Church Certificate of Appropriateness.

The proposed alterations to the former Immanuel Community Church building at 3215 E. 3rd Street shall be subject to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness by the City of Long Beach Cultural Heritage Commission, which shall find that the proposed alterations conform to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness. All provisions of Ordinance C-7937, "An Ordinance of the City Council of the City of Long Beach Designating the Bluff Heights Historic Landmark District," particularly with respect to retaining and preserving all original architectural materials and design features, shall apply to this review.

11. Mitigation Measure N-1: Heavy Truck Restriction/Haul Routes.

The construction contractor shall prohibit heavy trucks from driving on either Obispo Avenue or Coronado Avenue south of East 3rd Street. Heavy trucks include all cargo vehicles with three or more axles, generally with gross vehicle weight greater than 26,400 lbs. The preferred haul route for demolition and construction materials shall be East 3rd Street to Redondo Avenue to the nearest major arterial or freeway.

12. The existing rolled composition roof on the east and north elevations shall be replaced with clay tile to match the existing tile roof as shown on page A140 of the project plans, to the satisfaction of the Director of Development Services.
13. The relocated front entry door shall be a similar design to the existing door on 3rd Street to the satisfaction of the Director of Development Services.
14. All new windows shall match the existing multi-pane wood windows with the same raised mullion pattern, sill and recess design. Prior to issuance of a building permit a plan shall be submitted that provides a window detail with profile and a window and door schedule that labels each window/door to correspond to the elevation plans.
15. The existing stained glass windows on the north elevation of the sanctuary shall remain in place and be protected during construction to the satisfaction of the Director of Development Services.
16. The wrought iron railing design shall be simplified and a flat top rail provided without spears. A new railing design shall be submitted for review and approval to the satisfaction of the Director of Development Services.
17. The applicant shall maintain the house at 304 Obispo Avenue as long as feasible in order to improve the chances of relocation. If the house cannot be relocated, then the applicant shall make the house available for architectural salvaging prior to demolition. A construction schedule with construction staging area plan shall be provided to the City with a time frame for project construction/demolition to the satisfaction of the Director of Development Services.
18. The gate for the parking lot shall be revised to reflect a more period appropriate design to the satisfaction of the Director of Development Services.
19. Any new exterior light fixtures for the church building shall be period appropriate and subject to review and approval of the Director of Development Services.
20. Parking lot lighting shall be mounted on the inside perimeter wall of the parking lot, shall not exceed 6'6" in height and shall have glare shields to prevent light and glare from shining onto adjacent properties to the satisfaction of the Director of Development Services prior to issuance of a building permit. The lights shall be shown on the elevation plans with the fixture style provided. Freestanding parking lot light poles are prohibited. A photometric study shall be provided for the parking lot lighting for review and approval by the Director of Development Services.
21. The applicant shall enhance the perimeter parking lot fence design with pilasters and a cap for review and approval by the Director of Development Services.
22. The applicant shall submit a sample of the proposed window glass for review and approval to the satisfaction of the Director of Development Services.

23. All conditions of approval must be printed verbatim on all plans submitted for plan review to Long Beach Development Services. These conditions must be printed on the site plan or a subsequent reference page.
24. If the original front doors exist, they shall be saved and reused on site. If this is not feasible, the doors shall be made available for architectural salvage to the satisfaction of the Director of Development Services.
25. The applicant shall request from the Public Works Department a permit to establish a loading and unloading zone adjacent to the front entrance on 3rd Street prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy.
26. The applicant shall comply with the City Noise Ordinance, Section 8.80 of the Long Beach Municipal Code.
27. The applicant shall provide an enhanced landscape plan for the project to the satisfaction of the Director of Development Services.
28. The ground mounted transformer shall not be located in the required front yard setback of the parking lot or within the existing yard area between the building and both street property lines.