

Susana Gonzalez Edmond, President
Heather Morrison, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner
Brandon Dowling, Commissioner
Joel Garnica, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

FINISHED AGENDA AND DRAFT MINUTES

**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETINGS ARE HELD VIA
TELECONFERENCE PURSUANT TO EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20
ISSUED BY GOVERNOR GAVIN NEWSOM.**

THE CIVIC CHAMBERS WILL BE CLOSED TO THE PUBLIC.

President Gonzalez Edmond called the meeting to order at 8:33 a.m.

FLAG SALUTE

President Gonzalez Edmond asked Vice President Morrison to lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joel Garnica, Heather
Present: Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

- 1. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – PUBLIC WILL HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS THE COMMISSION BY SUBMITTING WRITTEN COMMENTS VIA EMAIL TO MARLA.CAMERINO@LONGBEACH.GOV.**

Ms. Pizarro Winting read a comment from Padric Gleason Gonzales regarding the screening of candidates for positions within the City.

Ms. Pizarro Winting read a comment from Erik Maitland, Michael Hallinan, Christopher Stuart and Robert Molinar, regarding a previously expressed concern about working out of

classification.

2. [20-262CS](#) **Recommendation to approve minutes:**
Special Meeting of September 9, 2020
Regular Meeting of September 16, 2020

A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve the Special Meeting Minutes from September 9, 2020 and the Regular Meeting Minutes from September 16, 2020. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

At this time, the Commission approved reordering the agenda to bring forward Agenda Item 13 - Presentation on the Racial Inequity and Reconciliation Initiative.

CONSENT CALENDAR (3 – 12):

President Gonzalez Edmond and Commissioner Garnica pulled Agenda Items 3, 7 and 8 for discussion.

Passed the Consent Calendar

A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve Consent Calendar Items (4-6 and 9-12), except for Agenda Items 4, 7 and 8. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

3. [20-263CS](#) **Recommendation to approve examination results:**
Environmental Health Specialist Test #03 (Established 09/23/20)

Hazardous Materials Specialist Test #02 (Established 09/23/20)
Licensed Vocational Nurse Test #01 (Established 09/30/20)
Public Safety Dispatcher - NTN EXAM Test #15 (Established 09/23/20)
Public Safety Dispatcher - POST WAIVER Test #17 (Established 09/24/20)
Water Treatment Supervisor (Established 10/01/20)
PROMOTIONAL

President Gonzalez Edmond wanted to know if the results for the Public Safety Dispatcher - NTN examination was typical because some of the categories appear to have high numbers. Ms. Kerr-Jenkins explained that some applicants do not follow through with the process or applicants who do take the exam do not pass. She stated that staff is doing their due diligence to reach out to applicants to complete the processes for this exam.

A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Vice President Morrison, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

4. [20-264CS](#) **Recommendation to approve bulletin(s):**
Equipment Operator
Motor Sweeper Operator

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

5. [20-265CS](#) **Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):**
Luis Ortiz, Garage Service Attendant II, Harbor Department (19 yrs., 6 mos.)
Jeffrey Walker, Refuse Operator III, Public Works Department (31 yrs., 29 days)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

6. [20-266CS](#) **Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):**
Douglas Donnenfield, Police Officer, Police Department (7 yrs., 3 mos.)
Maquech Lizarraga, Ambulance Operator, Fire Department (3 mos., 28 days)
Sandy Ryan, Public Health Nutritionist I, Department of Health and Human Services (2 yrs., 2 mos.)
Janette Tapia, Clerk Typist I, Department of Health and Human Services (1 mo., 5 days)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

7. [20-267CS](#) **COVID-19 RELATED: Recommendation to Extend Non-Career Hours - Emiliano Uranga, Refuse Operator I Non-Career**
Communication from Russ Ficker, Administrative Officer, Department of Public Works
Staff report prepared by Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst

Commissioner Garnica noticed that the department is only requesting an extension of 50 hours and wanted to know if that is all that is needed to complete the assignment. Ms. Pizarro Winting responded that the employee only needs 50 hours to get him through to his anniversary date. She stated that once he reaches his anniversary date, his hours will begin counting over. It was mentioned that this same idea applies to other requests for extension of non-career hours on today's agenda.

This discussion is applicable to Agenda Item 8.

A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

8. [20-268CS](#) **COVID-19 RELATED: Recommendation to Extend Non-Career Hours - Francheska Deras, Administrative Intern**

Non-Career
*Communication from Jodie Griner, Administrative Officer,
Department of Health and Human Services
Staff report prepared by Elsa Ramos, Personnel Analyst*

A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

9. [20-269CS](#)

COVID-19 RELATED: Recommendation to Extend Non-Career Hours - Regina Macias-Overholt, Administrative Analyst Non-Career
*Communication from Jodie Griner, Administrative Officer,
Department of Health and Human Services
Staff report prepared by Elsa Ramos, Personnel Analyst*

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

10. [20-270CS](#)

Recommendation for Transfer and Permanent Assignment to Former Classification - Agnes Agua, Accounting Clerk III
*Communication from Sandra Kennedy, Administrative Officer,
Department of Financial Management
Staff report prepared by Desiree Davalos, Personnel Analyst*

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

11. [20-271CS](#)

Recommendation for Transfer and Permanent Assignment to Former Classification - Roger Santos, Special Services Officer III-Armed
*Communication from Stacey Lewis, Director of Human Resources, Harbor Department
Staff report prepared by Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst*

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

12. [20-272CS](#)

Recommendation to Approve Extension of Expiring Eligible Lists (6 months)

Staff report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

*Assistant Administrative Analyst (E03AN-19) Test #01 (1/24/2019) **3 Months****

*Assistant Administrative Analyst (E03AN-19) Test #02 (2/28/2019) **3 Months****

*Assistant Administrative Analyst (E03AN-19) Test #03 (7/16/2019) **3 Months****

Business Systems Specialist (H67AN-19) Test #13 (4/30/2019)

Business Systems Specialist (H67AN-20) Test #16 (10/10/2019)

Business Systems Specialist (H67AN-20) Test #18 (4/3/2020)

Buyer (C13AN-19) Test #01 (1/22/2019)

Civil Engineer (K11NN-19) Test #05 (4/3/2019)

Civil Engineer (K11NN-20) Test #09 (10/24/2019)

Civil Engineer (K11NN-20) Test #12 (4/17/2020)

Civil Engineering Associate (K13NN-20) Test #07 (10/24/2019)

Deputy Fire Marshal (AT5NN-19) Test #01 (1/8/2019)

Deputy Fire Marshal (AT5NN-19) Test #02 (1/29/2019)

Environmental Specialist Associate (N26NN-20) Test #02 (4/3/2020)

Maintenance Assistant (JA3AN-20B) Test #02 (4/29/2020)

Maintenance Planner (NG2AN-20) (10/16/2019)

Nurse Practitioner (G12NN-19) Test #02 (10/17/2019)

Nurse Practitioner (G12NN-20) Test #05 (4/3/2020)

Office Systems Analyst (IMDBA) (ND4AN-20D) Test #03 (4/24/2020)

Office Systems Analyst (IMDCE) (ND4AN-20A) Test #09 (4/14/2020)

*Office Systems Analyst - IMDCA (ND4AN-20B) Test #04 (10/7/2019) **4 Months****

Office Systems Analyst - IMDCA (ND4AN-20B) Test #08 (4/14/2020)

Office Systems Analyst- IMDNOC (ND4AN-20C) Test #04

(4/9/2020)
Planner (F53AN-19) Test #02 (10/23/2018)
Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-19B) Test #01 (4/2/2019)
Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-20) Test #11 (4/6/2020)
Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-20) Test #12 (4/30/2020)
Police Recruit (F63NN-19) Test #08 (4/18/2019) **3 Months***
Police Recruit (F63NN-20) Test #13 (10/24/2019)
Police Recruit (F63NN-20) Test #18 (4/3/2020)
Public Health Nurse (G19AN-20) Test #01 (4/30/2020)
Public Health Nutritionist (G21AN-20) Test #03 (10/23/2019)
Public Health Nutritionist (G21AN-20) Test #05 (4/3/2020)
Public Safety Dispatcher - NTN Exam (J45AN-18A) Test #01
(4/23/2018)
Public Safety Dispatcher - NTN Exam (J45AN-20A) Test #08
(10/10/2019)
Public Safety Dispatcher - Post Waiver (J45AN-18B) Test #01
(4/23/2018)
Public Safety Dispatcher - Post Waiver (J45AN-20B) Test #08
(10/10/2019)
Refuse Operator (JA2AN-20) Test #21 (10/2/2019)
Registered Nurse (G11AN-19) Test #08 (4/3/2019)
Senior Civil Engineer (K52NN-20) Test #06 (5/1/2020)
Senior Program Manager - Water (MC5NN-19) Test #03
(4/29/2019)
Senior Structural Engineer (K65NN-19) Test #03 (4/2/2019)
Senior Traffic Engineer (K68NN-20) Test #04 (10/2/2019)
Special Services Officer (F33AN-18) Test #26 (4/23/2018)
Special Services Officer (F33AN-19) Test #32 (10/4/2018)
Special Services Officer (F33AN-20) Test #39 (10/3/2019)
Special Services Officer (F33AN-20) Test #42 (4/30/2020)
Structural Engineer (KA1NN-20) Test #03 (4/30/2020)
Systems Support Specialist (H69AN-18) Test #11 (4/2/2019) **5
Months***
Systems Support Specialist (H69AN-20) Test #13 (10/29/2019)
Systems Technician (H70AN-19) Test #02 (4/9/2019)
Terminal Services Representative (N43AN-20) Test #01
(4/20/2020)
Water Utility Mechanic (M42AN-20) Test #01 (4/28/2020)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

REGULAR AGENDA

13. [20-273CS](#)

PRESENTATION ON THE RACIAL INEQUITY AND RECONCILIATION INITIATIVE

Communication from Teresa Chandler, Deputy City Manager and Katie Balderas, Equity Officer, Office of the City Manager

Ms. Chandler and Ms. Balderas provided an overview of the Racial Inequity and Reconciliation Initiative.

A discussion ensued with President Gonzalez Edmond, Vice President Morrison, Commissioner Arias, Commissioner Dowling, Commissioner Garnica, Ms. Chandler and Ms. Balderas regarding the information that was presented. There will be follow up with the Civil Service Commission standing committee's addressing this issue.

A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to receive and file the presentation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

14. [20-274CS](#)

COVID-19 RELATED: RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY PERIOD - Frederick Howard, Garage Service Attendant I

Communication from Sandra Kennedy, Administrative Officer, Department of Financial Management

Staff report prepared by Desiree Davalos, Personnel Analyst

President Gonzalez Edmond informed the Commission that this is a COVID-19 related item.

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Davalos who briefed the Commission regarding this request.

Representatives from Financial Management were on the call to answer questions.

Commissioner Arias asked if there are citywide plans or a citywide policy being developed to address probationary employees who are not able to be evaluated due to the public health emergency. Ms. Pizarro Winting responded that Human Resources looks at every request closely. She stated that conversations will take place to address each employee on a case by case basis. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that citywide plans or a policy has not been discussed; however, there are not that many outstanding extensions.

A motion was made by Vice President Morrison, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

15. [20-275CS](#)

REQUEST TO APPEAL DISQUALIFICATION FROM

EXAMINATION PROCESS - Building Services Supervisor

Communication from Rudy Pugh

Staff report prepared by Jami Kerr-Jenkins, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Kerr-Jenkins who briefed the Commission regarding this request.

Commissioner Arias would like to suggest modifications to the examination which she would like to discuss later.

Mr. Pugh provided information to the Commission and asked them to reconsider his disqualification. In addition, Sean Gamette, Managing Director for the Engineering Service Bureau, Fred Greco, Director of Maintenance and Stacey Lewis, Human Resources Director with the Harbor Department were on the call to advocate for Mr. Pugh.

A discussion ensued with President Gonzalez Edmond, Vice President Morrison, Commissioner Arias, Commissioner Dowling, Commissioner Garnica, Mr. Anderson, Ms. McDonald and Ms. Kerr-Jenkins regarding the duties of the position, the language on

the examination and what options the Commission has regarding the recommendation.

After discussion, the Commission voted to approve staff's recommendation to deny Mr. Pugh's appeal.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

16. [20-276CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE ORDER OF LAYOFF - CLASSIFIED

Communication from Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

Commissioner Arias wanted to know when layoffs would be effective. Ms. Pizarro Winting responded that it would be dependent upon Human Resources, as they would need to give employees ample notice.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Morrison, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

17. [20-277CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE PRIOR CLASSIFIED STATUS AND SENIORITY

Communication from Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

Ms. Pizarro Winting briefed the Commission regarding this request.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

18. [20-278CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO APPLY terms of the 2019 - 2023 Memorandum of Understanding with the Long Beach Management Association to the Executive Director of the Civil Service Commission.

President Gonzalez Edmond stated that this item will be held over to the next meeting and will be discussed in Closed Session, as it relates to compensation for the Executive Director.

A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Vice President Morrison, to table this item to the next meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

19. [20-279CS](#)

DISCUSSION REGARDING CONDUCTING CIVIL SERVICE HEARINGS UNDER THE CURRENT HEALTH ORDER RESTRICTIONS

Commissioner Garnica provided a brief overview to the Commission regarding the Special Projects Committee discussion concerning hearings. She stated that the recommendation will be to conduct hearings using the Webex platform. Commissioner Garnica stated that the draft policy is being introduced for discussion.

Commissioner Arias went over the five sections in the draft policy to conduct virtual hearings that included Platform, Locations, Joining Meetings, Exhibits and Findings.

Discussions took place with Commissioner Arias, Commissioner Garnica, Ms. Pizarro Winting, Mr. Anderson and the attorneys regarding the information that was presented.

Ken Yuwiler, Attorney at Law, wanted to know who would educate adverse witnesses on how to use the Webex program. He also wanted to know if there are breakout rooms using Webex. Commissioner Arias responded that Civil Service staff will be onsite to provide technical assistance and stated that there are breakout

rooms within Webex.

Mike Peters, Attorney at Law, wanted to know how we would enforce outside witnesses to attend given the current health order. Commissioner Arias stated that it would be the same process as having them attend in person and that the attorneys have the authority to enforce this. Mr. Peters explained the process of having to file a motion in Superior Court to enforce a witness to attend. Commissioner Arias stated that the Commission used the State Personnel Board's protocol to develop the draft policy and the Committee could look at it again. She believes there is a phrase regarding this topic.

Mr. Yuwiler asked if the Commission has ruled out in person hearings. Commissioner Arias stated that the Special Projects Committee is proposing that the Commission proceed with virtual hearings and not in person hearings due to the City's health order. Commissioner Garnica informed Mr. Yuwiler that the Commission has taken in to consideration all the information that was previously presented. She stated that a facility has been identified that would be conducive to in person hearings. When in person hearings are possible, the Commission will consider it. Commissioner Garnica stated that all protocols will be followed and the highest of safety standards will be put into place to ensure the care of witnesses and everyone involved.

Mr. Yuwiler wanted to know how additional exhibits will be presented to participants. Commissioner Arias stated that the host will be able to share the exhibits and that there will be sufficient bandwidth. It was discussed that audio and video exhibits can be manipulated to be shared at the appropriate time. It was also discussed that hard copies of evidence will be presented at a later date, or these can be printed at the discretion of the participants. Mr. Yuwiler wanted to know how we would be able to know when someone is dropped from the call. Ms. Pizarro Winting responded that the host will be able to see this and will inform the chair about the issue so that the hearing can stop until the person is back on the call.

Mr. Yuwiler wanted to know if the Commission will be addressing the change in conducting hearings with bargaining units through a Meet and Confer process. He stated that this is considered a change in working conditions. Mr. Anderson responded that unions have not

been notified as this is just a discussion. He stated that he imagines that at some point the unions will be notified. Jim Trott, Attorney at Law, stated that he has not spoken with the Police Officers Association and the Machinist Union regarding hearings.

Mr. Trott asked if there is an opportunity for attorneys to show a witness documents prior to it coming before the Commission. It was discussed that the host can create a breakout room for the witness and attorneys only. Civil Service staff can also share the document directly with the witness. It was discussed that any information or discussion that needs to take place privately, can be done using a virtual breakout room.

Mr. Peters wanted to know what facility will be used for witnesses and attorneys. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that she spoke with the Water Department; however, we can look at other facilities.

Mr. Trott asked if everyone will have video on. Commissioner Arias stated that all video will be on so that attorneys will be able to see all Commissioners.

Commissioner Arias stated that this is the first reading of the policy and it will be brought back as an agenda item at the next meeting.

Commissioner Garnica stated that this is a basic overview of how hearings will be conducted. She stated that there was a lot of information that was discussed that may not need to be a part of the document including protocols to clean the witness room between witnesses.

Vice President Morrison thanked the Committee for the amount of time that it took to put the document together and is appreciative of it.

President Gonzalez Edmond thanked the Committee and staff for their work. She stated that this is just a Receive and File for now. The item will be brought back to the Commission for approval.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Morrison, to receive and file this discussion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

20. STANDING COMMITTEES

A. Executive Committee

President Gonzalez Edmond stated that another meeting will be scheduled soon. Staff will be inviting Police Department representatives to meet with the Committee.

B. Recruitment and Selection Committee

Commissioner Dowling informed the Commission that the Committee met on Wednesday, September 23, 2020, to discuss Civil Service related items contained in the Racial Inequity and Reconciliation Initiative. He stated that Civil Service staff was asked to arrange a briefing for the Committee on current equity efforts underway within the Civil Service Department. Staff was also asked to arrange a meeting with the Police Department to present the Commission with information related to the departments ongoing and future efforts to increase racial diversity and equity.

A brief discussion ensued with Commissioner Arias, Commissioner Dowling, Commissioner Garnica, Ms. Pizarro Winting and Ms. Slaten regarding receiving similar information from the Fire Department. The Recruitment and Selection Committee will discuss this further at its next meeting.

C. Special Projects Committee

The Special Projects Committee provided its report during Agenda Item No. 19.

21. REPORTS FROM MANAGERS

A. Recruitment Division - Crystal Slaten

Ms. Slaten stated that she is happy to be back and is looking forward to providing information regarding recruitment to the Commission in the future.

B. Employment Services Division - Caprice McDonald

Ms. McDonald did not have any new updates to report.

C. Administration Support Services - Maria Alamo

Ms. Alamo did not have any new updates to report.

D. Executive Director - Christina Pizarro Winting

Ms. Pizarro Winting did not have any new updates to report.

22. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Ad Hoc Subcommittees:

A. Subcommittee to Develop Civil Service Commission Policy regarding requests to Utilize Classified Positions in the Unclassified Service

Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that she is working to solidify a date before the Commission's next meeting.

23. NEW BUSINESS

There was no new business discussed.

ADJOURNMENT

President Gonzalez Edmond adjourned the meeting at 10:55 a.m.

NO HEARING

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យអ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹងចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។