



CITY OF LONG BEACH

DEPARTMENT OF DEVELOPMENT SERVICES

333 W. Ocean Boulevard Long Beach, CA 90802 (562) 570-6194 FAX (562) 570-6068

October 10, 2011

CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION
City of Long Beach
California

RECOMMENDATION:

Partially approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations to an existing one-story ranch style home located at 21 Redondo Avenue in the Bluff Park Historic District. (District 3)

APPLICANT: Kevin Chinnock
21 Redondo Avenue
Long Beach, CA 90803
(Application No. HP 11-0132)

DISCUSSION

The subject site is located within the Bluff Park Historic District on the east side of Redondo Avenue adjacent to a 20-foot wide east/west alley one lot north of Ocean Boulevard (Exhibit A - Location Map). The site has a zoning designation of R-2-L (Two-family residential district with large lots). The parcel is 3,375 square feet in area (75 feet by 45 feet). This one-story ranch home with an attached one-car garage was built in 1940 (Exhibit B - Plans and Photographs). The home is classified as a contributing structure as identified in the Bluff Park Historic District Inventory (Part II) list of contributing/noncontributing buildings.

This property was brought before the Cultural Heritage Commission on June 13, 2011, as a study session item. (Exhibit C- CHC Report and Minutes of June 13, 2011). The purpose of the meeting was to provide the applicant and staff with direction on extensive exterior alterations that have been completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness or City building permits. The unpermitted work, which began earlier this year, converted a contributing one-story 1940 ranch style home to a pseudo Spanish style home. All the exterior finish materials, including windows, doors, light fixtures, roof, stucco and front yard perimeter wall, have been altered.

At the study session, a representative for the property owner stated that all work had been completed before the stop work order was issued on March 31, 2011. One resident spoke expressing concern that if the changes were approved a precedent would be set for future illegal alterations. Three residents spoke against approval of vinyl windows being used to

replace wood windows. A question was also raised if the changes would be subject to review under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The Commission's concerns were that all the exterior alterations had been completed without permits and that the City's historic codes had been disregarded. A desire was expressed that the current owner should return the home to its prior condition. Suggested changes included removal of the vinyl windows and replacement with multi-pane wood sash windows similar to the windows that were in place previously and removal of the red clay tile roof and installation of a dimensional composition shingle roof. There was also discussion regarding the removal of the stucco from the red brick chimney and brick retaining wall. After a lengthy discussion a motion was made to form a subcommittee with two commissioners, staff and the applicant. Commissioner Ivers and Chair Highberger were elected to serve on the subcommittee. The motion passed 5-0.

On July 5th, 2011, the applicant met with City staff from the Planning and Building Bureaus. The building inspector present expressed concern regarding potential structural issues associated with the installation of a tile roof without engineering calculations.

On July 18, 2011, the applicant met with the Cultural Heritage Commission subcommittee and staff from the Planning Bureau. The subcommittee indicated to the applicant that they would be recommending the following corrections to the Cultural Heritage Commission:

- Remove the tile roof and replace with a dimensional composition shingle roof,
- Remove the vinyl windows and replace with divided light wood sash windows with a similar mullion pattern as shown on the photograph before the alterations took place,
- Remove the center portion of the bay window on the north elevation and replace with a wood sash window;
- Remove the Spanish style front door and replace with a six panel wood door consistent with the 1940 era of the home,
- Remove the Mexican pavers from the front porch and sidewalk and replace with light gray concrete or red brick;
- Remove the Spanish style exterior porch light fixture and replace with a period appropriate fixture.

The applicant indicated a structural engineering report had been prepared for the new tile roof. The subcommittee requested a copy of the report. The applicant was also asked to submit photographs of the home showing all elevations. As of the date of this report, no photographs have been submitted.

Staff is presenting the recommendations of the subcommittee in this staff report for the Commission's consideration. Staff supports these recommendations and has conditioned the Certificate of Appropriateness accordingly.

Without having provided any of the materials requested by the subcommittee, the applicant applied for a building permit at the Development Services Center on August 19, 2011, to install additional rafters, braces and beams to reinforce the unpermitted tile roof. Later that same day, the applicant then submitted a structural calculations report for the roof dated

August 14, 2011, to the Planning Bureau (Exhibit D - Structural Report dated August 14, 2011). A hold was placed on the requested building permit (BRRF126892) so that it would not be issued until the Cultural Heritage Commission takes action on the roofing material.

The structural calculations report was forwarded to the subcommittee. The subcommittee reviewed the report and noted that the report specified lightweight concrete tile at 6.0 psf on page 6, but that it did not provide the brand or manufacturer of the tile installed at the site. Through staff, the subcommittee requested that the applicant submit information regarding the brand of roof tile and the bill of lading for the tile that was delivered to 21 Redondo Avenue in March.

On October 4, 2011, a representative of the applicant attempted again to obtain a building permit for the tile roof at the Development Services Center without first obtaining historic approval. The roof plan was approved by the Building Bureau with a condition that the building permit shall not be issued without Planning Bureau approval. The representative then submitted a revised structural calculations report dated October 3, 2011, to the Planning Bureau, as well as two invoices from South Coast Shingle dated March 8, 2011 and March 17, 2011 and a color brochure for the brand of roof tile.

The structural calculations report dated August 14, 2011, lists a lightweight concrete tile at 6.0 psf. However, the revised report dated October 3, 2011, indicates that a normal weight concrete tile at 10.00 psf. was installed on the structure (Exhibit E - Revised Structural Report dated October 3, 2011, invoice).

The project will comply with Section 2.63.070 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (the Standards), and the Bluff Park Historic District Designation Ordinance (Ordinance No. C-6835) as conditioned with a requirement to remove the red clay tile roof and install a 30-year dimensional composition shingle roof, remove the brown vinyl windows and install divided light wood sash windows, convert the bay window on the north elevation back to its original condition, remove the Spanish style door and install a 1940's style front door, install a period appropriate exterior light fixture and remove the Mexican pavers from the front sidewalk and porch and install gray concrete or red brick (Exhibit F - Findings and Conditions of Approval). Staff recommends that the Cultural Heritage Commission approve the Certificate of Appropriateness, as conditioned.

CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION

October 10, 2011

Page 4

Respectfully submitted,



JILL GRIFFITHS, AICP
PLANNING OFFICER



ROBERT M. ZUR SCHMIEEDE, AICP
DEPUTY DIRECTOR

RMZS:JG:LF

- Attachments:
- Exhibit A - Location Map
 - Exhibit B - Plans and Photographs
 - Exhibit C - CHC Report and Minutes of June 13, 2011
 - Exhibit D - Structural Calculations Report dated August 14, 2011
 - Exhibit E - Revised Structural Calculations Report dated October 3, 2011 and South Coast Shingle Invoices dated March 8 and March 17, 2011, roof tile brochure
 - Exhibit F - Findings and Conditions of Approval

U:\My Documents\2011 Cases\HP11-0132.21REDONDOBRPT..doc