

**LONG BEACH CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
JEANNE KARATSU, PRESIDENT  
MARCH 7, 2012**

The regular meeting of the Civil Service Commission was held at 8:00 a.m., Wednesday, March 7, 2012, in the Board Room of the Commission, 333 West Ocean Boulevard, Seventh Floor, Long Beach, California.

**MEMBERS PRESENT:** Jeanne Karatsu, Carolyn Smith Watts, Charles Hicks Jr., Jonathan Gotz, Larry Keller

**MEMBER EXCUSED:**

**OTHERS PRESENT:** Mario R. Beas, Executive Director & Secretary  
Melinda George, Deputy Director  
Marilyn Hall, Executive Assistant  
Christina Checel, Senior Deputy City Attorney  
Debbie McCluster, Personnel Analyst  
Caprice McDonald, Personnel Analyst  
Robert Pfingsthorn, Personnel Analyst  
Lourdes Ferrer, Personnel Analyst  
Ken Walker, Personnel Operations Manager, Human Resources

**President Jeanne Karatsu presided.**

**MINUTES:** It was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts and carried that the minutes of the regular meeting of February 29, 2012, be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**CONSENT CALENDAR (2-4):** It was moved by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts and carried that the Consent Calendar items be approved. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**RETIREMENTS:** Request to receive and file retirements.

Mary Jeys/Clerk Typist II/Health  
Linden Nishinaga/Senior Civil Engineer/Public Works

**The motion was made to receive and file on Consent Calendar.**

**RESIGNATIONS:** Request to receive and file resignations.

Diana Lopez/Administrative Analyst II/Harbor  
Jamie Preciado/Animal Control Officer I/Parks

**The motion was made to receive and file on Consent Calendar.**

**SCHEDULE FOR HEARINGS:**

Request to approve hearing schedule.

Suspension Appeal 05-S-1112, 6/20/2012  
Suspension Appeal 06-S-1112, 7/11 & 25, 2012  
Suspension Appeal 07-S-1112, 7/11 & 25, 2012  
Suspension Appeal 08-S-1112, 8/8/2012

**The motion was made to approve hearing schedule on Consent Calendar.**

**EXTENSION OF EXPIRING ELIGIBLE LISTS:**

The Secretary presented a staff report, prepared by him, requesting Commission approval of the following eligible list for six months:

Accountant  
Building Maintenance Engineer  
Civil Engineering Associate  
Control Center Operator  
Customer Service Representative  
Forensic Specialist (9/7/11 & 9/27/11)  
Office Systems Analyst  
Plumber  
Police Officer – Lateral  
Safety Specialist  
Senior Surveyor (3/2/11 & 3/16/11)  
Special Services Officer

**REQUEST FOR PERMANENT REASSIGNMENT AFTER REHABILITATION:**

**JUAN JOSE ROBLES/GAS FIELD SERVICE REPRESENTATIVE TO CUSTOMER SERVICE REPRESENTATIVE**

The Secretary presented a communication from Debbie Mills, Director of Human Resources, requesting Commission authorization to permanently reassign Juan Jose Robles, Gas Field Service Representative to Customer Service Representative after rehabilitation. In addition, the Secretary presented a staff report prepared by Rob Pfingsthorn, Personnel Analyst. Azucena de Ramos, Workers' Compensation Program Officer, Human Resources, was present and briefed the Commission regarding the process required to make the determination regarding this matter. Mr. Robles and his representative

Andrea Cook, Attorney at Law, addressed the Commission, requesting that if the Commission approves this request, that it extend the training for three months to allow Mr. Robles ample time to adequately learn the job duties. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts and carried that the request for reassignment for training be approved, pursuant to Section 67(3) of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**REQUEST TO EXTEND  
PROBATION:**

**DAMIEN MASSEY/PUBLIC SAFETY DISPATCHER**

The Secretary presented a communication from Jim McDonnell, Chief of Police, requesting Commission approval to extend the probationary period of Damien Massey, Public Safety Dispatcher, for three months (522 hours). After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Commissioner Gotz and carried that the request to extend probation be approved in accordance with Section 41(2) of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations and Section 1.01 of the Civil Service Commission Policies and Procedures. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**REQUEST FOR OUT-OF-ORDER  
LAYOFF:**

**PATRICIA BARNARD, SECRETARY, DEVELOPMENT  
SERVICES**

The Secretary presented a request from Patricia Barnard, Secretary, Development Services, requesting an out-of-order layoff from her position as a Clerk Typist. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Gotz and carried to approve the out-of-order layoff in accordance with Section 100 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**REQUEST FOR OUT-OF-ORDER  
LAYOFF:**

**DAVID WHITE, MANAGER, DEVELOPMENT SERVICES**

The Secretary presented a request from Debbie Mills, Director of Human Resources, requesting an out-of-order layoff for David White, Manager, Development Services, from his position as an Administrative Analyst. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Gotz and carried to approve the out-of-order layoff in accordance with Section 100 of

the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**REQUEST FOR REASSIGNMENTS  
AND TRANSFERS TO AVOID  
LAYOFFS:**

The Secretary presented a request from Debbie Mills, Director of Human Resources, requesting Commission approval for reassignments and transfers to avoid layoffs for Catherine Perez-Harmison from Assistant Administrative Analyst, Development Services to Airport Public Affairs Assistant, Airport (67(5)) & (64); Erika Martin, Community Development Analyst, Development Services to Administrative Analyst, Harbor (67(5)) & (64); Natalie Nickel, Assistant Administrative Analyst, Public Works to Assistant Administrative Analyst, Airport (64); Dora Cortes, Community Development Analyst, Development Services to Administrative Analyst, Harbor (67(5)) & (64); Pear Ultrapiromsuk, Administrative Analyst, Development Services to Administrative Analyst, Harbor (64); Elvia Delgadillo, Development Project Manager, Development Services to Capital Projects Coordinator, Harbor (67(5)) & (64); Victoria Bunoan, Assistant Administrative Analyst, Development Services to Assistant Administrative Analyst, Harbor (64); Ricky Gonzalez, Development Project Manager, Human Resources to Administrative Analyst, Water (67(5)) & (64). After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Commissioner Gotz and carried to approve the reassignments and transfers in accordance with Sections 67(5) and 64 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**CONSIDERATION OF HEARING  
OFFICER'S REPORT:**

**SUSPENSION APPEAL – (29-S-910)**

The Secretary presented a report prepared by Hearing Officer Carol A. Vendrillo, Attorney at Law, to the Commission, regarding the subject hearing which was conducted on January 27, 2012. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Commissioner Karatsu and carried that the hearing officer's report be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**MANAGERS' REPORT:**

The Secretary provided the Commission with an update on the City's budget and an E-mail he received from Financial Management outlining cuts. He also stated that the study on administering a Police Recruit examination will continue.

**ADJOURNMENT:**

There being no further business before the Commission,  
President Karatsu adjourned the meeting.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Mario R. Beas". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal stroke at the end.

MARIO R. BEAS  
Secretary

MRB:meh

Irma Hernandez, Chair  
Karen Highberger, Vice Chair  
Laura H. Brasser, Commissioner  
Shannon Carmack, Commissioner



Louise Ivers, Commissioner  
Harvey Keller, Commissioner  
Vacant, Commissioner

---

## Special Meeting

### FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES

#### CALL TO ORDER (5:32 PM)

[see media](#)

At 5:32 p.m., Chair Hernandez called the meeting to order.

#### ROLL CALL (5:32 PM)

[see media](#)

**Commissioners** Irma Hernandez, Karen L. Highberger, Shannon Carmack, Louise

**Present:** Ivers and Harvey Keller

**Commissioners** Laura H. Brasser

**Absent:**

Also present: Robert Zur Schmiede, Deputy Director; Jill Griffiths, Planning Officer; Linda Trang, Deputy City Attorney; Steve Gerhardt, Planner; Lynette Ferenczy, Planner; Heidi Eidson, Bureau Secretary.

#### FLAG SALUTE (5:32 PM)

[see media](#)

Commissioner Highberger led the flag salute.

#### MINUTES (5:33 PM)

[see media](#)

[see media](#)

12-007CH

Recommendation to receive and file the Cultural Heritage Commission minutes of January 9, 2012.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Highberger, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Irma Hernandez, Karen L. Highberger, Shannon Carmack,  
Louise Ivers and Harvey Keller

**Absent:** 1 - Laura H. Brassler

**DIRECTOR'S REPORT (5:34 PM)**

see media

Robert Zur Schmiede, Deputy Director, presented the Director's Report.

**SWEARING OF WITNESSES (5:35 PM)**

see media

Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the evidence you shall give in this Cultural Heritage Commission Meeting shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth.

**REGULAR AGENDA (5:35 PM)**

see media

see media

- 1 12-010CH Recommendation to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for a second-story addition to an existing single-family dwelling with a detached duplex located at 254 Coronado Avenue in the Bluff Heights Historic District. (Continuation from the January 9, 2012 CHC meeting).

Jill Griffiths, Planning Officer, introduced Lynette Ferenczy, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Dean DeLeon, applicant, spoke.

Lynette Ferenczy responded to queries from Commissioner Highberger.

Jill Griffiths spoke.

Lynette Ferenczy responded to a query from Chair Hernandez.

Dean DeLeon spoke.

Lynette Ferenczy responded to a query from Chair Hernandez.

Chair Hernandez spoke.

Lynette Ferenczy responded to queries from Commissioner Keller.

Commissioner Carmack spoke.

Commissioner Ivers spoke.

Jill Griffiths spoke.

Chair Hernandez spoke.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Ivers, seconded by Commissioner Carmack, to approve the recommendation for Design Option No. 4 with an amendment to Condition No. 6 to replace the front portion of the fence with wood. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Irma Hernandez, Karen L. Highberger, Shannon Carmack, Louise Ivers and Harvey Keller

**Absent:** 1 - Laura H. Brassler

see media

2 12-008CH

Recommendation to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness request to add a 217-square-foot rear addition and rebuild a new one-car garage for an existing one-story single-family residence located at 3112 East 2nd Street in the Bluff Park Historic District in the R-2-L zone.

Jill Griffiths, Planning Officer, introduced Steve Gerhardt, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Steve Gerhardt responded to a query from Chair Hernandez.

Steve Gerhardt responded to queries from Commissioner Highberger.

Commissioner Ivers spoke.

Steve Gerhardt responded to a comment made by Commissioner Ivers.

Steve Gerhardt responded to a query from Chair Hernandez.

Paul Henderickson, Architect, spoke.

Paul Henderickson responded to a query from Commissioner Ivers.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Keller, Paul Henderickson, Steve Gerhardt and Jill Griffiths.

Chair Hernandez spoke.

Paul Henderickson responded to queries from Commissioner Highberger.



Paul Henderickson responded to queries from Chair Hernandez.

A dialogue ensued between Paul Henderickson and Chair Hernandez.

Steve Gerhardt responded to queries from Commissioner Highberger.

Commissioner Carmack spoke.

Paul Henderickson responded to queries from Commissioner Ivers.

Chair Hernandez spoke.

Commissioner Carmack spoke.

Jill Griffiths responded to a query from Commissioner Ivers.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Ivers, to approve the recommendation with an amendment to Condition No. 9 that the existing doors be reused or replicated, if unable to reuse. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Irma Hernandez, Karen L. Highberger, Shannon Carmack, Louise Ivers and Harvey Keller

**Absent:** 1 - Laura H. Brassler

see media

3 12-011CH

Recommendation to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for a 285-square-foot addition to a one-story single-family dwelling at 330 Eliot Lane in the Eliot Lane Historic District.

Jill Griffiths, Planning Officer, introduced Lynette Ferenczy, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Lynette Ferenczy responded to queries from Chair Hernandez.

Tori Jones, representing the applicant, spoke.

Tori Jones responded to a query from Chair Hernandez.

Maureen Neely, Belmont Heights Community Association, provided public comment.

Jill Griffiths responded to a query from Commissioner Ivers.

Chair Hernandez spoke.

Tori Jones responded to queries from Commissioner Keller.

Chair Hernandez spoke.

Commissioner Ivers spoke.

Commissioner Keller spoke.

Commissioner Carmack spoke.

Commissioner Highberger spoke.

Jill Griffiths responded to a query from Chair Hernandez.

Commissioner Ivers spoke.

Chair Hernandez spoke.

Robert Zur Schmiede, Deputy Director, responded to queries from Commissioner Highberger.

Chair Hernandez spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Ivers and Jill Griffiths.

Commissioner Highberger spoke.

Chair Hernandez responded to queries from Commissioner Keller.

Commissioner Highberger spoke.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Ivers, seconded by Commissioner Highberger, to approve the recommendation with an amendment that the expanded brick porch and pilasters be removed and landscaping be replaced to match the 2002 photo, as presented, and that the trellis above the gate be removed to the approval of staff. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Irma Hernandez, Karen L. Highberger, Shannon Carmack and Louise Ivers

**No:** 1 - Harvey Keller

**Absent:** 1 - Laura H. Brassler

see media

4 12-009CH

Recommendation to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness request for a 722-square-foot one-story addition to the rear of an existing

single-family residence, demolition of a two-car garage and construction of a new 698-square-foot two-car garage located at 3626 Lewis Avenue within the California Heights Historic District.

Commissioner Highberger recused herself from the item.

Jill Griffiths, Planning Officer, introduced Lynette Ferenczy, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Jill Griffiths responded to a query from Commissioner Ivers.

Lynette Ferenczy responded to a query from Commissioner Ivers.

Chair Hernandez responded to a query from Commissioner Ivers.

Paul Jenkins, applicant, responded to a query from Commissioner Keller.

Paul Jenkins spoke.

Chair Hernandez spoke.

Paul Jenkins spoke.

Chair Hernandez spoke.

Commissioner Carmack spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Chair Hernandez and Paul Jenkins.

Commissioner Carmack spoke.

Commissioner Ivers spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Paul Jenkins and Commissioner Ivers.

A dialogue ensued between Paul Jenkins and Chair Hernandez.

Robert Zur Schmiede, Deputy Director, spoke.

Paul Jenkins responded to a comment from Robert Zur Schmiede.

Chair Hernandez spoke.

Paul Jenkins spoke.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Hernandez, seconded by Commissioner Ivers, to deny the request. (The item was continued to return for findings of denial). The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Irma Hernandez, Shannon Carmack, Louise Ivers and Harvey Keller

**Excused:** 1 - Karen L. Highberger

**Absent:** 1 - Laura H. Brassler

**Training on Windows By Galvin Preservation Associates ((7:20 PM)**

see media

Andrea Galvin, Galvin Preservation Associates, presented the training on windows.

Andrea Galvin responded to queries from the Commission.

Chair Hernandez spoke.

Jill Griffiths, Planning Officer, spoke.

Commissioner Carmack spoke.

Jill Griffiths spoke.

**PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (8:50 PM)**

see media

There were no comments from the public.

**COMMENTS FROM THE CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION (8:50 PM)**

There were no comments from the Commission.

**ADJOURNMENT (8:51 PM)**

At 8:51 p.m., there being no objection, Chair Hernandez adjourned the meeting.

hge

Becky Blair, Chair  
Alan Fox, Vice Chair



Leslie Gentile, Commissioner  
Phil Saumur, Commissioner  
Melani Smith, Commissioner  
Donita Van Horik, Commissioner

---

## FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES

### CALL TO ORDER (5:02 PM)

[see media](#)

At 5:02 p.m., Chair Blair called the meeting to order.

### ROLL CALL (5:02 PM)

[see media](#)

**Commissioners** Alan L. Fox, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Phillip Joseph Saumur, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair  
**Present:** Van Horik and Becky Blair

**Commissioners** Melani Smith

**Absent:**

Also present: Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services; Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator; Jill Griffiths, Planning Officer; Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney; Ira Brown, Planner; Heidi Eidson, Bureau Secretary.

### MINUTES (5:03 PM)

[see media](#)

[see media](#)

12-018PL

Recommendation to receive and file the Planning Commission minutes for February 16, 2012.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Van Horik, seconded by Commissioner Fox, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

**Excused:** 1 - Leslie Fernald Gentile

**Absent:** 1 - Melani Smith

### DIRECTOR'S REPORT (5:03 PM)

see media

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, presented the Director's Report.

**SWEARING OF WITNESSES (5:05 PM)**

see media

Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the evidence you shall give in this Planning Commission Meeting shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth.

**FLAG SALUTE (5:05 PM)**

see media

Commissioner Van Horik led the flag salute.

**REGULAR AGENDA (5:05 PM)**

see media

see media

1. 12-019PL Recommendation to find the proposed vacation of a portion of Pier C Street west of Pico Avenue in conformance with the adopted goals and policies of the City's General Plan. (District 1) (Application No. GPC 030112.2)

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, introduced Ira Brown, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Lewis Rubenstein, City Traffic Engineer for the Harbor Department, spoke.

Ira Brown and Lewis Rubenstein responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Lewis Rubenstein responded to queries from Commissioner Saumur.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Van Horik, seconded by Commissioner Saumur, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

**Absent:** 1 - Melani Smith

see media

2. 12-020PL Recommendation to find the proposed vacation of Esther Street west of Judson Avenue in conformance with the adopted goals and policies of the City's General Plan. (District 1) (Application No. GPC 030112.1)

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, introduced Ira Brown, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Ira Brown responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Ira Brown responded to queries from Commissioner Saumur.

Craig Reynolds, representing the applicant, spoke.

Craig Reynolds responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, responded to a query from Commissioner Gentile.

Craig Reynolds and Amy Bodek responded to queries from Commissioner Gentile.

Amy Bodek responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Ira Brown spoke.

Craig Reynolds responded to a query from Commissioner Gentile.

Amy Bodek responded to a query from Commissioner Gentile.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, responded to queries from Commissioner Saumur.

Chair Blair spoke.

Michael Mais responded to comments made by Chair Blair.

Chair Blair spoke.

Amy Bodek spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Van Horik, seconded by Commissioner Saumur, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

**Absent:** 1 - Melani Smith

see media

3. 12-021PL

Recommendation to receive and file the 2011 Annual Report for the Housing Element and instruct the Director of Development Services to submit the Annual Report to the City Council, State Office of Planning and Research and the California Department of Housing and Community Development. (Citywide)

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, introduced Ira Brown, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Ira Brown responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to queries from Commissioner Saumur.

A dialogue ensued between Chair Blair and Amy Bodek.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Amy Bodek responded to queries from Commissioner Saumur.

Gary Shelton provided public comment.

Chair Blair spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to comments made by Chair Blair.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Saumur, seconded by Commissioner Gentile, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

**Absent:** 1 - Melani Smith

**PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (6:03 PM)**

see media



Gary Shelton provided public comment.

**COMMENTS FROM THE PLANNING COMMISSION (6:05 PM)**

see media

There were no comments from the Planning Commission.

**ADJOURNMENT (6:05 PM)**

At 6:05 p.m., Chair Blair adjourned the meeting.

hge