

**CITY OF LONG BEACH  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, APRIL 20, 2016  
333 W. OCEAN BLVD., 7TH FLOOR  
CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ROOM, 8:00 AM**

Robin Perry, President  
Rick McGilton-McGlamery, Vice President



Phyllis Arias, Commissioner  
Charles Hicks Jr., Commissioner  
Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Commissioner

Kandice Taylor-Sherwood,  
Executive Director

---

## **FINISHED AGENDA & MINUTES**

### **ROLL CALL**

**Commissioners** Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts and Rick  
**Present:** McGilton-McGlamery

**Commissioners** Phyllis Arias  
**Absent:**

Kandice Taylor-Sherwood, Executive Director & Secretary  
Crystal Slaten, Recruitment & Selection Officer  
Robert Pfingsthorn, Administrative Officer  
Caprice McDonald, Special Projects Officer  
Marilyn Hall, Executive Assistant  
Gary Anderson, Principal Deputy City Attorney  
Lourdes Ferrer, Administrative Analyst  
Donna de Araujo, Personnel Analyst  
Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst  
Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst  
Nani Blyleven, Personnel Analyst, Human Resources  
Stacey Lewis, Assistant Director of Human Resources, Harbor

### **FLAG SALUTE**

1. 16-063CS

**Recommendation to approve minutes:**

*Special Meeting of April 4, 2016*

*Regular Meeting of April 6, 2016*

*Dismissal Hearing 01-D-1516 Minutes of February 17 & April 6, 2016*

**A motion was made by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Vice President McGilton-McGlamery, to approve Special Meeting minutes of April 4, 2016. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Charles Hicks, Rick McGilton-McGlamery and Robin Perry

**Abstain:** 1 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis Arias

**A motion was made by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Vice President McGilton-McGlamery, to approve Regular Meeting minutes of April 6, 2016. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Charles Hicks, Rick McGilton-McGlamery and Robin Perry

**Abstain:** 1 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis Arias

**A motion was made by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to approve Dismissal Hearing 01-D-1516 minutes of February 17 & April 6, 2016. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Rick McGilton-McGlamery and Robin Perry

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis Arias

**CONSENT CALENDAR (2-8):**

Passed the Consent Calendar

**A motion was made by Vice President McGilton-McGlamery, seconded by Commissioner Hicks, to approve Consent Calendar Items. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Rick McGilton-McGlamery and Robin Perry

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis Arias

2. 16-064CS

**Recommendation to approve examination results:**

*Police Recruit (NTN) (Established 1/27/16) AMENDED -  
883 Applied, 285 Qualified*

*Public Safety Dispatcher - Lateral (Established 4/15/16) - 1 Applied,  
1 Qualified*

*Real Estate Project Coordinator (Established 4/8/16)- 71 Applied,  
26 Applied*

*School Guard (Established 4/11/16) - 196 Applied, 182 Qualified*

3. 16-065CS

**Recommendation to receive and file bulletins:**

*Administrative Analyst*

*Battalion Chief*

*Business Systems Specialist*

*Buyer*

*Clerk Typist*

*Construction Inspector*

*Equipment Mechanic*

*Fire Recruit*

*Planner*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

4. 16-066CS      **Recommendation to receive and file retirements:**  
*Shirley Allery/Accounting Technician/Financial Management  
(33 yrs., 6 mos.)*  
*Jean C. Rabune/Recreation Assistant/Parks, Recreation & Marine  
(25 yrs., 6 mos.)*  
*Parine Soth/Police Officer/Police (27 yrs., 18 days)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

5. 16-067CS      **Recommendation to receive and file disability retirement:**  
*Gail Dennison/Police Lieutenant/Police (29 yrs., 3 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

6. 16-068CS      **Recommendation to receive and file resignations:**  
*Matthew Jones/Fire Recruit/Fire (26 days)*  
*David Mendoza/Ambulance Operator/Fire (3 yrs., 4 mos.)*  
*Kalid Abuhadwan/ Police Officer/Police (10 yrs., 10 mos.)*  
*Tomas Diaz, Jr./Police Officer/Police (8 yrs., 6 mos.)*  
*Alexi Hernandez/Police Recruit/Police (5 days)*  
*Carl Johnson/Police Recruit/Police (10 days)*  
*Anthony Manriquez/Police Recruit/Police (8 days)*  
*Geoffrey M. Mayes/Police Recruit/Police (9 days)*  
*Kyle J. Piper/Police Officer/Police (2 yrs., 10 mos.)*  
*Brittney A. Pointer-Holden/Police Recruit/Police (10 days)*  
*Miguel A. Valdez/Senior Equipment Operator/Water (13 yrs., 11 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

7. 16-069CS      **Recommendation to approve transfers:**  
*Eileen Hunter, Administrative Analyst III/Police to Administrative Analyst III/Library*  
*Jeanne Mellor/Assistant Administrative Analyst II/Public Works to Assistant Administrative Analyst II/Library*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

8. 16-070CS      **Recommendation to receive and file withdrawal of appeal:**  
*Reduction Appeal 06-R-1415*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

#### REGULAR AGENDA

9. 16-071CS      **RECOMMENDATION FOR PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENT -**  
*Christabel Trinidad, Assistant Administrative Analyst*  
*Communication from Sandra Kennedy, Administrative Officer,*  
*Financial Management*

The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding this request.

Ms. Kennedy was present and answered Commission questions regarding this request.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Vice President McGilton-McGlamery, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Rick McGilton-McGlamery and Robin Perry

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis Arias

- 10. 16-072CS**      **RECOMMENDATION FOR PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENT -**  
Emily Armstrong, Assistant Administrative Analyst  
*Communication from Sandra Kennedy, Administrative Officer,*  
*Financial Management*

The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding this request.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Vice President McGilton-McGlamery, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Rick McGilton-McGlamery and Robin Perry

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis Arias

- 11. 16-073CS**      **RECOMMENDATION TO CREATE NEW CLASSIFICATION AND**  
**ADOPT NEW CLASSIFICATION SPECIFICATION - *Project***  
*Scheduler*

- a. Communication from Margaret Huebner, Director of Human Resources, Harbor
- b. Staff report prepared by Caprice McDonald, Special Projects Officer

The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding this request.

**A motion was made by Vice President McGilton-McGlamery, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Rick McGilton-McGlamery and Robin Perry

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis Arias

**12. 16-074CS            REQUEST TO FILE FOR EXAMINATION BY DISMISSED  
EMPLOYEE - John Cataldo**

The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding this request.

John Cataldo addressed the Commission regarding his request to be allowed to participate in the examination for Special Services Officer.

**A motion was made by Vice President McGilton-McGlamery, seconded by Commissioner Hicks, to approve recommendation to deny. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Rick McGilton-McGlamery and Robin Perry

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis Arias

**13. 16-075CS            ELECTION FOR COMMISSION OFFICERS**

**A motion was made by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Vice President McGilton-McGlamery, to approve recommendation to open nomination for election of Commission officers. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Rick McGilton-McGlamery and Robin Perry

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis Arias

**A motion was made by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to approve recommendation to nominate Ricky McGilton-McGlamery for the office of President. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Rick McGilton-McGlamery and Robin Perry

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis Arias

**A motion was made by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Vice President McGilton-McGlamery, to approve recommendation to nominate Commissioner Phyllis Arias for the office of Vice President. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Rick McGilton-McGlamery and Robin Perry

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis Arias

**A motion was made by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Vice President McGilton-McGlamery, to approve recommendation to close nominations for Commission officers. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Rick McGilton-McGlamery and Robin Perry

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis Arias

## **NEW BUSINESS**

President Perry acknowledged the Secretary for the excellent job she is doing with the Leadership Long Beach Executive Quick Start program, which he is currently participating. He stated that she has put together an excellent program for the participants. He also acknowledged her for the excellent job she is doing as the Executive Director representing the Civil Service Department.

President Perry shared information regarding the upcoming Moot Court Project, for boys in the 8th - 12th grade. The program provides a group of boys with a legal fact pattern to study the fact patten and make arguments before lawyers and judges. This program takes place a week in late June or early July. He stated that it is a free program and encourage anyone with boys to sign up. He acknowledged Gary Anderson, Principal City Attorney's for being a part of the program for two years.

He also provided information regarding a program sponsored by the the Long Beach Chapter of the NAACP in conjunction with Kessler, Young and Logan, called Law Day, where young people get together to talk about biases of law. The date of this event is April 28, 2016.



## **MANAGERS' REPORT**

### **Recruitment & Selection**

### **Special Projects**

### **Administration Support Services**

### **Executive Director**

Ms. Slaten informed the Commission that staff is very busy opening new examinations and attending job recruitment fairs. She provided the Commission information and updates regarding the scheduled examinations and upcoming recruitment job fairs. She informed the Commission that staff has met with the Police Department regarding opening the Police Officer - Lateral examination on a continuous basis and they are in agreement. She also stated that Special Services Officer has been opened for two week and an eligible list will be established this week.

Commissioner Hicks question how is the Special Service Officer's process proceeding, in light of the possible changes to the classification.

Ms. Slated informed the Commission that this examination process is for waivers only, and that the Test Construction Interns are working on the written examination for Special Service Officer. She also added that the process is at the beginning stages.

The Secretary stated that the Test Construction Interns have been gathering data, which they will be combining and submitting to Human Resources, regarding the Special Service Officer examination.

Ms. McDonald stated that test development for the Customer Service Examination is in the final stages, and that incumbents will be scheduled to take the test that has been constructed. She also stated that staff is maximizing the use of Montage by extending it to other City departments.

The Secretary informed the Commission that staff is very busy with examinations and being out in the community at job fairs. She stated there is a real need for City departments to partner with Civil Service when they are attending events in the community, because of the limited resources and staff available, however, she appreciates the collaboration received.

**COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission's jurisdiction.**

Chris Rowe, Deputy Chief, Support Services Bureau, Fire, informed the Commission that he has been assigned to Dave Segura's job, and introduced Xavier Espino as his Assistant Deputy Chief and Tim Underwood, Battalion Chief, Director of Training and Henry Harvey as the newly appointed Communications Specialist to the Commission.

**ADJOURNMENT**

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបវារៈ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យអ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅការិយាល័យសៀវភៅសាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹងចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។

Rick McGilton-McGlamery, President  
Phyllis Arias, Vice President



Charles Hicks Jr., Commissioner  
Robin Perry, Commissioner  
Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Commissioner

Kandice Taylor-Sherwood,  
Executive Director

---

## **FINISHED AGENDA & MINUTES**

### **ROLL CALL**

**Commissioners** Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry and Phyllis Arias  
**Present:**

**Commissioners** Charles Hicks and Rick McGilton-McGlamery  
**Absent:**

Kandice Taylor-Sherwood, Executive Director & Secretary  
Robert Pfingsthorn, Administrative Officer  
Caprice McDonald, Special Projects Officer  
Gary Anderson, Principal Deputy City Attorney  
Lourdes Ferrer, Administrative Analyst  
Donna de Araujo, Personnel Analyst  
Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst  
Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst  
Paul Heuchert, Personnel Analyst, Human Resources

### **FLAG SALUTE**

1. 16-076CS      **Recommendation to approve minutes:**  
*Regular Meeting of April 20, 2016*

**This CS-Agenda Item was held.**

**CONSENT CALENDAR (2-4):**

Passed the Consent Calendar

**A motion was made by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Commissioner Perry, to approve Consent Calendar Items, with the exception of Senior Equipment Operator - Crane (Established 1/21/16) Amended results. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry and Phyllis Arias

**Absent:** 2 - Charles Hicks and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

**2. 16-077CS**

**Recommendation to approve examination results:**

*Garage Service Attendant (Established 4/25/16) - 115 Applied,  
36 Qualified*

*Garage Supervisor (Established 4/28/16) - 24 Applied, 5 Applied*

*Marina Supervisor (Established 4/28/16) - 43 Applied, 9 Qualified*

*Registered Nurse (Established 4/19/16) - 16 Applied, 16 Qualified*

*Senior Equipment Operator - Crane (Established 1/21/16)*

*AMENDED - 16 Applied, 1 Qualified*

*Special Services Officer (Established 4/21/16) - 46 Applied,  
46 Qualified*

*Water Utility Mechanic Supervisor - 8 Applied, 7 Qualified*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

Vice President Arias questioned the meaning of the amended results for Senior Equipment Operator - Crane (Established 1/21/16) AMENDED, the gap in the dates the examination was established and the date it came to the Commission, and the reason only one person qualified.

Ms. Ferrer provided an explanation to Vice President Arias, stating that this position is one that is hard to fill so the position was opened for several months. The position requires certain certifications, and the amended results captured people who had not been processed because the position was still opened, and closed with no one qualifying.

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

3. 16-078CS

**Recommendation to receive and file bulletins:**

*Contract Compliance Analyst*  
*Public Health Nutritionist*  
*Senior Surveyor*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

4. 16-079CS

**Recommendation to receive and file resignations:**

*Diane Brown/Public Health Professional III/Health (14 yrs., 11 mos.)*  
*Rolly Alcantara Jr./Ambulance Operator/Fire (5 mos., 28 days)*  
*Christianne Cabezut/Fire Recruit/Fire (1 mo., 28 days)*  
*Gerald Goodlow Jr./Police Recruit/Police (18 days)*  
*Deryl Jackson/Police Recruit/Police (18 days)*  
*Vannak Kang/Police Recruit/Police 14 days)*  
*Enrique Ascencio/Water Utility Mechanic II/Water (13 yrs., 1 mo.)*  
*Joseph Hipp III/Water Utility Mechanic III/Water (6 yrs., 1 mo.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

The Secretary recognized classified City employee Jeane Lanier-DeCloute, Customer Service Representative, for the exemplary services she provided to President McGlinton-McGlamery. She stated that President McGlinton-McGlamery shared with her the excellent service Ms. Lanier-DeCloute provided him, highlighting her patience and assistance during a recent visit to City Hall regarding his account. She also acknowledged her supervisor, Sharon Webster, and presented them with Certificates of Appreciation for exemplifying the Core Values.

Pamela Horgan, Manager, Commercial Services Bureau, thanked the Secretary and Commission for taking the time to acknowledge Ms. Lanier-DeCloute and Webster.

## REGULAR AGENDA

5. 16-080CS      **RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY PERIOD** - Landon Bradley, Water Utility Mechanic I  
*Communication from Christopher J. Garner, General Manager, Water Department*

The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding this request.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Commissioner Perry, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry and Phyllis Arias

**Absent:** 2 - Charles Hicks and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

6. 16-081CS      **RECOMMENDATION TO ADOPT NEW CLASSIFICATION AND  
CREATE NEW CLASSIFICATION SPECIFICATION - *Permit  
Center Supervisor***

- a. Communication from Alex Basquez, Director of Human Resources
- b. Staff report prepared by Donna de Araujo, Personnel Analyst

The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding this request.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Perry, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry and Phyllis Arias

**Absent:** 2 - Charles Hicks and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

7. 16-082CS      **RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE REVISED CLASSIFICATION  
SPECIFICATION - *Permit Technician***

- a. Communication from Alex Basquez, Director of Human Resources
- b. Staff report prepared by Deborah McCluster, Personnel Analyst

The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding this request.

Meg Rau, Administrative Officer, Development Service was present to answer Commission questions.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Commissioner Perry, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry and Phyllis Arias

**Absent:** 2 - Charles Hicks and Rick McGilton-McGlamery



8. 16-083CS      **RECOMMENDATION TO EXTEND EXPIRING ELIGIBLE LISTS (6 months):**

*Staff Report prepared by Kandice Taylor-Sherwood, Executive Director*

- Accounting Clerk 5/7/2014
- Accounting Technician 11/19/2014
- Civil Engineer Test 2 11/25/2014
- Department Librarian Test 2 5/7/2015
- Geographic Information Systems Technician 11/19/2014
- Housing Specialist 5/6/2015
- Mechanical Engineering Associate 5/28/2015
- Microbiologist Test 1 5/6/2015
- Personnel Analyst 5/15/2015
- Plan Checker - Mechanical Test 2 11/6/2015
- Plan Checker - Mechanical Test 3 11/23/2015
- Public Safety Dispatcher Test 2 11/6/2014
- Recycling Specialist 8/20/2014
- Senior Mechanical Inspector 5/18/2015
- Senior Scheduler Test 2 11/23/2015
- Traffic Engineering Associate 2/5/2014

The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding this request. She provided copies of surveys sent to departments at the end of the selection process for eligible list, addressing how well analysts worked with departments, the quality of the list and other related elements responsive to customer service. She also provided a report prepared by Rob Pfingsthorn, Administrative Officer regarding statistics from eligible list expiring in May 2016.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Perry, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry and Phyllis Arias

**Absent:** 2 - Charles Hicks and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

9. 16-084CS      **RECOMMENDATION TO EXTEND ARTICLE VIII, SECTION 115(3) OF THE CIVIL SERVICE RULES AND REGULATIONS**  
*Staff report prepared by Kandice Taylor-Sherwood, Executive Director*

The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding this request.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Commissioner Perry, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry and Phyllis Arias

**Absent:** 2 - Charles Hicks and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

10. 16-085CS      **RECOMMENDATION FOR CONSIDERATION OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE'S REPORT - Dismissal Appeal 01-D-1415 (Mailed to CSC April 5, 2016)**  
*Report prepared by Angela Villegas, Administrative Law Judge*

**This CS-Agenda Item was held.**

**NEW BUSINESS**

Vice President Arias acknowledged Commissioner Perry for the outstanding job he did as President of the Civil Service Commission, and thanked him for his service. Commissioner Smith Watts also thanked Commissioner Perry. Vice President Arias presented Commissioner Perry with a plaque in recognition of his service as President of the Commission.

The Secretary also expressed her gratitude to Commissioner Perry for his service as the President and the opportunity to work with him.

Commissioner Perry thanked the Commission and staff for the opportunity to work with them as President for the past year. He stated that is happy to have the opportunity to serve on the Commission and appreciates all the knowledge he has gained.

**MANAGERS' REPORT**

**Recruitment & Selection**

**Special Projects**

**Administration Support Services**

**Executive Director**

Lou Ferrer, Administrative Analyst, thanked Commissioner Perry for his service as President to the Commission. She informed the Commission that staff is really busy attending Job Recruitment Fairs and conducting examinations. She stated that staff is currently working on the Administrative Aide, Assistant Administrative Analyst and Administrative Analyst examination, with limited staff, because most of Civil Service staff is participating in these examinations. She also stated that staff is busy with public safety examinations. She also thanked Vice President Arias for working with staff on bulletin review.

Ms. McDonald also thanked Commission Perry for his service as President to the Commission, and informed the Commission that she had the kickoff meeting for user departments of the Customer Service Representative classification regarding the job analysis. She also acknowledged the Test Construction Interns for completing the new tests for Clerk Typist and Planner.

The Secretary thanked Ms. McDonald for the work she does with the interns as she has been the main supervisor for them. She also questioned if the Commission would like to have the report from Mr. Pfingsthorn regarding the expiring eligible lists for May to be placed on the agenda for discussion. She informed the Commission that she has copies of the surveys Civil Service use to gather data as it relates to customer service and welcome any recommendations they may have regarding them.

**COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission's jurisdiction.**

**ADJOURNMENT**

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបវារៈ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យអ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅការិយាល័យស្នេនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹងចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។

**CITY OF LONG BEACH  
PLANNING COMMISSION  
MINUTES**

**THURSDAY, MAY 5, 2016  
333 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD  
COUNCIL CHAMBER, 5:00 PM**

Mark Christoffels, Chair  
Donita Van Horik, Vice Chair  
Ron Cruz, Commissioner



Alan Fox, Commissioner  
Andy Perez, Commissioner  
Jane Templin, Commissioner  
Erick Verduzco-Vega, Commissioner

---

## **FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES**

### **CALL TO ORDER (5:06 PM)**

At 5:06 p.m., Chair Christoffels called the meeting to order.

### **ROLL CALL (5:07 PM)**

Also present: Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services; Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager; Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney; Carrie Tai, Planner; Heidi Eidson, Bureau Secretary.

**Commissioners** Ron Cruz, Alan Fox, Alan Fox, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Erick  
**Present:** Verduzco-Vega, Donita Van Horik and Mark Christoffels

### **FLAG SALUTE (5:07 PM)**

Vice Chair Van Horik led the flag salute.

### **MINUTES (5:08 PM)**

16-028PL Recommendation to receive and file the Planning Commission minutes of April 21, 2016.

**A motion was made by Vice Chair Van Horik, seconded by Commissioner Verduzco-Vega, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Ron Cruz, Alan Fox, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega, Donita Van Horik and Mark Christoffels

### **DIRECTOR'S REPORT (5:08 PM)**

Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, presented the Director's Report.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, spoke.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

**SWEARING OF WITNESSES (5:14 PM)**

Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the evidence you shall give in this Planning Commission Meeting shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth.

**STUDY SESSION (5:14 PM)**

1. 16-033PL Recommendation to conduct a study session regarding the Belmont Beach and Aquatic Center.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, introduced the study session item.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to a query from Chair Christoffels.

Tom Modica, Assistant City Manager, presented the study session item.

Ashley Davis, consultant with LSA, discussed the CEQA process and EIR findings.

Amy Bodek spoke.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Chair Christoffels and Tom Modica.

Amy Bodek responded to a query from Chair Christoffels.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Tom Modica responded to a query from Commissioner Templin.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Fox and Tom Modica.

Amy Bodek responded to comments made by Commissioner Fox.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Fox and Amy Bodek.

Commissioner Cruz spoke.

Ashley Davis responded to queries from Commissioner Cruz.

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Verduzco-Vega and Tom Modica.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Laura Selmer provided public comment.

Anna Christiansen provided public comment.

Lucy Johnson provided public comment.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

Tom Modica responded to a query raised during public comment.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to a query raised during public comment.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to queries from Chair Christoffels.

**REGULAR AGENDA (6:14 PM)**

2. 16-029PL Recommendation to accept Categorical Exemption 15-033 and deny the appeal of the Zoning Administrator's decision to approve a Local Coastal Development Permit to demolish Marine Stadium Restroom 8N, located at 5605 Boathouse Lane. (District 3) (Application No. 1503-04)



Chair Christoffels spoke.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Perez, seconded by Commissioner Templin, to continue the item to May 19, 2016. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Ron Cruz, Alan Fox, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega, Donita Van Horik and Mark Christoffels

3. 16-030PL

Recommendation to accept Categorical Exemption CE 16-100 and approve a Conditional Use Permit to allow a 7,500-square-foot, for-profit, private charter school for grades 7 to 12, with a maximum of 50 students, 6 teachers and 3 support staff members, in an existing commercial building located at 3501 N. Atlantic Avenue, in the Community Commercial Automobile-Oriented (CCA) zoning district. (District 7) (Application No. 1511-05)

Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, introduced Carrie Tai, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Andrea Lopez, applicant, responded to queries from Commissioner Templin.

Andrea Lopez spoke.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Fox and Andrea Lopez.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Verduzco-Vega, seconded by Vice Chair Van Horik, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Ron Cruz, Alan Fox, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega, Donita Van Horik and Mark Christoffels

4. 16-031PL

Recommendation to accept Categorical Exemption CE 16-101 and approve a Conditional Use Permit to allow a new 2,000-square-foot restaurant with a drive-through lane, located at 2103 N. Bellflower Boulevard, in the Community Commercial Automobile-Oriented (CCA) zoning district. (District 4) (Application No. 1511-04)

Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, introduced Carrie Tai, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Adam Fisher, Centerra Retail Group, applicant, spoke.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Adam Fisher responded to queries from Commissioner Fox.

Commissioner Cruz spoke.

Adam Fisher responded to queries from Commissioner Cruz.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

Adam Fisher responded to queries from Chair Christoffels.

John Drewson, Vice President of Design and Construction for Del Taco, spoke.

Linda Tatum spoke.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

John Drewson responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, spoke.

Joseph Melo provided public comment.

Dennis Coulter provided public comment.

David Alperin provided public comment.

Kim Grevious, provided public comment.

Peter Perez provided public comment.

Mark Starr provided public comment.

Shelley Rooney provided public comment.

Jennifer Van Duser provided public comment.

Doug Van Duser provided public comment.

Joseph Robert Rooney provided public comment.

Jason Sumpter provided public comment.

---

Olivia Mather provided public comment.

Kelly Vallianos provided public comment.

Matt Rader provided public comment.

David McIlroy provided public comment.

Laura Selmer provided public comment.

Mark Bonham provided public comment.

Linda Day provided public comment.

Phil Lumley provided public comment.

Virginia Lumley provided public comment.

Jim Stok provided public comment.

Joe Sopo provided public comment

Madison Peterson provided public comment.

Susan Starr provided public comment.

Madeline Reynolds provided public comment.

Ed Tackinelli provided public comment.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

Carrie Tai responded to a query from Chair Christoffels.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Linda Tatum spoke.

Stephen Badum, of Anderson-Penna, contractor for the Public Works Department, responded to a query from Commissioner Templin.

Rajeev Seetharam, Senior Traffic Engineer, Public Works Department,

responded to a query from Commissioner Templin.

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Verduzco-Vega and Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

George Ewing, representing Del Taco, responded to queries from Commissioner Van Horik.

John Drewson responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

John Drewson spoke.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

John Drewson responded to a query from Commissioner Templin.

Chair Christoffels.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Commissioner Perez spoke.

Michael Mais spoke.

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

Chair Christoffels responded to Commissioner Verduzco-Vega.

Amy Bodek spoke.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Templin, seconded by Commissioner Perez, to deny the recommendation and direct staff to bring back negative findings for Planning Commission adoption. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Ron Cruz, Alan Fox, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega, Donita Van Horik and Mark Christoffels

5. 16-032PL

Recommendation to accept Categorical Exemption CE 16-045 and approve a Conditional Use Permit to allow the sale of beer, wine and distilled spirits for off-site consumption (Type 21 license) at a supermarket ("Smart and Final"), located within an existing retail

building at 4480 Atlantic Avenue, in the Commercial Community Automobile-Oriented (CCA) zoning district. (District 8) (Application No. 1602-25)

Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, introduced Carrie Tai, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Carrie Tai responded to a query from Commissioner Templin.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Carrie Tai responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Alex Campbell, of Art Rodriguez & Associates, representing the applicant, spoke.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Templin, seconded by Commissioner Cruz, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Ron Cruz, Alan Fox, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega, Donita Van Horik and Mark Christoffels

#### **PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ( 8:17 PM)**

There was no public comment given.

#### **COMMENTS FROM THE PLANNING COMMISSION (8:17 PM)**

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, spoke.

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to a query from Commissioner Verduzco-Vega.

#### **ADJOURNMENT (8:19 PM)**

At 8:19 p.m., Chair Christoffels adjourned the meeting.

hge

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឱ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបវារៈ និងកំណត់យុត្តិធម៌ អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ ការិយាល័យស្នើនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។

Mark Christoffels, Chair  
Donita Van Horik, Vice Chair  
Ron Cruz, Commissioner



Alan Fox, Commissioner  
Andy Perez, Commissioner  
Jane Templin, Commissioner  
Erick Verduzco-Vega, Commissioner

---

**FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES**

**CALL TO ORDER (5:09 PM)**

At 5:09 p.m., Chair Christoffels called the meeting to order.

**ROLL CALL (5:09 PM)**

Also present: Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services; Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager; Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney; Carrie Tai, Planner; Ira Brown, Planner; Heidi Eidson, Bureau Secretary.

**Commissioners** Ron Cruz, Alan Fox, Alan Fox, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Erick  
**Present:** Verduzco-Vega, Donita Van Horik and Mark Christoffels

**FLAG SALUTE (5:09 PM)**

Commissioner Fox led the flag salute.

**MINUTES (5:10PM)**

16-034PL

Recommendation to receive and file the Planning Commission minutes of May 5, 2016.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Templin, seconded by Commissioner Verduzco-Vega, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Ron Cruz, Alan Fox, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega, Donita Van Horik and Mark Christoffels

**DIRECTOR'S REPORT (5:01 PM)**



Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, presented the Director's Report.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, spoke.

Linda Tatum responded to a query from Chair Christoffels.

**SWEARING OF WITNESSES (5:11 PM)**

Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the evidence you shall give in this Planning Commission Meeting shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth.

**UNFINISHED BUSINESS (5:11 PM)**

1. 16-035PL Recommendation to adopt findings to support denial of a Conditional Use Permit for a new 2,000-square-foot restaurant with a drive-through lane with hours of operation from 6:00 a.m. to 2:00 a.m., located at 2103 N. Bellflower Boulevard, in the Community Commercial Automobile-Oriented (CCA) zoning district. (District 4) (Application No. 1511-04)

Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, introduced Carrie Tai, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, spoke.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Templin, seconded by Commissioner Verduzco-Vega, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Ron Cruz, Alan Fox, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega, Donita Van Horik and Mark Christoffels

**CONTINUED ITEM (5:14 PM)**

2. 16-029PL Recommendation to accept Categorical Exemption 15-033 and deny the appeal of the Zoning Administrator's decision to approve a Local Coastal Development Permit to demolish Marine Stadium Restroom 8N, located at 5605 Boathouse Lane. (District 3) (Application No. 1503-04)

Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, introduced Ira Brown, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Fox and Ira Brown.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Fox and Amy Bodek.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, spoke.

Larry Goodhue, appellant, spoke.

Eric Lopez, Tidelands Capital Improvement Division, applicant, spoke.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

Eric Lopez responded to queries from Chair Christoffels.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Eric Lopez responded to queries from Commissioner Van Horik.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Chair Christoffels.

Mike Rivard provided public comment.

Michael Dene provided public comment.

Susan Rivard provided public comment.

Jack Irvin provided public comment.

Larry Goodhue spoke.

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

Ira Brown responded to queries from Commissioner Verduzco-Vega.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Ira Brown responded to queries from Commissioner Van Horik.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Michael Mais responded to queries from Commissioner Fox.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Ira Brown responded to a query from Commissioner Templin.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Templin, seconded by Commissioner Perez, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Ron Cruz, Alan Fox, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega, Donita Van Horik and Mark Christoffels

#### **PLANNING COMMISSION TRAINING (6:26 PM)**

(This item was postponed to a future date.)

#### **PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (6:26 PM)**

Deborah Dobias, TAPS, provided public comment.

Sharon Brown provided public comment.

Jeffrey Thompson, Alamitos Beach Parking Task Force, provided public comment.

Glenda Gabel provided public comment.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, responded to queries from Chair Christoffels.

Amy Bodek spoke.

Chair Christoffels spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to a query from Chair Christoffels.

#### **COMMENTS FROM THE PLANNING COMMISSION (6:42 PM)**

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Verduzco-Vega and Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Commissioner Perez spoke.

**ADJOURNMENT (6:47 PM)**

At 6:47 p.m., Chair Christoffels adjourned the meeting.

hge

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបវារៈ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យអ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាផ្ញើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹងចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។