

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS HP11-0132
FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS
21 Redondo Avenue
Bluff Park Historic District**

ANALYSIS:

In Compliance with Section 2.63.070 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (the Standards)*, and the Bluff Park Historic District ordinance (Ordinance No. C-5869, C-6835):

Staff has analyzed the proposed project in accordance with Chapter 2.63.070 of the Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission ordinance), the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, and the Bluff Park Historic District ordinance and found the project does not comply with these Ordinances.

The existing improvements consist of a one-story 1940 ranch style home with an attached one-car garage accessed off the alley. This ranch style home has a low-pitched composition shingle roof and light gray stucco finish with black multi-pane wood sash windows bordered by a horizontal band. A red brick fireplace is located along the south elevation of the living room. An attached one-car garage is accessed off the east/west alley. The home is classified as a contributing structure.

The request is for a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove the gray composition roof and install red clay tiles, remove the divided light wood sash windows and replace with brown vinyl windows, install Mexican pavers on the front porch and sidewalk, remove the bay window on the north bay and fill with solid stucco, install a Spanish style wood door with wrought iron cross bars over a speakeasy window, install contemporary style Spanish style exterior light fixtures in black, and restucco the home, red brick fireplace and low retaining wall at the front property line with smooth white hand trowel stucco. These changes are not consistent with the Bluff Park Historic District Ordinance, Chapter 2.63.070 of the Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission ordinance), the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*.

The proposed changes as presented are not consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation condition number 2, 3, 5, and 9. The historic character of the property has been altered with a change of the architecture from ranch to pseudo Spanish. Removal of the original wood windows, horizontal banding, composition roof, front door and the cladding of the brick fireplace and retaining wall with stucco have eliminated all the distinctive features and materials. The residence, with all new exterior materials, now appears as new construction in a neighborhood of historic homes built primarily in the 1920's. The only change that can be supported is the change from a rough stucco finish to a smooth hand trowel finish.

With the conditions of approval included in the staff report, staff believes that the project meets the requirements of Chapter 2.63.070 of the Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission ordinance) and the Bluff Park Historic District ordinance, as well as the recommendations of the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*.

FACTS FOR FINDINGS: (from Section 2.63.070(D) of the Long Beach Municipal Code)

- 1. (It) will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic feature of the concerned property or of the landmark district in which it is located, is consistent with the spirit and intent of this chapter.**

The proposed alterations, as conditioned, will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic features of the subject property or the historic district in which the property is located. The change in exterior finish material from a gray lace stucco finish to a smooth hand trowel white stucco finish will not adversely affect any significant historical features of the property. This is the only change consistent with the guidelines and recommendations of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. A change in the roof material to red clay tile, vinyl windows, stucco finish applied to the fireplace and retaining wall, and the installation of new non-compatible materials such as Mexican pavers, new contemporary light fixtures and a contemporary pseudo Spanish style door with wrought iron grill work bars is not consistent with this property or the district in which it is located. Approval of the newly introduced materials will have an adverse affect upon the historic property, on the district and the spirit and intent of this chapter, which is to maintain the significant historical features of a contributing structure.

- 2. (It) will remedy any condition determined to be immediately dangerous or unsafe by the Fire Department or the Director of Development Services.**

The existing property may be considered dangerous or unsafe, as no inspections have been made by Department of Development Services staff of the interior or exterior improvements or of the installation of the clay tile roof.

- 3. The proposed change is consistent with or not incompatible with the architectural period of the building.**

Only the proposed change to the exterior stucco finish of the residence from a heavier lace finish to smooth finish is consistent with the original design of the structure and will not compromise the integrity of the architectural period of the dwelling. The proposed changes in roofing material, vinyl windows, stucco finish over the red brick fireplace and low retaining wall in the front yard and the use of contemporary materials is not consistent with the architectural period of a 1940 era residence.

- 4. The proposed change is compatible in architectural style with existing adjacent contributing structures in a historic landmark district.**

The proposed change to the exterior finish material from a medium finish to a smooth trowel finish, as conditioned, will not adversely affect the historic district or the adjacent contributing properties since its architectural style is compatible with that of the original structure. The property to the south is a two-story 1923 Spanish Colonial Revival residence used as a monastery (3361 East Ocean Blvd.). The property to the north is a two-story home built in 1922 (27 Redondo Avenue).

- 5. The scale, massing, proportions, materials, colors, textures, fenestration, decorative features and details proposed are consistent with the period and/or are compatible with adjacent structures.**

No new square footage is proposed for this structure so the massing; scale proportions will remain the same. The materials, color and decorative features have been drastically altered in a manner that is not consistent with the period of the adjoining properties, which were both constructed, in the early 1920's. The Spanish style modern materials applied to this previously contributing structure are not compatible with adjacent structures.

- 6. The proposed change is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings by the U.S. Department of the Interior.**

The proposed changes as presented are not consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation condition number 2, 3, 5, and 9. The historic character of the property has been altered with a change of the architecture from ranch to pseudo Spanish. Removal of the original wood windows, horizontal banding, composition roof, front door and the cladding of the brick fireplace and retaining wall with stucco have eliminated all the distinctive features and materials. The residence, with all new exterior materials, now appears as new construction in a neighborhood of historic homes built primarily built in the 1920's.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

Address: 21 Redondo Avenue

Historic District: Bluff Park Historic District

Case No. HP11-0132

Date: October 10, 2011

1. This approval is to re-stucco the residence for activities shown on plans received by the Director of Development Services - Office of Historic Preservation on April 29, 2011. These plans are on file in this office, except as amended herein.
2. The project must be completed per the plans approved by the Cultural Heritage Commission, including all conditions listed herein. Any subsequent changes to the project must be approved by the Cultural Heritage Commission, the Director of Development Services staff or their designee before implementation. Upon completion of the project, a staff inspection must be requested by the Applicant to ensure that the construction has been executed according to approved plans and that all conditions have been implemented before the building permit can be released.
3. There is a ten calendar-day appeal period that will lapse at 4:30 p.m., 10 calendar days after the action by the Cultural Heritage Commission is made. Appeal of the Commission's action will not be accepted after this time. A separate fee will apply to appeal an action made by the Cultural Heritage Commission.
4. This Certificate of Appropriateness shall be in full force and effect from and after the date of the rendering of the decision by the Cultural Heritage Commission. Pursuant to the Cultural Heritage Commission Ordinance Section 2.63.070(I), this approval shall expire one year from the date of issuance if the authorized work has not commenced. Should the applicant be unable to comply with this restriction, an extension may be granted pursuant to Section 2.63.070(J) for an additional 12 months maximum. The applicant must request such an extension prior to expiration of this Certificate of Appropriateness. After that time, the applicant will be required to return to the Cultural Heritage Commission for approval. In addition, this Certificate of Appropriateness shall expire if the authorized work is suspended for a 180-day period after being commenced.
5. All required Planning and Building permits and variances shall be obtained by the applicant. Building permits and any required variances must be obtained prior to the implementation of any construction or rehabilitation work. Separate plan check and permit fees will apply.
6. Any changes to the plans approved by the Cultural Heritage Commission will require approval by the Director of Development Services or their designee before implementation. Significant changes to the project's design will require review and approval by the Cultural Heritage Commission before the Director of Development Services issues permits.

7. The Certificate of Appropriateness is valid for one (1) year from the date of issuance. It may be extended by the Director of Development Services - Office of Historic Preservation upon request by the applicant prior to the date of expiration.
8. The applicant shall remove the red clay tile roof and shall install a 30-year dimensional composition shingle roof in an appropriate color to the satisfaction of the Director of Development Services.
9. The applicant shall remove the brown vinyl windows and install recessed divided light wood sash windows painted an appropriate color to the satisfaction of the Director of Development Services.
10. The applicant shall install a wood sash window in the bay window projection along the north elevation to the satisfaction of the Director of Development Services.
11. The applicant shall remove the Spanish style front door and shall install a new six panel wood front door compatible with the ranch style home to the satisfaction of the Director of Development Services.
12. The applicant shall remove the Mexican pavers from the front porch and sidewalk leading to the front door and shall install a light gray concrete or red brick similar to the brick that was on the fireplace.
13. A plan shall be submitted to the Director of Development Services for review and approval prior to construction.
14. The applicant shall submit a landscape plan prepared in compliance with the requirements of the Bluff Park Historic Ordinance to the satisfaction of the Director of Development Services.