

CITY OF LONG BEACH  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
MINUTES

WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 19, 2014  
333 WEST OCEAN BLVD., 7TH FLOOR  
CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ROOM, 8:00 AM

Charles Hicks Jr., President  
Lawrence Keller, Vice President  
Jonathan Gotz, Commissioner  
Jeanne Karatsu, Commissioner  
Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Commissioner



Tara M. McLean, Acting Executive Director

**FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES**

**ROLL CALL**

Tara M. McLean, Acting Director & Secretary  
Melinda George, Deputy Director  
Marilyn Hall, Executive Assistant  
Christina Checél, Principal Deputy City Attorney  
Salvador Ambriz, Personnel Analyst  
Debbie McCluster, Personnel Analyst  
Lourdes Ferrer, Personnel Analyst  
Donna de Araujo, Personnel Analyst  
Ken Walker, Personnel Operations Manager, Human Resources

**Commissioners** Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu,  
**Present:** Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller

1. 14-027CS      **Recommendation to approve minutes:**  
*Regular Meeting of February 5, 2014*  
*Dismissal Hearing 32-D-1213 & 33-D-1213 Minutes of*  
*January 15, 22 & 29, 2014*  
*Dismissal Hearing 36-D-1213 Minutes of February 5, 2014*  
*Suspension Hearing 27-S-1213 Minutes of February 12, 2014*  
**A motion was made by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Vice President Keller, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**  
**Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller**

**A motion was made by Vice President Keller, seconded by Commissioner Gotz, to approve recommendation for Dismissal Appeals 32-D-1213 and 33-D-1213 hearing minutes of January 15, 22 & 29, 2014. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller**

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Karatsu, to approve recommendation for Dismissal Appeal 36-D-1213 hearing minutes of February 5, 2014. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller**

**A motion was made by Commissioner Karatsu, seconded by Commissioner Gotz, to approve recommendation for Suspension Appeal 27-S-1213 hearing minutes of February 12, 2014, as amended. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller**

**CONSENT CALENDAR (2-5):**

Passed The Consent Calendar

On behalf of the Commission, the Secretary presented a Certificate of Appreciation to Nadja Grays, Customer Service Representative, in recognition of 33 years of dedicated service to the citizens and City of Long Beach. A representative from her department was present and spoke on her behalf. Ken Walker, Manager, Personnel Operations, also spoke on her behalf. The Commission thanked Ms. Grays for her service to the City and congratulated her on her retirement.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Commissioner Gotz, to approve Consent Calendar Items. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller**

2. 14-028CS      **Recommendation to approve examination results:**  
*Department Librarian - 10 Applied, 10 Qualified*  
*Office Automation Analyst - 68 Applied, 46 Qualified*  
*Port Security System Operator - 474 Applied, 95 Qualified*  
*Public Safety Dispatcher - Lateral - 363 Applied, 4 Qualified*  
*Registered Nurse - 93 Applied, 46 Qualified*
- A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**
3. 14-029CS      **Recommendation to receive and file retirements:**  
*Dena McQuam/Clerk Typist II/Harbor (33 yrs., 6 mos.)*  
*Bennie Offill/Special Services Officer II/Police (8 yrs., 6 mos.)*
- A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**
4. 14-030CS      **Recommendation to receive and file resignations:**  
*Ron Bartyzel/Electrician/Water (2 yrs., 2 mos.)*  
*Racy Pel/Systems Support Specialist III/Technology Services (16 yrs., 10 mos.)*  
*Robert Williams/School Guard/Police (31 yrs., 7 mos.)*
- A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**
5. 14-031CS      **Recommendation to reschedule hearing:**  
*Suspension/Dismissal Appeal 01-S/D-1314, Suggested Date May 21, 2014*
- A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

**REGULAR AGENDA**

6. 14-032CS

**RECOMMENDATION TO REEVALUATE EXAMINATION  
RESULTS AND/OR ALLOW TO RETAKE EXAMINATION -**

*Survey Technician*

- a. Communication from Juan C. Arias
- b. Staff report prepared by Melinda George, Deputy Director

Mr. Arias addressed the Commission, stating that he received two e-mail notifications for the Survey Technician examination results. He requested that as a result of these conflicting examination results, that the Commission reevaluate his examination results or allow him to retake the examination.

President Hicks informed Mr. Arias that staff investigated his concerns and could find no evidence that a second e-mail was sent to him. He informed Mr. Arias that staff requested that he provide a copy of the e-mail he received, but never received it. As a result of the investigation, the Commission concurs with staff's decision that he did not pass the minimum requirements for the examination.

**A motion was made by Vice President Keller, seconded by Commissioner Gotz, to deny the request. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller**

7. 14-033CS

**COMMUNICATION REGARDING UNFAIR HIRING  
PRACTICES**

- a. Communication from Ollie J. Washington
- b. Staff report prepared by Caprice McDonald, Personnel Analyst

The Secretary informed the Commission that at its direction, staff investigated the allegations of unfair hiring practices brought forth by Ms. Washington. She stated that staff's investigation showed that there were no violations of Civil Service Rules and Regulations. Per Counsel, the Commission does not have jurisdiction on where departments assign staff within a division.

**This CS-Agenda Item was received and filed.**

8. 14-034CS

**COMMUNICATION REGARDING PROVISIONAL  
CONSTRUCTION SUPERVISOR**

*Communication from Brian Hinkle, Painter Supervisor*

Mr. Hinkle addressed the Commission regarding his concerns that the staff he supervised has been reassigned to a Provisional Construction Supervisor, who is working out of classification. President Hicks questioned counsel regarding assignments within departments being a function of departments having the ability to assign people where they feel they are needed. He questioned if the Commission had jurisdiction to dictate how departments assign staff if there is not a reduction or loss of wages. Ms. Checel informed the Commission that it does not have jurisdiction over departments assigning staff, however, the working out of classification is under its jurisdiction. Commissioner Keller requested staff work with the Harbor Department regarding the alleged provisional appointment working out of classification. President Hicks requested that staff report back within 60 days, however, Stacey Lewis, Assistant Director of Human Resources, Harbor, informed the Commission that they would be able to report back in two weeks.

**A motion was made by Vice President Keller, seconded by Commissioner Karatsu, to refer the matter to staff to investigate and report back to the Commission on March 5, 2014. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller

9. 14-035CS

**PROTEST OF WRITTEN EXAMINATION ITEM(S) -  
Customer Service Representative**

*Staff report prepared by Deborah McCluster, Personnel Analyst*

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Vice President Keller, to approve staff's recommendation of protested question. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller

10. 14-036CS

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE BULLETINS**

*Staff report prepared by Tara M. McLean, Acting Executive Director*

Civil Engineering Associate

Maintenance Assistant

Public Safety Dispatcher

The Secretary recommended that due to the large number of applications expected to be received for Maintenance Assistant, that it be pre-posted for one and one-half weeks and opened for a three-day filing period. The Commission stated that three days was not enough time and requested a two-week pre-post and five-day filing period.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Karatsu, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Vice President Keller to approve recommendation for Civil Engineering Associate and Public Safety Dispatcher bulletins. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller**

**MANAGERS' REPORT**

Melinda George, Deputy Director informed the Commission that the show rate for the Customer Service Representative examination was approximately 80% or better. She also stated that the Battalion Chief and Fire Captain examinations are moving along quickly. She informed the Commission that some staff attended a training in Irvine last week on Creating Situational Judgment Questions, which will be helpful in preparing questions for oral panels.

The Secretary informed the Commission that Civil Service will have a "Civil Service Update" once a month on the Administrative Officer's agenda. She is hoping that providing them with monthly updates will establish better communication, and that it is an opportunity for the departments to provide feedback to Civil Service as well.

President Hicks thanked the Secretary for the job she is doing, and congratulated staff on the positive feedback he is getting from departments. He thanked staff for doing an excellent job and encouraged them to keep up the good work.

**COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission's jurisdiction.**

Reggie Harrison, Deputy City Manager, thanked staff for the excellent work they do administering the Public Safety Dispatcher examination. He stated that the skill sets required for Public Safety Dispatcher are one of the most difficult in the City. He stated that the process and training is very detailed, and the ability to multi-task, provide good customer service and understand public safety protocol are all very difficult.

Commissioner Smith Watts questioned Mr. Harrison regarding if there was a pretest available for candidates where they could provide the results to Civil Service. He stated that he had met with Ms. McLean regarding the National Network Testing for Public Safety Dispatcher, but will have to investigate to make sure their test actually tests the skill sets necessary for Public Safety Dispatcher for the City.

**DISCUSSION ON RECRUITMENT AND ESTABLISHING INTERVIEW PANEL FOR  
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR**

Ken Walker, Manager, Personnel Operations, Human Resources, on behalf of Norman Roberts, briefed the Commission regarding the recruitment and establishing interview panels for the Executive Director of Civil Service. Mr. Walker stated that the announcement is posted on the City's Website and that Mr. Roberts will be sending a list of all the postings. He stated the process is as follows: 1) resumes should be submitted to Mr. Roberts by March 17, 2014. Mr. Roberts will pre-screen the resumes to a group of 8-12. 2) On April 2, 2014, a group of 8-12 pre-screened resumes and applicable documents will be given to the Commission in a package and binder, and he will brief the Commission on the process and answer any questions. He is proposing two panels. Panel 1 will be comprised of technical experts, one from each Appointing Authority, the City Attorney's Office, and possibly one or two from the safety component. Panel 2 will be the Commission. Each candidate will be interviewed by both panels on the same day. After completion of the interview process, the panels will screen to five or eight candidates. Panel 1 will debrief the Commission with their results, which the Commission will take under consideration during deliberations to determine which candidates will continue in the process. Mr. Roberts is suggesting April 23 & 24, 2014, as the dates for the interviews and deliberations. Ms. Checel informed the Commission for the panel comprised of technical experts there is no obligation to post the interviews. However, the Commission will be required to post, under the Brown Act, and it can be posted as a Closed Session under "Consideration of Appointment of a Public Employee." When both panels meet, it may also post as a closed session under the same mechanism. She informed the Commission that when they make a decision, they will have to reconvene to the regular meeting to record the decision on public record.



NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the City Clerk Department at (562) 570-6101, 72 hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung ang nakasulat na pagsasalin-wika ng adyenda at mga katitikan ng Komisyon ay hinahangad para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles mangyaring gawin ang iyong kahilingan sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Kagawaran ng Klerk ng Lunsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 pitong oras bago ang pulong ng Komisyon.

Si desea obtener la traducción lingüística escrita de la agenda y las actas de la Comisión para las personas que no hablan inglés, realice su pedido por teléfono al Departamento de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas antes de la reunión de la Comisión.

បើលោកអ្នកមិនចេះនិយាយភាសាអង់គ្លេស ហើយត្រូវការរបៀបវារៈនៃកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មាធិការ និងរបាយការណ៍នៃកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មាធិការ ជាសំណើប្រែសម្រួលលាយលក្ខណ៍អក្សរទៅជា ភាសារបស់លោកអ្នក នោះសូមស្នើសុំមកនាយកដ្ឋានសៀវភៅសាលាក្រុង តាមទូរស័ព្ទលេខ (562) 570-6101 អោយបាន 72 ម៉ោងមុនកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មាធិការត្រូវប្រារព្ធធ្វើឡើង។

CITY OF LONG BEACH  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
MINUTES

WEDNESDAY, MARCH 5, 2014  
333 WEST OCEAN BLVD., 7TH FLOOR  
CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ROOM, 8:00 AM

Charles Hicks Jr., President  
Lawrence Keller, Vice President  
Jonathan Gotz, Commissioner  
Jeanne Karatsu, Commissioner  
Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Commissioner



Tara M. McLean, Acting Executive Director

---

**FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES**

**ROLL CALL**

**OTHERS PRESENT**

Tara M. McLean, Acting Director & Secretary  
Melinda George, Deputy Director  
Marilyn Hall, Executive Assistant  
Christina Checél, Principal Deputy City Attorney  
Salvador Ambriz, Personnel Analyst  
Deborah McCluster, Personnel Analyst  
Robert Pfingshtorn, Personnel Analyst  
Lourdes Ferrer, Personnel Analyst  
Ken Walker, Personnel Operations Manager, Human Resources

**Commissioners** Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu,  
**Present:** Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller

**1. 14-037CS**

**Recommendation to approve minutes:**

*Regular Meeting of February 19, 2014*  
*Suspension Appeal 34-S-1213 hearing of February 26, 2014*

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Vice President Keller, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu,  
Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller

**A motion was made by Vice President Keller, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to approve recommendation for Suspension Appeal 34-S-1213 hearing minutes of February 26, 2014. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu,  
Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller

**CONSENT CALENDAR (2-5):**

Passed The Consent Calendar

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Karatsu, to approve Consent Calendar Items, with the exception of Item 2, amended to hold the examination results for Customer Service Representative. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu,  
Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller

2. 14-038CS

**Recommendation to approve examination results:**

*Customer Service Representative*

*Department Librarian*

*Senior Equipment Operator - Crane*

Department Librarian - 28 Applied, 7 Qualified

Senior Equipment Operator - Crane - 30 Applied, 1 Qualified

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

3. 14-039CS

**Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):**

*Hector Arevalo/Harbor Maintenance Supervisor II/Harbor (34 yrs., 5 mos.)*

*Adoracion Enierga/Clerk Typist III/Police (14 yrs., 6 mos.)*

*William Neal/Plumber/Harbor (28 yrs., 5 days)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

4. 14-040CS

**Recommendation to reschedule hearings:**

*Reduction Appeal 35-R-1213, suggested date May 14, 2014*

*Dismissal Appeal 01-D-1213, suggested date June 4, 2014*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

5. 14-041CS      **Recommendation to receive and file withdrawal of appeal:**  
*Reduction Appeal 11-R-1213*
- A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

**REGULAR AGENDA**

6. 14-042CS      **COMMUNICATION REGARDING PROVISIONAL CONSTRUCTION SUPERVISOR**
- a. Communication from Brian Hinkle, Painter Supervisor  
b. Staff report prepared by Lourdes Ferrer, Personnel Analyst
- A motion was made by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Vice President Keller, to receive and file. The motion carried by the following vote:**
- Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller**
7. 14-043CS      **RECOMMENDATION TO EXTEND ARTICLE VIII, SECTION 115(3) OF THE CIVIL SERVICE RULES AND REGULATIONS:**  
*Staff report prepared by Tara M. McLean, Acting Executive Director*
- A motion was made by Vice President Keller, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**
- Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller**
8. 14-044CS      **RECOMMENDATION FOR EXCEPTION TO CIVIL SERVICE RULES AND REGULATIONS - Article VIII, Section 115(3) -**  
*Requesting Exception to Article II, Section 7 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations - Qualifications and Requirements for Real Estate Project Coordinator - Limiting Applications to City Employees and Laid Off City Employees*  
Staff report prepared by Tara M. McLean, Acting Executive Director
- A motion was made by Commissioner Karatsu, seconded by Commissioner Gotz, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu,  
Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller

9. 14-045CS      **COMMUNICATION REGARDING BATTALION CHIEF  
EXAMINATION**

This item was pulled from the agenda.

10. 14-046CS      **PROTEST OF WRITTEN EXAMINATION ITEMS - Fire Captain**  
*Staff report prepared by Robert Pfingsthorn, Personnel Analyst*

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by  
Commissioner Karatsu, to approve recommendation. The motion  
carried by the following vote:**

Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu,  
Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller

11. 14-047CS      **RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE EXTENSION OF EXPIRING  
ELIGIBLE LISTS (6 months):**

*Staff report prepared by Tara M. McLean, Acting Executive Director*

Emergency Medical Educator

Environmental Health Specialist

Mechanical Engineer (9/11/13; 9/30/13)

Microbiologist (9/6/13; 9/30/13)

Plan Checker - Fire Prevention (9/13/13; 9/30/13)

Public Safety Dispatcher - Lateral

Special Services Officer

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Vice  
President Keller, to approve recommendation. The motion carried  
by the following vote:**

Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu,  
Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller

12. 14-048CS

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE BULLETINS:**

*Staff report prepared by Tara M. McLean, Acting Executive Director*  
Accounting Clerk  
Construction Inspector  
Real Estate Project Coordinator  
Senior Combination Building Inspector  
Surveyor

**A motion was made by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Vice President Keller, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 5 - Jonathan Gotz, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks and Lawrence Keller**

**NEW BUSINESS**

President Hicks thanked Christina Checel, Principal Deputy City Attorney for the outstanding service she has provided to the Commission as its advisor, and wished her well in her new position. Commissioner Keller, Karatsu, Gotz and Smith Watts also acknowledged Ms. Checel's outstanding service as Commission Advisor and wished her well.

Ms. Checel thanked the Commission, stating that it's been a great opportunity having worked with them.

**MANAGERS' REPORT**

Melinda George, Deputy Director informed the Commission that staff attended an orientation for Public Safety Dispatcher, on Tuesday, conducted by the Police and Fire Departments, with about 30 people in attendance. She stated that another orientation is scheduled for today, which staff will also attend. She also informed the Commission that staff will be going to Parks and Recreation to assist their Maintenance Assistant applicants with on-line application filing.

The Secretary informed the Commission that staff continues to work on the examination backlog and streamlining the process, and working with departments to find solutions to get the backlog cleared up.

**ADJOURNMENT**

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the City Clerk Department at (562) 570-6101, 72 hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung ang nakasulat na pagsasalin-wika ng adyenda at mga katitikan ng Komisyon ay hinahangad para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles mangyaring gawin ang iyong kahilingan sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Kagawaran ng Klerk ng Lunsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 pitong oras bago ang pulong ng Komisyon.

Si desea obtener la traducción lingüística escrita de la agenda y las actas de la Comisión para las personas que no hablan inglés, realice su pedido por teléfono al Departamento de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas antes de la reunión de la Comisión.

បើលោកអ្នកមិនចេះនិយាយភាសាអង់គ្លេស ហើយត្រូវការរបៀបវារៈនៃកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មាធិការ និងរបាយការណ៍នៃកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មាធិការ ជាសំណើប្រែសម្រួលលាយលក្ខណ៍អក្សរទៅជា ភាសារបស់លោកអ្នក នោះសូមស្នើសុំមកនាយកដ្ឋានសៀវភៅសាលាក្រុង តាមទូរស័ព្ទលេខ (562) 570-6101 អោយបាន 72 ម៉ោងមុនកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មាធិការត្រូវប្រារព្ធធ្វើឡើង។

CITY OF LONG BEACH  
PLANNING COMMISSION  
MINUTES

THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 20, 2014  
333 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD  
COUNCIL CHAMBER, 5:00 PM

Donita Van Horik, Chair  
Alan Fox, Vice Chair



Becky Blair, Commissioner  
Molly Campbell, Commissioner  
Mark Christoffels, Commissioner  
Phil Saumur, Commissioner  
Melani Smith, Commissioner

---

**FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES**

**CALL TO ORDER (5:05 PM)**

At 5:05 p.m., Chair Van Horik called the meeting to order.

**ROLL CALL (5:05 PM)**

**Commissioners** Alan L. Fox, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Mark  
**Present:** Christoffels

**Commissioners** Phillip Joseph Saumur, Becky Blair and Molly Campbell  
**Absent:**

Also present: Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services; Jeff Winklepleck, Acting Planning Administrator; Brant Birkeland, Planner; Heidi Eidson, Bureau Secretary.

**FLAG SALUTE (5:05 PM)**

Commissioner Fox led the flag salute.

**MINUTES (5:06 PM)**

14-011PL Recommendation to receive and file the Planning Commission minutes of February 6, 2014.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

Jeff Winklepleck, Acting Planning Administrator, spoke.



A motion was made by Commissioner Christoffels, seconded by Commissioner Smith, to approve the recommendation with changes to Item No. 2 directing staff to add language to the Conditions of Approval requiring the applicant to work with staff to come up with alternative solutions to retain the donut sign on the site and to direct the City Traffic Engineer to return with language regarding a before and after traffic study. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Yes:** 4 - Alan L. Fox, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Mark Christoffels

**Absent:** 3 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Becky Blair and Molly Campbell

**DIRECTOR'S REPORT (5:07 PM)**

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, provided the Director's Report.

**SWEARING OF WITNESSES (5:09 PM)**

Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the evidence you shall give in this Planning Commission Meeting shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth.

**REGULAR AGENDA (5:09 PM)**

1. 14-012PL Recommendation to approve a Conditional Use Permit (CUP) request to allow the sale of beer, wine and distilled spirits for on-site consumption (Type 47 License) at a proposed restaurant located at 4354 Atlantic Avenue in the Neighborhood Pedestrian (CNP) zone and accept Categorical Exemption CE 01-14. (District 8) (Application No. 1309-08)

Jeff Winklepleck, Acting Planning Administrator, introduced Brant Birkeland, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Rick Bennett, applicant, spoke.

Rick Bennett responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Christoffels and Rick Bennett.

A dialogue ensued between Chair Van Horik and Rick Bennett.

Jeff Winklepleck spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Fox and Rick Bennett.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Brant Birkeland responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Christoffels and Jeff Winklepleck.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Smith and Jeff Winklepleck.

Ken Cordova provided public comment.

Allen Fosnach provided public comment.

Joanne Bentley provided public comment.

Pamela Hardy provided public comment.

Ron Schuster provided public comment.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

Commissioner Smith spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Christoffels, seconded by Commissioner Smith, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Alan L. Fox, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Mark Christoffels

**Absent:** 3 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Becky Blair and Molly Campbell

see media

2. 14-006PL

Recommendation to receive and file an update regarding the previously approved Administrative Use Permit at 420 Grand Avenue and require that the matter be brought before the Planning Commission in three month's time to check the status and review compliance with the Conditions of Approval. (District 3) (Application No. 1212-14)

Jeff Winklepleck, Acting Planning Administrator, provided the update.

Jeff Winklepleck responded to queries from Commissioner Christoffels.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

Peter Fajardo, representing the applicant, spoke.

Peter Fajardo responded to queries from Chair Van Horik.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Smith and Amy Bodek.

Jeff Winklepleck responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Smith, seconded by Commissioner Christoffels, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Alan L. Fox, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Mark Christoffels

**Absent:** 3 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Becky Blair and Molly Campbell

**PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (5:40 PM)**

There was no public comment.

**COMMENTS FROM THE PLANNING COMMISSION (5:40 PM)**

There were no comments from the Planning Commission.

**ADJOURNMENT (5:42 PM)**

At 5:42 p.m., Chair Van Horik adjourned the meeting.

hge

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Development Services Department at (562) 570-6194 or (562) 570-5794, 72 hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung ang nakasulat na pagsasalin-wika ng adyenda at mga katitikan ng Komisyon ay hinahangad para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles mangyaring gawin ang iyong kahilingan sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Kagawaran ng Mga Serbisyong Pagpapaunlad sa (562) 570-6194, (562) 570-5794, 72 pitong oras bago ang pulong ng Komisyon.

Si desea obtener la traducción lingüística escrita de la agenda y las actas de la Comisión para las personas que no hablan inglés, realice su pedido por teléfono al Departamento de Servicios de Desarrollo al (562) 570-6194, (562) 570-5794, 72 horas antes de la reunión de la Comisión.

បើលោកអ្នកមិនចេះនិយាយភាសាអង់គ្លេស ហើយត្រូវការរបៀបវារៈនៃកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មាធិការ និងរបាយការណ៍នៃកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មាធិការ ជាសំណើប្រែសម្រួលលាយលក្ខណ៍អក្សរទៅជាភាសារបស់លោកអ្នក នោះសូមស្នើសុំមកនាយកដ្ឋានសេវាអភិវឌ្ឍន៍ តាមទូរស័ព្ទលេខ (562) 570-6194, (562) 570-5794 អោយបាន 72 ម៉ោងមុនកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មាធិការត្រូវ ប្រារព្ធធ្វើឡើង។