

EXHIBIT H
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
HP18-512
FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS
635 LOMA AVENUE

ANALYSIS:

In regards to Section 2.63.080 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (the Standards):

The subject site, 635 Loma Avenue, is located within the Belmont Heights Historic District, which was established in 2002 (C-7802). The property is improved with a 1,077-square-foot single-story home and detached 357-square-foot garage. The home's architectural style is Craftsman and was originally constructed in 1922.

In regards to Section 2.63.080 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (the Standards), staff has analyzed the proposed project and the project meets these requirements and those of the City's zoning code.

FINDINGS: (from Section 2.63.080(D) of the Long Beach Municipal Code)

- 1. (It) will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic feature of the Landmark or subject property within the Landmark District and that issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness is consistent with the spirit and intent of this chapter.**

The design incorporates the Commission's design review comments to reduce the massing and scale which are compatible with the architectural style of the building and the broader historic district.

The block context consists of primarily one-story structures with two two-story structures on the north side of the block and five two-story structures on the opposite side of the block. Zoning allows for two story structures by right, however is dependent on additional criteria outlined in the Belmont Heights Historic District Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation which takes into consideration the context in which the proposed project is located.

As designed, the proposed two-story addition and revised second floor provides an overall reduction of 151-square-feet from the previous design. To further reduce the visual impact of massing from the right of way, just under half (12'8") of the width of the second story addition as visible from the north elevation will be stepped back 48-feet from the front property line (an additional 16 feet from the previous placement of the second floor). In order to balance massing concerns with objectives for the project's usable square footage, the remaining width of the second story addition (15') as seen from the south elevation will be set back from

the front property line a distance of 30-feet (two-feet more than previous designed). In its entirety, the second floor will be placed further back than the minimum required front yard setback required by code for a distance ranging from an additional 10 to 28 feet (a 20-foot minimum front yard is required by code). The maximum height of the structure with the second-story addition remains under 25-feet, as measured from grade to the mid-point of the roof. The proposed design, with the second story setbacks and gabled roof, achieves a second story massing that is recessed to distinguish the roofline of the original structure from the addition. The pitched roof of the second story addition further incorporates a prominent architectural feature of the Craftsman style. As such, the proposed design of the second floor will achieve a reasonable transition of massing proportionate to the existing residence and neighboring properties that will create minimal visual impacts.

The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 2 addresses the historic character of a property. The proposed first and second story addition (addition) would remove and replace portions of the original roofline of the structure however preserve the primary character defining features of the front façade such as the primary ridge and centered cross gable roof over the front porch.

The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 9 addresses the new additions, exterior alterations, or new construction as they relate to historic materials. The addition will carry over compatible materials such as horizontal wood siding, wood windows, and composition shingle appropriate for the architectural style of the residence and styles typically found within the historic district.

The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 10 addresses the form and integrity of new additions or construction with relationship to the historic property. The addition would be structurally integrated into the design of the primary dwelling, but sufficiently setback and differentiated from the existing one-story historic structure. As such, the addition will preserve the form and integrity of the primary front façade of the historic building and improve the overall condition of the property.

The proposed project will meet the required floor area ratio, lot coverage, open space, yard, and height requirements applicable in the R-1-N District.

The Cultural Heritage Commission (Commission) based its decision on additional factors beyond those considered in Staff's analysis. The Commission discussed the merits of a larger one-story addition as a means to reduce the second story massing and ultimately decided that the reduced rear yard/open space associated with such a scenario would result in a less desirable project overall. Furthermore, the Commission considered the presence of existing two-story structures where the second story massing is distributed more to the front of the lot within the adjacent/greater Belmont Heights Historic District, finding that while such structures were not common to the block on which the proposed project is

located, that condition does exist in the area and is therefore compatible with the district as a whole.

2. **(It) will remedy any condition determined to be immediately dangerous or unsafe by the Fire Marshal and/or Building Official.**

There are no active code enforcement cases or dangerous conditions at this site. Thus, this finding is not applicable.

3. **(It) will comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines for Preservation, Rehabilitating, Restoring, and Reconstructing Historic Buildings.**

The proposed addition would be consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Use – The existing use is a single-family residence consisting of a one-story structure. The new addition would consist of an expansion of the existing single-family (primary) dwelling. Therefore, the addition (residential) would continue to be used as it was historically.

Character – The applicant is proposing to apply historically appropriate materials throughout the restoration of the existing home and the proposed new additions and features. Proposed changes include replacing all non-period windows and doors with historically appropriate all-wood elements; restoring tapered columns on the front porch to be more reflective of the traditional Craftsman architectural style; and replacing horizontal wood siding to match the existing cladding.

The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 2 addresses the historic character of a property. Under this standard, the removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided. The proposed addition would remove portions of the original roofline but will preserve the integrity of the primary front façade of the historic building and improve the overall condition of the property.

As designed, the proposed two-story addition and revised second floor provides an overall reduction of 151-square-feet from the previous design. To further reduce the visual impact of massing from the right of way, just under half (12'8") of the width of the second story addition as visible from the north elevation will be stepped back 48-feet from the front property line (an additional 16 feet from the previous placement of the second floor). In order to balance massing concerns with objectives for the project's usable square footage, the remaining width of the second story addition (15') as seen from the south elevation will be set back from the front property line a distance of 30-feet (two-feet more than previous designed). In its entirety, the second floor will be placed further back than the minimum

required front yard setback required by code for a distance ranging from an additional 10 to 28 feet (a 20-foot minimum front yard is required by code). The maximum height of the structure with the second-story addition remains under 25-feet, as measured from grade to the mid-point of the roof. The proposed design, with the second story setbacks and gabled roof, achieves a second story massing that is recessed to distinguish the roofline of the original structure from the addition. The pitched roof of the second story addition further incorporates a prominent architectural feature of the Craftsman style. As such, the proposed design of the second floor will achieve a reasonable transition of massing proportionate to the existing residence and neighboring properties that will create minimal visual impacts.

Changes to Historic Features – Original historic materials such as wood windows and wood siding have been replaced to more contemporary materials. The proposed improvements would remove non-period appropriate windows, doors, and siding and replace them with historically appropriate wood materials. The project retains most of the existing structures original historic features.

Historic Significance – The existing one-story primary dwelling is a contributing structure in the Belmont Heights Historic District. The addition will achieve a reasonable transition of massing proportionate to the existing residence and neighboring properties that will create minimal visual impacts and will retain the original character of the primary front façade of the historic building. The structure will remain a contributor to the district due to the retention of the character-defining features.

Distinctive Features – The proposed improvements would change the height of the existing contributing structure. The existing clipped gable roofline would be removed in order to accommodate the addition of the new second story, however the design is consistent with the City's Craftsman Style Guide which incorporates the centered cross gable roof over the front porch, carries over the clipped gables along the north and south side elevations, and uses architectural elements and materials common to the style, such as wood attic details, exposed rafters, horizontal wood siding, wood windows, wood window trim, and composition shingles.

Deteriorated Historic Features – Based on the assessment of staff, the existing front porch columns were likely modified from their original Craftsman tapered form to be simple square posts in the 1960s or 1970s. This proposal seeks to restore the front porch columns to be more historically accurate to the Craftsman architectural style. Additionally, the applicant is proposing to replace all non-historically appropriate windows and doors with all-wood, period-appropriate windows and doors.

Damage to Historic Materials – The new addition would not include chemical or physical treatments that would cause damage to historic materials. The proposed exterior finishes and materials would be consistent with this requirement.

Archeological Resources – Any archeological resources found will be protected and preserved. No resources are known. No major excavations or grading is proposed.

Historic Materials that Characterize the Property – Materials to be maintained or replaced include horizontal wood siding, and wood windows throughout the structure, which would enhance the remaining character defining features still intact on the primary residence.

As previously noted, the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 2 requires retaining and preserving historic materials or features and spaces that characterize a property. The new addition will modify the historic roofline established for the one-story primary dwelling in order to accommodate the new second story but will preserve the primary front façade.

The new second floor would feature a step back on the east elevation to differentiate the new construction from the old (existing structure). The 387-square-foot first-floor addition would be flush with the existing north and south elevations, which alone would not clearly differentiate the new structure from the old; however this concern can be treated with a vertical trim piece to create a score line which is included as a condition of approval for the project.

Form and Integrity – The new addition would be structurally integrated into the primary dwelling but preserves the primary front façade.

The proposed addition, including the new second story, has a size, scale, and profile larger than the scale of the existing residence. The massing of the 2nd story addition proposed is designed with a variable step back from the original structure to minimize the visual impacts from the street; and retains portions of the original roofline that are characteristic of the architectural style, and delineates the new structure from the old. The resulting project would be generally compatible with the context of the neighboring properties in the Belmont Heights Historic District.

4. (It) will comply with the Design Guidelines for Landmark Districts, for a property located within a Landmark District.

The latest design developed with input from a Cultural Heritage Commission Subcommittee approved by the Cultural Heritage Commission on March 11, 2019 has addressed the massing and scale and has resulted in a project that is

compatible with the spirit of the Belmont Heights Historic District Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, as the guidelines contemplate two-story additions.

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL
HP18-512
635 Loma Avenue
March 11, 2019**

1. This approval is for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the addition of 1,382-square-foot total (387-square-foot on the first story, and 995-square-foot to create a new second story) to an existing one-story, single-family residence in the Belmont Heights Historic District. The existing home is a contributing property within the Belmont Heights Historic District. (District 3)
2. The improvements to the property shall be as shown on plans received by the Department of Development Services – Planning Bureau originally submitted on March 5, 2019, inclusive of conditions approved and applied by the Cultural Heritage Commission on March 11, 2019. These plans are on file in this office, except as amended herein.
3. The project must be completed per the plans approved by the Cultural Heritage Commission, including all conditions listed herein. Any subsequent changes to the project must be approved by the Cultural Heritage Commission or by Planning Bureau staff before implementation. Upon completion of the project, a staff inspection must be requested by the Applicants to ensure that the proposed project have been executed according to approved plans and that all conditions have been implemented before occupancy hold can be released.
4. This Certificate of Appropriateness shall be in full force and effect from and after the date of the rendering of the appellate decision by the Planning Commission. Pursuant to the Cultural Heritage Commission Ordinance Section 2.63.080(I), this approval shall expire within two years, if the authorized work has not commenced. Should the Applicants be unable to comply with this restriction, an extension may be granted pursuant to Section 2.63.080(I) for an additional 12 months maximum. The Applicants must request such an extension prior to expiration of this Certificate of Appropriateness. After that time, the Applicants will be required to return to the Cultural Heritage Commission for approval. In addition, this Certificate of Appropriateness shall expire if the authorized work is suspended for a 180-day period after being commenced.
5. All required building permits shall be obtained by the Applicants, as needed. Building permits must be obtained prior to the implementation of any construction or rehabilitation work. Separate plan check and permit fees will apply.
6. Pursuant to the Cultural Heritage Commission hearing and approved conditions on March 11, 2019, the applicant shall consult a subcommittee of City staff and CHC commissioners to finalize the approved design. Design changes shall not diminish certain Craftsman style architectural elements including the visual

PLANNING COMMISSION

May 16, 2019

Page 8

dominance of rafter tails and eave overhangs and the proposed front porch columns. These changes are intended to preserve the Craftsman Bungalow style and complement the original character of the home. The applicant shall work with the Planning Bureau staff or Cultural Heritage Commission Subcommittee to develop plans for the design of the restored porch, including modification to the porch columns, and other existing architectural features.

7. Any building materials, vents, architectural details, window and door trim, used in the project, shall be constructed or restored with the same or similar material as those existing features and finished to match.
8. Any existing non-period appropriate windows shall be replaced with new wood windows or other material compatible with the period. Final selection of the new replacement windows shall be reviewed and approved by Planning Bureau staff prior to issuance of a building permit.
9. A vertical wood trim piece shall be incorporated to create a visual score line to delineate the new addition from the old. This condition shall be reflected in updated plans and elevations and submitted to Planning Bureau staff prior to the issuance of a building permit.
10. The Applicants shall obtain a separate Certificate of Appropriateness for any additional exterior changes beyond the scope of this approval.
11. Any proposed changes to the plans approved by the Cultural Heritage Commission and staff will need to be reviewed and approved by the Director of Development Services or their designee prior to implementation. Significant changes to the project's design will require review and approval by the Cultural Heritage Commission before permits are issued by the Department of Development Services.
12. A building inspection must be completed by Planning Bureau staff to verify compliance with the plans approved by Cultural Heritage Commission prior to issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy from the Building Bureau.
13. As a condition of any City approval, the Applicants shall defend, indemnify and hold harmless the City and its agents, officers and employees from any claim, action or proceeding against the City or its agents, officers or employees to attack, set aside, void or annul the approval of the City concerning the processing of the proposal/entitlement or any action relating to, or arising out of, such approval. At the discretion of the City and with the approval of the City Attorney, a deposit of funds by the Applicants may be required in an amount sufficient to cover the anticipated litigation costs.